

Turnbull, Jonathan (2017) "The Edwardians" Oral history testimony collection; how it can enhance our understanding of fathers and paternal roles in Scotland during the Late Victorian and Early Edwardian period. [Undergraduate Degree].

http://endeavour.gla.ac.uk/312/

Copyright and moral rights for this work are retained by the author(s)

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This work cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author(s)

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, institution and date must be given

Title: "The Edwardians" Oral History Testimony Collection; How it Can Enhance Our Understanding of Fathers and Paternal Roles in Scotland During the Late Victorian and Early Edwardian Period.

Student Number: 0000000

Supervisor: Jeffrey Meek

Urkund upload date: 07/02/18

Submission date of hard copies: 07/02/18

Contents

Tables and Appendices	3
Preface: Introduction, Historical literature review, Methodology	4
Introduction	4
Historical literature review.	6
Methodology	11
Chapter one - Domestic chores and child-rearing tasks: Working-class men within the Middle-Class men within the household.	
Domestic chores and child-rearing tasks	19
Working-class men within the household	21
Middle-class men within the household	26
Chapter Two - Nurture and Discipline: 'Setting them up for future life', Behaviour ar Corporal Punishment.	•
Nurture and Discipline	30
'Setting them up for future life'	31
Punishment and behaviour	36
Corporal punishment	41
Chapter Three - Fathers and leisure: Play within the home, excursions, trips and hol without children	•
Fathers and leisure	46
Play within the Home	48
Excursions, trips, and holidays	52
Male Only Leisure	55
Conclusion and Final thoughts	58
Bibliography	63
Primary Sources	63
Secondary Sources	66

Tables and Appendices

Table 1 – Incidents of middle-class corporal punishment.¹

Mother	Father	Both Parents	No Corporal Punishment
Mr Scobie	Mr Fergeson	Mr Morrison	Mrs Small
	Mr Robertson	Mrs Darroch	Mrs Laurenson

Table 2 – Incidents of Working-Class Corporal Punishment.²

Mother	Father	Both Parents	No Corporal Punishment
Mr Langford	Mr Cox	Mr Milne	Mrs Finlayson
Mrs Mackinnon	Mr Cooper		Mr Johnson
Mrs Hanna	Mrs Hay		
Mrs Scott			

¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* (UK Data Service.2009). Available From: SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018

Mrs Small P.16, Mr Laurenson P.29, Mr Morrison P.11, Mr Fergeson P.17, Mr Robertson P.11, Mr Scobie P.11 ² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Finlayson P.16, Mr Johnson P.13, Mr Milne P.7, Mr Cox P.10, Mr Cooper P.15, Mrs Hay P.14, Mrs Scott P.4, Mrs Hanna P.14, Mrs Mackinnon P.6, Mr Langford P.18

Preface: Introduction, Historical literature review, Methodology

Introduction

The motivation for a study into fathers and paternal roles came from many places. First, and most pressingly, is the relevance for examining contemporary society. Family and the private household remain major political, economic and social institutions in Britain. Because of their importance, maintaining and defining these institutions has long been a source of constant anxiety in our society. A cursory search of the *Daily Mail* website, the most visited news website worldwide, yields numerous articles voicing concern about the decline of the nuclear family unit and the struggles by fathers to fully provide for their families.³ In particular many of the headlines focus on how the completion of domestic chores has been compromised by women's participation in the workforce. The rather salacious headlines lament how women have "No time to cook, sew or have a lie-in:

Survey finds a third of busy mothers let traditional tasks like ironing their bed sheets fall by the wayside".⁴ More still worry how children of working mothers are placed at a disadvantage educationally, that their health and wellbeing may be compromised, and that their future prospects may be damaged.⁵ Articles specifically on fathers are less numerous, but where they are mentioned

_

³ Roy Greenslade, 'Mail Online goes top of the world', *The Guardian*, 25 January 2012, available from: https://www.theguardian.com/media/greenslade/2012/jan/25/dailymail-internet, last accessed 12 January 2018

⁴ Alex Ward, 'No time to cook, sew or have a lie-in: Survey finds a third of busy mothers let traditional tasks like ironing their bedsheets fall by the wayside', *Daily Mail*, 10 July 2017, Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-4680138/Survey-finds-mothers-ditch-traditional-tasks.html, last accessed 12 January 2018

⁵ Fiona Macrae 'Working mothers 'have FATTER children': Rise in obesity is blamed on women going out to work', *Daily Mail*, 27 June 2016, Available from:

http://www.dailymail.co.uk/health/article-3662309/Working-mothers-FATTER-children-Rise-obesity-blamed-women-going-work.html last accessed 12 January 2018

Steve Doughty, 'Working mothers risk damaging their child's prospects', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from:

http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-30342/Working-mothers-risk-damaging-childs-prospects.html_last accessed 12 January 2018

it is stated that, while important to families, they are finding it difficult to perform their duty as both carers for their children and the breadwinners of the household.⁶

Segregating domestic roles along gender lines is not limited to the tabloid press. A recent study by the Women Arts Media Coalition examined the top 100 domestic grossing films in 2015. They found male characters were more likely to have work-related goals than women (48% vs. 34%), whereas women were almost three times more likely to have goals related to their personal and family life (14% vs. 5%). The evidence is clear; in contemporary film men are more strongly associated with work than family life, while women are more likely to be portrayed in caring, familial roles. Of course it would be erroneous to suggest that articles from the *Daily Mail* and popular films are direct representations of contemporary family life and paternal responsibilities in Britain. However these are just two examples of how ideals in popular culture may suggest responsibilities for parenting, domestic chores, and financial provisioning for families should be divided along gender lines.

In considering the prominence of gendered roles within families and households in contemporary culture, a number of questions percolated in my mind. How has the family unit evolved over time? Has there always been an idealisation of gender roles encouraging women to take on domestic responsibilities before men and fathers? And if so, how have men and fathers responded to these

Sarah Harris, 'Children of working mothers lag behind', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-130555/Children-working-mothers-lag-behind.html last accessed 12 January 2018

⁶ Steve Doughty, 'Families need fathers, claims study', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-52993/Families-need-fathers-claims-study.html_last accessed 12 January 2018

Cheyenne Roundtree, 'Do YOU have 'dad guilt'? Nearly two-thirds of working fathers admit they are jealous of stay-at-home dads', *Daily Mail*, (23 June 2017), Available From:

http://www.dailymail.co.uk/health/article-4633556/The-rise-dad-guilt-Nearly-two-thirds-working.html last accessed 12 January 2018

⁷ Lauzen, Martha M. "The Celluloid Ceiling: Behind-the-Scenes Employment of Women on the Top 100, 250, and 500 Films of 2015," *Center for the Study of Women in Television and Film*, (San Diego State University 2016) Available From: http://womenintvfilm.sdsu.edu/files/2015_lts_a_Mans_Celluloid_World_Report.pdf last accessed 12 January 2018

pressures and changes? Answering these questions in a historical context is important not least because, as a brief look back suggests, family models and the anxieties surrounding them during the industrial revolution were often similar to those expressed today in the face of a rapidly changing economic, political, and social environment.

Historical literature review.

I initially chose the period between 1800 and the outbreak of the First World War as the period to study, with a mind to examine what place fathers occupied in family life in general. My initial survey of the historiography of fatherhood in Britain involved searching for "fatherhood", and "Victorian fatherhood" in the Glasgow University Library database. In addition I conducted a basic search in the Library's history and sociology sections by locating books on fatherhood and browsing other texts in the same sections. Preliminary reading revealed it to be a promising area for further research.

However it rapidly became apparent that ideas and practices surrounding fatherhood are fluid and it has been argued they changed in numerous ways throughout the Victorian period. Consequently it would be impractical to study the entire period and as it would risk conflating different experiences of fatherhood. Works including Leonore Davidoff and Catherine Hall's 'Family Fortunes' were useful in providing context and arguing the ways fatherhood developed earlier in the century. However I decided to focus specifically between the late Victorian period and the First World War circa 1880-1918, both because there were many promising primary sources situated around this point, and there still remain contrary views between historians surrounding the nature of fathers, domestic roles, and fatherhood during the period.

⁸ Davidoff, Leonore and Hall, Catherine *Family Fortunes* : *Men and Women of the English Middle-Class 1780–1850* (Taylor and Francis 2003)

Early research by sociologists in the 1950s and 1960s painted a very bleak and rather simplistic picture of fathers in the Victorian period, some of which simply reiterated the prejudices of commentators from the time. Working-class men in particular were demonised. Young and Willmott presented the image of the working-class father as being "mean with money, callous in sex, as often as not forcing a trial of unwanted pregnancies upon his unwilling mate. He was harsh to his children. He was violent when drunk, which was often."9 It was argued fatherhood then underwent a decisive shift during or after the Second World War, when "The image of the stern, dominating father or the absent father" disappeared. 10 As time progressed, some attempted to examine fatherhood and the place of men within the home in a manner that was less reliant on anecdotal evidence. Trevor Lummis' study into East Anglican fishermen considered men as individuals and used collections of oral histories as evidence, presenting a more nuanced image of fatherhood. His work considered how the pressures of the modern economy impacted the family, ultimately concluding that fathers were often characterised by their absence from their home, but often did not deserve their villainous reputations. 11 Overall, however, it has been noted that at this point in the historiography fathers were consigned by both the media and historians to the fringes of family life. This was partially out of negligence and also because a large amount of research into families had been focused on a feminist perspective, which understandably focused on the role of women as wives and mothers within the family. 12

_

⁹ Young and Willmott (1962) P.18 Quoted in Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father figure* Edited By Lorna McKee & Margaret O'Brien (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982) P.43

Strange, Julie-Marie. Fatherhood and the British Working-Class, 1865–1914. (New York: Cambridge University Press 2015)

¹⁰ Zweig (1962) P23, Quoted in Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father figure* Edited By Lorna McKee & Margaret O'Brien (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982) PP. 43.44

¹¹ Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father Figure* Edited By Lorna McKee & Margaret O'Brien, (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982) PP. 43, 55

¹² Abrams, Lynn 'There Was Nobody like My Daddy': Fathers, the Family and the Marginalisation of men in Modern Scotland' in *Scottish Historical Review* Vol 78, No.206 Part 2 (Edinburgh University Press 1999) p.220 Strange, Julie Marie 'Fatherhood, Providing and Attachment in late Victorian and Edwardian Working-Class Families' in *The Historical Journal* 55, 4 (Cambridge university press 2012) P. 1007

It was in the 1990s that the interest in studying fatherhood notably increased. Lynn Abrams has attributed at least part of this due to "the discovery of the involved father" in contemporary society. If notation into the involved father in contemporary society. If John Tosh's seminal studies into masculinity did much to relocate middle-class fathers in family life. He show men's public and private lives could be permeable, and fathers could appear as indulgent and intimate figures as well as breadwinners and authoritarian tyrants. He also noted that the rise of motherhood and a changing public world left many men anxious over the future of their son's masculinity and future prospects. However he also argued that, towards the end of the nineteenth century, many men became disillusioned with the domestic home and family. He dubbed this trend the 'The Flight from Domesticity'. Meanwhile, John Gillis proposed that various economic and cultural shifts diminished men's presence within the home, both physically and mentally, over the nineteenth century. Most recently, Julie-Marie Strange has examined the emotional relationships and affection between working-class fathers and their children using working-class autobiographies. She argues how working-class paternal obligations, such as financial provisioning, could be imbued with emotional significance.

There has been some research on fatherhood in Scotland specifically. Eleanor Gordon and Gwyneth Nair have used a selection of biographies to study the middle class in Glasgow, arguing the private

¹³ Abrams, Lynn, 'There Was Nobody like My Daddy' P.220

¹⁴ Strange, Julie Marie 'Fatherhood, Providing and Attachment' P.1009

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' in *Women's History Review* Vol 15, No 4, (Routledge 2006) P.554

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood: The Case of Early and Mid-Victorian England in *Gender and History* Vol 8 No 1 (1996)

Tosh, John A man's place: masculinity and the middle-class home in Victorian England (Yale university Press 2008)

¹⁵ Johansson, Thomas and Andreasson, Jesper *Fatherhood in Transition Masculinity, Identity and Everyday Life* (Palgrave Macmillan 2017)

Gillis, John R. A world of their own making: myth, ritual, and the quest for family values (Harvard University Press 1997)

¹⁶ Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief': Bereavement and the Working-Class Father c.1880-1914' in *Gender and fatherhood in the nineteenth century* Edited by Trev Lynn Broughton and Helen Rogers (Palgrave Macmillan 2007)

Strange 'Fatherhood, Providing and Attachment'

Strange, Fatherhood and the British Working-Class, 1865–1914

and public worlds that men passed between could often be porous and interconnected.

Consequently, they have argued that many middle-class fathers could be extremely informal and indulgent figures as well as professional workers. There Was Nobody like my Daddy' encompassed a variety of sources, including oral testimonies, to construct an image of working-class fatherhood opposed to the stereotypical image of the absent, drunken, selfish father. She prefaces her study, as does Strange, by highlighting the need to expand studies into fatherhood for the working-class. She has lamented how, though there have been strides into 'rehabilitating' the middle-class father within the family, working-class fathers continue to remain absent in family life through work, wilful neglect, and a preference of male leisure over spending time at home.

Furthermore, when fathers do appear, they are often inferred as a negative influence within the home. Much like contemporary fathers, Abrams writes how much of our understanding of working-class fatherhood has been dogged by continued stereotypes and negative connotations.

Our understanding of fatherhood has been expanded greatly in the last twenty years or so. However there still remain serious questions within the historiography of fatherhood during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. How far did economic and cultural changes affect fathers' roles and presence within the home? How did fathers' roles as carers, nurturers, spiritual and moral educators, and disciplinarians change during the period? In addition there remains a need to consider how far discourses on masculinity affected relationships between fathers and their children. Did fears of undermining their sons' masculinity lead fathers to distance themselves? If so can we see a marked difference in the way fathers acted around their sons and daughters? And to what extent were middle-class and working-class men drawn out of the home by male only areas of leisure? Throughout all of these areas, there is also the need to consider how these cultural and

¹⁷ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.554

¹⁸ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.242

¹⁹ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.220

economic changes were received by the working and middle classes and how similar or dissimilar their experiences of fatherhood were during the period. For any aspect of fathers in the Victorian era it is clear that there was a diversity of both images and ideals that each individual father interpreted in their own way. As such, any image or representation of fathers must be open to nuance. But we can try to explore the general trends of paternal roles and see what changes occurred to them during this period.

This study will be separated into three chapters. Each chapter will focus on a different area of paternal responsibility and compare the roles of Scottish fathers between the working class and middle class. In each instance the chapter will be preceded by a brief review of the existing historical literature to provide context for the arguments that follow. Chapter one will focus on one of the most integral parts of fatherhood that rose throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth century; the breadwinner ideal and its gendered dichotomy of paid employment and domestic responsibilities. Examining fathers' physical presence within the home is useful as it not only explores a long running issue within the historiography of fatherhood, but also allows us to consider how fathers interacted with the family unit as marital partners as well as fathers. This is essential as it is impossible to consider fathers and their roles without examining how the attitudes, responsibilities, and prestige of motherhood shifted in the decades leading up to the end of the century. The second chapter will examine changes in fathers' responsibility for children's spiritual and moral education, the responsibility for 'setting children up for future life', and the use of corporal punishment. Tied to these are the issues of fathers' authority, their status as protector of the family, and the extent to which men based their masculinity on their role as fathers. The final chapter will focus on fathers within the context of leisure and play, and whether homo-social worlds of male leisure did indeed drastically reduce the amount of time fathers spent with their families.

Methodology

My initial survey of primary sources relevant to fathers and fatherhood included dairies and oral testimonies, as they can offer a uniquely intimate and comprehensive account of family lives in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. For a study into fathers and family life these personal sources are invaluable for their insight, both as accounts of major moments in life, as well as detailing day to day activities, interactions, and routines. By comparison, official sources can sometimes present a pessimistic picture of family life. Many such sources, such as court and poor law records, often only recorded when family life had deteriorated. Furthermore they were often written by literate middle-class professionals, meaning working-class families and life could be judged according to middle-class values and behaviour.²⁰

The use of personal accounts (and working-class accounts in particular) has progressed dramatically in recent decades. Work by historians including Anna Clark has helped prove the potential of working-class diaries and how to avoid or exploit their limitations and 'silences'. When searching through collections including John Burnett's *Destiny Obscure*, William Matthews' *Annotated Bibliography of British Autobiographies*, and oral history testimonies available from the Scottish Women's Oral History Project, it became clear that there is ample evidence which would be well suited for examining the family lives of those who lived in Scotland during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century.²² However after reviewing the existing literature and noting the need to

²⁰ Humphries, Jane *Childhood and child labour in the British Industrial Revolution* (Cambridge University Press, 2010.) PP.15-19

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.48

²¹ Humphries, Jane *Childhood and child labour* PP.15-18,

²² Destiny obscure: autobiographies of childhood, education and family from the 1820s to the 1920s Editor Burnett, John (Routledge 2013)

Matthews, William British Autobiographies: An Annotated Bibliography of British Autobiographies Published Or Written Before 1951 (University of California Press, 1984)

Brown, Callum, Barr, Wendy, Hertwig, Christine, Stephenson, Jayne, Conna, Karen, Little, Sharon, Thomson,

study fathers from a class and gender perspective, Paul Thompson and Trevor Lummis' collection of oral histories 'Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973', also known as the 'The Edwardians', seemed the most appropriate.²³

When Thompson and Lummis were conducting 'The Edwardians' oral history project, the aim was to collect as much information as possible on social life and change during the late nineteenth and twentieth century (particularly from working-class viewpoint) while there were still people living able to give testimony. It was the first large-scale oral testimony project of its kind, but it appears it has not yet been utilised for a study specifically into fathers and paternal roles. ²⁴ This is surprising as many of the main interview topics, including: domestic routines, the roles of husbands and children, meals, the upbringing of children, emotional relationships, values, leisure, and religion, provide a wealth of information on the role of fathers and their relationships within the family. ²⁵ Furthermore, what makes these histories remarkably useful for this study is the interviewees were selected to form a geographic and gendered cross section of Britain. In addition, detailed notes were taken on the employment and material conditions of the interviewees and their families, allowing the oral histories to be sorted by class. ²⁶ As such they are well suited for studying the different experiences of fathers between gender and class in Scotland.

Flora, Craik, June, Morgan-Klein, Philip, Turner, Anne, Carruthers, Betty, Shepherd, Katrina, 'Scottish Women's Oral History Project' Available From:

http://atom.lib.strath.ac.uk/publication-about-scottish-womens-oral-history-project Last accessed 07/01/2018 ²³ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' Collection Available From

https://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/catalogue?sn=2000 Last accessed 03/01/2018

²⁴ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' A list of Publications based on 'The Edwardians' Available From:

https://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/catalogue/?sn=2000&type=Data%20catalogue Last Accessed 07/01/2018 ²⁵ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide P.9 Available From:

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018 Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' Abstract Available From:

https://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/catalogue/?sn=2000&type=Data%20catalogue Last accessed 04/01/2018 ²⁶ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide P.3 Available From:

The testimonies, recorded in the late 1960s and early 1970s, were collected from individuals born during the late Victorian period. The participants were chosen through a range of means, including social workers, old people's homes, personal contact, and advertisement.²⁷ The interviews were conducted by numerous part-time interviewers. They were given a detailed interview schedule so that the responses could be compared and to ensure the stories collected were as complete as possible. However the interviewers were also instructed to keep the interview 'open' to allow the interviewee to respond in their own terms as much as possible.²⁸ This ability to make direct comparisons between interviewees' responses to identical questions, along with the interviewees being grouped by gender and social class, is a great advantage for studying the different experiences of family life. An important point to note is that by using these sources, this study is one from the perspective of sons and daughters talking about their fathers and childhoods. In some respects this has limited the ways in which this study can examine fatherhood, for example studying fathers' unspoken opinions of their children, the emotions they privately expressed, and the ways they personally attached meaning to their actions such as working to provide for the family. However, as concluded in the historical literature review, there are still many other questions surrounding the roles of fathers. Due to the intimate look into family life and relationships provided by the 'The Edwardians' transcripts they are well suited to helping further the research into these areas.

When using oral histories it is important to recognise they are a unique type of historical source.

Lynn Abrams has been at the forefront of exploring the theory of using oral histories and detailing how one should approach them. Some of the most practical and obvious components of oral history include orality, narrative, and performance.²⁹ Sadly I have only been able to access and examine the

_

²⁷ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide P.1 Available From:

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

²⁸ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide P.3 Available From:

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

²⁹ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* (Taylor and Francis 2016) P.36

written transcripts of 'The Edwardians' interviews, limiting the opportunity to explore the 'Performance' of the interviewees. However the transcripts of the interviews contain a large amount of detail including pauses, stalls, and repetitions, therefore it is possible to examine the flow of the interviewee's responses to an extent.³⁰

All oral histories involve a 'narrative' of some fashion, as when an interviewee recounts their story it will be arranged and dramatised.³¹ Because 'The Edwardians' was one of the first large scale social history projects of its kind in Britain, the theory and method behind its collection can sometimes be seen as rudimentary. As noted, interviewers were instructed to keep the interview as open as possible, to encourage the interviewees to direct the interview and provide extra information as they wish.³² However as Lynn Abrams has stated sometimes the interviews seem more akin to an interrogation or questionnaire, eliciting short, non-narrative answers.³³ In these cases the narrative became constructed by the interviewer rather than the interviewee.³⁴ Fortunately, however, not all of the interviews were conducted in such a manner. Consequently, by examining the interviews in which interviewees provide fuller and more flowing narratives we can exploit 'The Edwardians' for both qualitative as well as quantitative data on fathers, whilst taking note where some of the interviews are limited in their structure and responses.

The narrative an interviewee presents can be affected in a number of ways. Our life story is how we communicate our sense of 'self' (our identity) to others. Our 'self' is continuously redefined and revised, and our life story can change depending on who we are interacting with and how we wish to

-

³⁰ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.35, 36

³¹ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.135

³² Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide pp.32 Available From: http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

³³ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.136

³⁴ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.136

be perceived.³⁵ Important events are included both as milestones and because they are important to our understanding of our own lives. We link these events together, often with a sense of causality, to form a coherent life story.³⁶ This leads into concepts of subjectivity, composure, intersubjectivity, and memory. Through the process of 'composure,' an interviewee constructs a stable and composed sense of 'self' by revising and telling their life story and aligning their life story with publicly available discourses to make them recognisable and relatable.³⁷ The choice of how to present the 'self' can depend on whom the speaker is talking to, interviewees will talk to interviewers in formats that they think they will relate to and understand.³⁸ By the ways the interviewer interacts with the interviewee they can solicit different narratives. Consequently the interview becomes a three way creation between the interviewee, the interviewer and culture.³⁹ Partially as a result of incorporating public discourses, men have been noted more likely to organise their life stories around work and material markers whereas women from the nineteenth century are more likely to recall their lives in relation to their relationships with other people.⁴⁰ It has also been said that some of older generations may be more private when recounting past experiences, willing to offer facts but less emotions and feelings. 41 All of these are pertinent concepts when using oral testimonies to study relationships and memories of fathers and families.

The self is also at least partially constructed by the act of remembering. 42 "In presenting a sense of self, a life story can contain silences, absences or even factual inaccuracies". 43 Again, it has been noted there are gender differences in recollections. Women's recollection of domestic life appears more detailed than that of men's. This could be due to men's preoccupation with work, or possibly

_

³⁵ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.56, 57, 74

³⁶ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.60, 63

³⁷ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.60,61,74

³⁸ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.63,64

³⁹Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.75

⁴⁰ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.61

⁴¹ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.70

⁴² Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* PP.63,101,103

⁴³ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.65

because gender-role stereotypes stating the home was 'a woman's place' left men feeling they did not have the authority to talk about the home. ⁴⁴ There is also the issue of collective memory. An individual's memory always exists within a collective conscious of an event or experience, at a family, community or national level. ⁴⁵ Together individual memory and collective memory coexist and impact on one another. ⁴⁶ In some cases forgotten memories are signified by gaps and silences (consciously or unconsciously). This, and an inability to translate memories into a coherent narrative, (most commonly by evasion) are signs an interviewee does not wish to discuss a particular topic. In these cases, although we cannot know the exact reason, we can hazard a guess as to why. ⁴⁷ The best interviewers can do is create an environment in which interviewees can call up memories comfortably and provide cues to help with their recollection. ⁴⁸

Possessing only the written transcripts can make it hard to comment on the nature of the interview itself. However, judging from the interview notes, it is apparent that all those involved with 'The Edwardians' were aware of the need to make interviewees as comfortable as possible. ⁴⁹ As with the issues of narrative, 'The Edwardians' occasionally conducted itself according to theories of oral history that have since been surpassed or revised. The project stated that "an interview is not a conversation; you should keep yourself as far as possible in the background, nodding silently so that your encouragement is not recorded, not thrusting in comments or stories of your own". ⁵⁰ Though the advice is practical, it is now recognised that interviewers have an important impact on the interviewee's narrative, sense of self, and memory. The idea of composure and collective memory is particularly concerning for this study. Representations and stereotypes of Victorian fatherhood from

_

⁴⁴ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.117

⁴⁵ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.123

⁴⁶ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.132

⁴⁷ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.133

⁴⁸ Abrams, Lynn *Oral History Theory* P.133

⁴⁹ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide PP.32,33, Available From:

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

⁵⁰ Paul Thompson's 'The Edwardians' User Guide PP.32,33, Available From:

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

official sources, in media, and in public discourse were prominent throughout the era. Consequently memories of fathers that ran contrary to these ideals may have become distorted and interviewee's narratives could have been structured around the ideals of fathers, manliness, and family put forward at the time. Conversely it may be that speaking over half a century on, when the expected roles of fathers had changed significantly, interviewees that had positive feelings towards their fathers may have revised their narrative to affix them with qualities and attributes associated with modern fathers so that younger interviewers would also recognise them as 'good' fathers. ⁵¹ By continuously considering the theory of oral history, and considering how and why interviewee's responses may potentially have been altered, we can look at their narratives as a whole and try to come to substantiated conclusions.

To select the interviews I opted for a cross section between gender and class to best examine the questions prominent in the historical literature. The UK data service holds 461 transcripts of 'The Edwardians' collection online. These have been sorted by the project into various categories, including region, employment, and class. First I refined the collection by region, yielding 47 transcripts from Scotland. My initial approach had planned to take a cross section of 20 transcripts, 5 randomly selected from each category: middle-class men, middle-class women, working-class men, and working-class women. However, of the middle-class oral testimonies only 3 were from women. As such, regrettably, the sample of transcripts is slightly imbalanced, with 5 from middle-class men, 5 from working-class men, 5 from working-class women, but only 3 from middle-class women. Though not ideal, the sample still contains 18 oral history transcripts, and so should be large enough to make comments on fathers in Scotland in the late Victorian and early Edwardian period. ⁵² By taking a cross section that utilises numerous oral history transcripts this study will combine both

__

⁵¹ Abrams, Lynn "There was no-one like my daddy': Fathers, the Family and the Marginalisation of men in Modern Scotland' in *Scottish Historical Review* Vol 78, No.206 Part 2 (Edinburgh University Press 1999) p.220 Strange, Julie Marie 'Fatherhood, Providing and Attachment in late Victorian and Edwardian Working-Class Families' in *The Historical Journal* 55, 4 (Cambridge university press 2012) P. 1007

⁵² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* (UK Data Service.2009). Available From:

SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018

quantitative and qualitative approaches. The quantitative approach will compare groups of transcripts to see if there are similarities or differences within and between the groups of class and gender. The qualitative approach will examine what can be gleamed from individual narratives and the more comprehensive answers given by the interviewees.⁵³

-

⁵³ Humphries, Jane *Childhood and child labour* PP.20

<u>Chapter one - Domestic chores and child-rearing tasks: Working-class</u>

men within the household, Middle-Class men within the household.

Domestic chores and child-rearing tasks

There are substantiated arguments from scholars of the family, including John Gillis, John Tosh,

Davidoff et al., Lynn Abrams, Trevor Lummis, and Gordon and Nair, that during the nineteenth

century patterns of family life were forced to change. There is also, however, contention as to how

dramatic these changes were.54

One of the most important of these changes was the transfer of work and production from the home

to other areas. John Gillis states that before the mid-nineteenth century a man's vocation was not to

interfere with his paternal responsibilities. When work was centred on the household the rhythms of

life were set by household tasks; families ate, prayed, and slept together. 55 But as the nineteenth

century progressed both working and middle-class fathers were drawn out of the home as the office

and factory replaced the household as the point of production.⁵⁶ Consequently fathers were

⁵⁴ Gillis A world of their own making P.187

Tosh, John A man's place P.197

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.48

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story: Blood, Contract and

Intimacy 1830-1960 (Longman, 1999) P.151

Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief": P.146

Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' PP.235, 239

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.552

Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP. 46

⁵⁵ Gillis A world of their own making PP.181-183

⁵⁶ Gillis A world of their own making P.187

Tosh, John A man's place P.197

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.48

removed from the home for a majority of their time while they worked.⁵⁷ According to Gillis this, along the cultural changes that occurred, "effectively terminated the old notion of domesticated fatherhood". It meant fathers were no longer at centre of family life, instead hanging on the periphery, becoming 'strangers in their own home".⁵⁸

At the same time fathers were physically withdrawn from the home, cultural changes promoted gendered divisions of labour, the doctrine of separate spheres, the rise of motherhood, and the male breadwinner ideology. ⁵⁹ Davidoff *et al.* argue how despite the ideal never being universally adhered to fathers became judged on their financial contributions, not their presence as carers and helpers. ⁶⁰ Abrams too notes how personal accounts excluded fathers from day to day family routines, their special status conferred to them by their role as breadwinners outside the home. ⁶¹ These ideals were also internalised within official discourses throughout the nineteenth century. Abrams writes how Religious leaders, local authority officials, child savers, social workers and an array of social commentators concurred that fathers were not nurturers, but primarily providers. ⁶² When charities and kirk sessions pursued absent fathers it was only to force them to financially support their children. And when fathers were left widowers, public and official sources pressured them to give up their children so they could receive the necessary 'mothering'. ⁶³

Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' PP.235, 239

⁵⁷ Gillis A world of their own making P.187

Tosh, John A man's place P.197

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.48

⁵⁸ Gillis *A world of their own making* PP.181,187, 188, 190

⁵⁹ Gillis A world of their own making PP.187, 188, 190

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story P.151

⁶⁰ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.151

⁶¹ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.223

⁶² Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.221

⁶³ Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief": P.146

However it has also been argued that the gendered division of domestic responsibilities and the extent to which fathers were drawn out of the household has been overstated. For the working-class the breadwinner ideal was only accessible to a minority before the First World War. As a result, although the angel in the house ideology was prevalent, it was not always a reality. ⁶⁴ Lynn Abrams has also argued that the characterisation of working-class fathers as hard workers and hard drinkers, perpetuated by official and popular discourses on fatherhood, has ignored the fact that many men were comfortable within their families. Both Abrams' and Trevor Lummis' studies of oral histories have found many fathers helped with domestic chores and only a minority refused to help on principle.⁶⁵ Furthermore, when their wife was ill or heavily pregnant, fathers routinely had to step in and relieve them of their workload.⁶⁶ Although mothers were undeniably responsible for the day-today welfare of children in the overwhelming majority of cases, many fathers were seen to be taking whatever opportunities they had to spend time with children. This included activities like bathing their children and putting them to bed at night, which was often the only time they could spend with their children on weekdays. 67 In the case of widowed fathers, when they were forced to give up their children they would still often visit, taking pleasure in their children's company and proving that they had more than economic ties.⁶⁸

Working-class men within the household

-

⁶⁴ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.552

⁶⁵ Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP. 46

Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.230

⁶⁶ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.231

⁶⁷ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.232

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.150

⁶⁸ Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief P.146

Several of the working-class transcripts within the sample detail that fathers were fully removed from the family and the epicentre of family life, supporting John Gillis' arguments. ⁶⁹ When asked whether their fathers helped with domestic chores, half of the working-class interviewees responded that they did not. After Mrs Hanna's mother died only a few months after giving birth to her, her father's aunt came to live with the family and "kept house for him". ⁷⁰ Around five years later her father remarried, at which point her great-aunt moved out and Hanna's new stepmother undertook all of the domestic chores. ⁷¹ To her recollection "He didn't even clean his own shoes." When her stepmother was taken ill it was an aunt living locally who came to care for them. ⁷² Mrs Hanna's recollection of her father abstaining from almost all domestic chores matches the official and public discourses of the separate spheres ideal as well as the argument that widowed fathers, by choice or lack of means, were unable to maintain a family without a female presence within the household. Mr Cox's father is also documented as abstaining from domestic tasks; however it appears that Mr Cox recalled his father more fondly than Mrs Hanna and his father did not fully disassociate himself from the domestic home. When asked if his father ever looked after his children Mr Cox responded:

Oh he'd no need to, we all look after ourself. We had to. It was necessary. He had to - he looked for you at - well at suppertime or teatime you can call it give us a bit of a hand up there in the house, ken.⁷³

Mr Cox's stance that "it was necessary" infers that he believed his father had no choice in abstaining from domestic chores. The testimony of Mrs Scott also detailed gendered divisions of domestic

⁶⁹ Gillis A world of their own making PP.187, 188, 190

⁷⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hanna, PP.2,4

⁷¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hanna PP.4,5

⁷² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hanna PP.4,5,23

⁷³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cox P.7

labour: "I don't think the men did these things they days though. They didn't". Though she noted her father's absence from the home was also because of his crippling gambling addiction.⁷⁴

However the remaining majority of the transcripts appear to support the arguments of Lynn Abrams and Trevor Lummis that working-class fathers were often more active with domestic chores than public and popular opinions have suggested. 75 Interestingly, the two other transcripts that initially deny that their fathers helped within the home also contain evidence to the contrary. Mr Johnson, born in 1888 and raised on the island of Barra in the Outer Hebrides, when asked whether his father helped with domestic work around the house he responded "No,no, that was – beneath their dignity". 76 This division in roles he recalls was instilled from childhood onwards: "boys didn't, no, that was left - all left to the women. Yes". 77 However when asked if men on the island would help if a woman was ill he responded "Oh yes, yes, oh well - that's - necessity as - as you might say, and some of them could bake and some of them could - do lots of things. And of course they had to do it under these conditions". The fact that many men were proficient at cooking and other domestic chores suggests that even if most men on the island were reluctant to help, the gendered division of labour was not as strict as the ideal of separate spheres states. Mrs Mackinnon's narrative is somewhat similar. When asked if her father helped in the house she initially denied it. This is partially explainable by her father's employment. Working as a fisherman during the summertime and migrating in the winter to work in the Glasgow gasworks physically drew him out of the home for many months at a time.⁷⁹ However Mrs Mackinnon later states when her mother and elder sister were ill her father "nearly went off his head with the want of sleep" while nursing both of them.80

⁷⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Scott P.8

⁷⁵ Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP. 46 Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.230

⁷⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Johnson PP.1, 14

⁷⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Mr Johnson P.3

⁷⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Mackinnon P.4

⁷⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Mackinnon P.3

⁸⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Mackinnon P.3

Additionally when asked if he helped look after the children he responded "Oh yes, he would, yes. Yes. But he was usually away from home you see". 1 It is perhaps significant that Mrs Mackinnon and Mr Johnston compare modern day expectations of men within the household to those of the past. They both express that "men, they help a lot in the house nowadays" or "men, they didn't do that until recently". 2 As Lynn Abrams has noted "personal narratives are produced out of the relationship between discourse and subjectivity, thus memories of fathers are invariably formed by ... official and public discourses". 3 It is possible that Mrs Mackinnon and Mr Johnson to an extent internalised the official and public separation of fathers from the home and so downplayed their fathers' actions within their own narratives.

The other five interviewees each stated their fathers would help within the home, though to varying degrees. Mr Cooper described his father as 'pretty handy', noting that he was a good cook, helped with the dishes, and decorated the house. ⁸⁴ Others would state how their father helped less, but would complete domestic chores when not at work. Mr Milne noted his father would clean the grate or scrub the floors when off work, although he clarified his father "very seldom" helped within the house. ⁸⁵ However the confidence with which Milne attests to his father's culinary skill might suggest his father, who was employed as a baker and confectioner, also cooked for the family on a number of occasions. ⁸⁶ Milne stated: "oh yes. He was a good chef, don't worry yourself. Oh yes. Yes." Additionally, it can be seen Milne's father tried to reduce his wife's burdens by instructing the children to help with some of the domestic chores and brought her tea in bed on his way out to

-

⁸¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Mackinnon P.3

⁸² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Mackinnon P.3

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Johnston P.4

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Scott P.8

⁸³ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' PP.230

⁸⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Cooper P.8

⁸⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne P6

⁸⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne P7

work (assumedly lighting a fire to do so).⁸⁷ The testimony of Mr Langford also states his father helped when he could. Due to working in a pub his father spent a lot of time out of the house, leaving before the rest of the family rose in the morning and returning late at night.⁸⁸ However he did help when able by dressing the children, bathing them, and washing up the dishes – especially on Sundays when he had the day off.⁸⁹ This corroborates Lynn Abrams' assessment that although fathers were often removed from their home for large periods of time, they would attempt to help with domestic tasks when they were able.⁹⁰ Others, including Mrs Hay and Mrs Finlayson, noted how fathers could be reluctant to engage in domestic tasks, but would do so on occasion or if necessary, such as looking after the children when the mother was out:

I think most men would do that in those days you see, if they had to do it. But usually - it was the housewife who saw to all these things. The men of course - were always outside or - working. ⁹¹

Throughout all of these histories there is a clear impact of working-class fathers' work removing them from their home and limiting the extent to which they could help with domestic chores, much like John Gillis has suggested. 92 Overall, however, the sample shows only a slim minority of working-class fathers refused to help with domestic tasks on principle. At the other end of the scale, although mothers shouldered the primary responsibility of childcare, a minority of cases show fathers would readily help whenever they were able. The majority of working-class fathers fell somewhere in between, leaving the responsibility of childcare and domestic chores to their partners but willing to help when needed, despite the demands of their employment. Thus it would appear the evidence

⁸⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Milne P.10

⁸⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Langford P.9

⁸⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Langford P.10

⁹⁰ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.232

⁹¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Finlayson P.9

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hay P.4

^{92 92} Gillis A world of their own making P.187

more closely supports the arguments of Trevor Lummis and Lynn Abrams, in that while fathers were primarily associated with paid employment as Davidoff *et al.* and Gillis suggest, it was only a minority of fathers who were fully drawn outside of the home and completely divested themselves of any domestic responsibility.⁹³

Middle-class men within the household

An important distinction Gillis makes when claiming fathers were removed from home is that the changes in working practices and the breadwinner wage affected middle-class men much more than working-class men.⁹⁴ The middle-class transcripts support this and show the breadwinner model of the family and ideology of separate spheres separated middle-class men from the home and domestic tasks more than the working-class men within the sample. Of the eight middle-class histories only one detailed a father helping across a range of childcare and domestic chores. Mrs Laurenson's father worked as a deep sea fisherman and was away for several months at a time, but when an accident left him unable to work he instead helped out at home.⁹⁵ Mrs Laurenson states not only how he helped but also how he was extremely proficient at domestic tasks. "He - all the sailors can wash clothes better than any woman. They learn them that you know. When they go to sea maybe for - in his time they would be nine months at sea".⁹⁶ In addition he seems to have had a close relationship with his children. Mrs Laurenson explained how if her father was downstairs making a kishie [a woven basket] she would not go to bed until he placed her in the finished kishie and rocked her whilst singing, after which he would see her off to bed.⁹⁷ Touching as this story is

__

⁹³ Gillis A world of their own making P.187

Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP. 46

Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.230

⁹⁴ Gillis A world of their own making P.190

⁹⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Laurenson PP.2,3, 13

⁹⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Laurenson P.13

⁹⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Moar P.4

however, the level to which Mrs Laurenson's father was involved within the home seems to be anomalous. Four other histories detail fathers helping in some way, however not to the same extent.

Mr Morrison, when asked if his father helped with the children he responded:

Well - no, I can't remember that, it probably happened but - I can't remember that was ever done on any scale, it would be the womenfolk would be - my mother probably - and having help, yes, yes.⁹⁸

Similar to Mrs Mackinnon and Mr Johnson, we can again see the memories and recall of the interviewee being influenced by public discourse as Lynn Abrams has suggested. In this instance Mr Morrison's narrative appears to be heavily influenced by ideologies of gender roles promoted in public discourses. But his personal experiences indicate that his father at least occasionally dressed, bathed or put him to bed. In addition he also states his father was involved within the home by decorating and doing repairs. ⁹⁹ However he then states that, although his father helped with some tasks, the majority of the time it was the maid's responsibility to watch the children. The fathers of William Scobie and Mr Moar were also noted as occasionally helping bathe and dress their children. In addition these men, along with Mrs Darroch's father, watched over their children if their mother was out. ¹⁰⁰ However like with Mr Morrison, although Mrs Darroch recounts how her father occasionally watched her when she was small, most of the child care and chores were done by employed servants, her mother, or a family friend who lived with them. ¹⁰¹

The remaining three histories, almost half of the middle-class histories, describe middle-class fathers abstaining from any domestic roles within the home. Mrs Small, Mr Ferguson and Mr Robertson

⁹⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Morrison P.9

⁹⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Morrison P.12

¹⁰⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Darroch PP.12-15

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Morrison P.9

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Scobie P.6

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Moar P.4

¹⁰¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Darroch PP. 3,4,5,11,13,15

describe their fathers forgoing domestic tasks due to their employment and being removed from the home by long working hours. Mrs Small clearly articulates her father's prime responsibility being that of a breadwinner. When asked if her father helped in the house she responded "No. No. He was an excellent provider but left mother - to attend to - almost everything". 102 His contribution to the home was providing for the family, in which he was successful enough they could hire a maid to help Mrs Small's mother with the heavier cleaning tasks. 103 Mr Ferguson's mother however completed all of the domestic chores and watched the children by herself, though his father did occasionally help with decorating or repairing the house. 104 Mr Robertson's father, the manager of a linen mill, was able to employ three maids, a gardener and a nurse. 105 As such, neither he nor his wife needed to involve themselves with domestic chores or tending to the children. Instead the children became the Nanny/Nurse's responsibility, who would bring Mr Robertson and his siblings to their parents for a set period once a day in the drawing room. 106 Throughout these three transcripts we can clearly see the fathers being judged by their ability as earners, not their presence as carers or helpers, much as Davidoff *et al.* argue was common. 107

There were men within both the working and middle-classes who removed themselves completely from any domestic tasks. However it would appear that the greater prevalence of the breadwinner wage combined with many middle-class families having enough disposable income to hire maids and nannies allowed the Scottish middle-classes to orient themselves closer to the ideal of separate spheres. More middle-class fathers delegated domestic chores to their wives, servants, and children, and to a greater degree than their working-class counterparts. This evidence corroborates the arguments that by the turn of the century the majority of middle-class men had become separated

-

¹⁰² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small P.7

¹⁰³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small P.4

¹⁰⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Ferguson PP.6,7

¹⁰⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Robertson, PP.2,3

¹⁰⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Robertson PP.3,4,5,6

¹⁰⁷ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.151

from their homes and domestic tasks by their employment.¹⁰⁸ By contrast, and in opposition to popular stereotypes and official discourses, it appears the majority of Scottish working-class men continued to have an active role within the domestic home.¹⁰⁹

_

 $^{^{108}}$ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.151 Gillis *A world of their own making* P.187

¹⁰⁹ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' PP.231,232

Chapter Two - Nurture and Discipline: 'Setting them up for future life',

Behaviour and discipline, Corporal Punishment.

Nurture and Discipline

There is a general consensus that several factors worked to undermine fathers' roles as nurturers

within the family by the end of the nineteenth century. Gillis, Tosh, and Davidoff et al. have argued

that shifts in religious practices and the increasing secularisation of Britain removed traditions that

reinforced fathers' authority as head of the household. 110 Tosh and Gillis both also argue that the

increasing emphasis on the ideal of separate spheres lead many men to distance themselves from

the domestic sphere and their families for fear of being perceived as 'unmanly' and weak. 111 Gillis

has also argued that fathers were further pushed to the periphery of child nurture by changes in

medical discourses, the hospitalisation of birth, and the structure of governments and society

moving away from hierarchies of paternal figures. 112 Finally there is almost unanimous agreement

between Gordon and Nair, Tosh, Gillis, and Davidoff et al. that the rising emphasis on motherhood,

coupled with the perception that men's association with the competitive and immoral public world

left them 'tainted', lead popular opinion to believe mothers were seen as better suited to ensuring

children's moral development. 113

¹¹⁰ Gillis A world of their own making PP.182, 186

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.52

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story P.141

¹¹¹ Gillis A world of their own making P.194

Tosh, John A man's place P.174

¹¹² Gillis A world of their own making P.187-190

¹¹³ Gillis A world of their own making P.190

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.552

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story PP.141, 142

However there is disagreement over how far these shifts removed fathers from their roles as nurturers and disciplinarians. Gillis has argued these shifts were so overwhelming they pushed fathers to the periphery of family life to become "strangers in their own home". He al., Gordon and Nair, and John Tosh have argued that, even though there was a heavy emphasis on the separation between the private home and family and public life, fatherhood had a strong public dimension. Davidoff *et al.* and Tosh argue that public scrutiny meant it was essential for both working and middle-class fathers to ensure their children lead their lives in a respectable manner. This scrutiny was crucial, as men's public and political authority often rested on the ideal of separate spheres and being the head of a respectable household, as seen with the working-class trade union and chartist campaigns. Children, especially their sons according to Tosh, were crucial to justifying a father's authority, masculinity, and place as the head of the family in public, as well as ensuring his place in posterity. As such they remained firmly involved in their children's nurturing and discipline with great concern and, as John Tosh argues, great anxiety. These anxieties around ensuring their children's development and future were exacerbated by the public world becoming increasingly immoral, competitive and uncertain.

'Setting them up for future life'

The evidence from the histories show that both middle and working-class Scottish fathers concerned themselves a great deal in ensuring their children were set up for future life, however it appears there was a far greater involvement with sons than daughters. Of the male interviewees, there was

¹¹⁴ Gillis A world of their own making P.182

¹¹⁵ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* PP.148,151,154 Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.228

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50,55,57,58

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth Public Lives (Yale University Press 2003) PP.58,61

¹¹⁶ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50,55,57,58

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth Public Lives PP.58,61

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story P.148

only one who stated that his father did not take an active interest in his academic studies or helping him secure stable employment early in his life. Mr Fergeson (middle-class) commented "See, he - he didna take much to do with the family at all. Him being - engrossed, as she said, in his business". His father's lack of involvement can also be partially attributed to his father dying when Mr Fergeson was a young age. Mr Fergeson's narrative shows how his father's work drew him out of family life almost completely, which Gillis argues was common. However in contrast to Gillis' arguments that many middle-class men became "strangers in their own home", the absence of any involvement by Mr Fergeson's father stands out as anomalous compared to the rest of the transcripts of male interviewees. 118

The other nine male interviewees record their fathers as being involved in their son's development in various ways. Three of the male middle-class interviewees and three of the male working-class interviewees each detailed their fathers either showing an interest and marking their children's academic progress, or actively teaching their children themselves. Of the working-class histories Mr Milne and Mr Cooper said their fathers would either 'have a glance' or help when they were working on their homework. Indeed Mr Cooper indicates his father took a close interest in Mr Cooper's interests as a boy. He recalls an occasion where he had become lost during a family outing to the Glasgow Exhibition and his father, knowing his son had an interest in engineering and machinery, searched the machinery section and found him. The transcript of Mr Johnson also shows how fathers work was not incompatible with helping their children academically. He recalls how his father was a joiner and one day he went down to the school to repair a window with his son, at which point he quizzed him on his alphabet. With regard to the three male middle-class

_

¹¹⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Fergeson PP.15,16

¹¹⁸ Gillis A world of their own making P.182

¹¹⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Milne PP.36,37

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cooper P.2

¹²⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cooper P.41

¹²¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Johnson PP.13,28

interviewees: Mr Robertson stated with regards to his father "he didn't do any of the domestic chores. No. He would help with lessons in the evening". 122 His father was also the one who decided Mr Robertson should go to boarding school, believing it best for him despite his unwillingness to go. 123 Mr Moar and Mr Morrison also stated how their fathers taught them before they went to school and continued to show an interest in their work once they enrolled in school. 124

Helping with their sons' academic progress was one way in which fathers showed an interest in their sons' development. Other fathers acted to secure their sons a stable job to fully set them up for future life. Mr Langford's (working-class) first job was in the shipyards where his father and uncles worked. Mr Cox's (working-class) father spoke for Mr Cox so that he could secure an apprenticeship. 125 In the interviews of middle-class men, Mr Morrison stated not only how his father specifically took an interest in his schoolwork, but then also provided Mr Morrison with his first job as an unpaid registrar and driver for his father's shop. After that Mr Morrison then followed his father into local government service as a Public Assistance Officer, Assistance Registrar, and collector of local rates. 126 Mr Scobie's father did not see his son follow in his footsteps, but he secured him his first job as a greengrocer. "I - think I - well my father - mother and father thought it would be better to learn a trade. So I was apprenticed to Mr Charles Smith". 127 The fact only Mr Langford and Mr Morrison followed in their father's footsteps supports the arguments that by the turn of the century changing markets had made it far less likely that sons would carry on the same trade as their fathers. 128 However, much as Davidoff et al. and John Tosh argue, it appears that where sons did not follow their fathers, their fathers continued to have an active role in supporting their sons and

¹²² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Robertson P.15

¹²³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Robertson P.29

¹²⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Moar P.9

¹²⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Langford P.65

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cox P.32

¹²⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Morrison PP.23,34,35,37

¹²⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Scobie P.28

¹²⁸ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.54

Tosh, John A man's place P.197

setting them up for future life.¹²⁹ In these cases we can see fathers aiding in their sons' education or securing them respectable and steady employment. Thus they acted within both the private and public sphere on behalf of their sons to help ensure their success.

But in contrast to almost all of the male interviewees reporting their fathers helped them find a job or helped with their education, only four of the female histories detail fathers helping with their academic work and none of them mention their fathers helping them secure employment. The fathers of Mrs Finlayson (working-class) and Mrs Small (middle-class) were the most active in supporting their daughter's education. Mrs Finlayson's father helped her with her sums and schoolwork and Mrs Small's father took her to a 'talent club' which encouraged people to broaden their horizons with literature, plays, music, and poetry. ¹³⁰ In addition Mrs Small was asked to read aloud to her parents. ¹³¹ Mrs Darroch (middle-class) and Mrs Hay (working-class) recall their fathers showing an interest in their work and Mrs Hay recited poems she'd learnt to her father over breakfast. ¹³² However the other half of the female interviewees either state their fathers did not help them with their work or did not mention it. ¹³³ In addition although all the women except Mrs Finlayson state they worked at some point, not one of them recalls their fathers helping them secure employment. They all either found the job on their own or their mothers enquired for them. ¹³⁴ It is possible that the differences in the level of paternal involvement could be a statistical anomaly or an

_

¹²⁹ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.148

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50

¹³⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Finlayson P.8

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small P.14,19

¹³¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small PP.14,19

¹³² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Hay P.31

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Darroch P.24

¹³³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Hanna P.31

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Scott

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Mackinnon

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Laurenson

¹³⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Small P.34. Worked at an Art College, Mrs Darroch P.27. Teacher, Mrs Laurenson P.2. Teacher, Mrs Hay PP.33,34,35 Milk Deliverer then Shoe Shiner, Mrs Hanna PP.34,61 Job at Stationary Store then Domestic Service, Mrs Mackinnon P.9 Domestic Service, Mrs Scott P.36 Textiles Spinner

issue of composure brought about by the phenomena in which Twentieth-century men were more likely to structure their life narratives around their work. However a number of the female interviewees worked for their entire lives, as such their testimonies contain a breadth of detail about their various employments. Indeed the evidence showing more fathers took a deeper interest in their son's education and employment, combined with the lack of any fathers helping find work for their daughters cannot be ignored.

This evidence deviates slightly from the arguments presented by Davidoff *et al.*, which state working-class fathers worked to find secure and respectable work for both their sons and daughters and ensure they were all productive members of the community for the sake of fathers' personal and public validation.¹³⁵ It does however correlate with John Tosh's assertion that the focus and anxiety of middle-class fathers was placed on their sons, who took priority as they were the ones that would carry on the family name and the family line.¹³⁶ The sample may suggest that this was a concern held not only by middle-class fathers but working-class ones as well, leading them to concentrate their energies on their son's development and employment. The evidence also strongly supports both John Tosh and Davidoff *et al.* in opposing John Gillis' arguments that various cultural shifts removed the majority of fathers from the epicentre of family life.¹³⁷ Although there were many comments within the narratives that fathers often had their attention and energy diverted away from their children, within the sample most fathers continued to help nurture their sons', and to a lesser extent their daughters', future prospects.

_

¹³⁵ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* P.148

¹³⁶ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' PP.54,55,57,58 Tosh, John *A man's place* P.197

¹³⁷ Gillis A world of their own making P.191

Punishment and behaviour

The historiography of the parental and paternal responsibilities of disciplining children and ensuring their moral upbringing are intertwined with those referred to at the start of the chapter. On the one hand the rise of motherhood, secularisation, changing discourses around masculinity, being removed from the home by work, and fathers' association with the immoral public world seemed to undermine fathers' traditional role of ensuring their children's moral development. In addition Tosh reiterates how common wisdom moved away from the decisive intervention usually supplied by fathers towards gentler emotional guidance; further indicating mothers were better suited to morally influencing children. On the other hand it has been argued this separation has been overstated. Tosh and Davidoff *et al.* have argued the respectability of a man's family and children was of paramount importance, and this coupled with the increased role of mothers as nurturers within the family and an increasingly uncertain public world left many middle-class men anxious. 140

With regards to the disciplining and moral upbringing of children the evidence the transcripts offer is mixed. It appears that again the levels of fathers' involvement were similar between classes. Within the transcripts of middle-class interviews one interviewee stated their father was responsible for disciplining them, three responded it was their mother, and four said it was the responsibility of both parents. Of the working-class interviewees three responded that their fathers were the ones responsible for punishing the children, five stated it was their mother's responsibility, and two

¹²⁰

¹³⁸ Gillis A world of their own making PP.182, 186, 190, 194

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story* PP.141,148 Tosh, John A man's place P.174

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50,52,55,57,58

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.552

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth Public Lives PP.58,61

¹³⁹ Linda Pollack quoted in Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.52

¹⁴⁰ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50,55,57,58

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story P.148

reported both parents were involved. Taken on average it appears that more mothers were given the sole responsibility for punishing children. But in half of both the working and middle-class families of the sample fathers continued to take an active role in disciplining children either alone or as partners.

The sample also shows that as Gillis, Tosh, and Davidoff *et al.* have suggested, religious practices that held fathers as the ultimate spiritual authority within the household had declined. ¹⁴¹ Half of the middle-class interviewees reported that there was little or no religious activity within the household. ¹⁴² Of the working-class interviewees one responded that there was no religious activity within the household, and two more responded that it was their mothers who promoted religious activity within the home. ¹⁴³ However there is evidence to suggest that religious practices that reinforced fathers' place as moral educators within the home continued longer within Scotland. Two of the middle-class and four of the working-class respondents noted their fathers said grace before eating. ¹⁴⁴ In addition, three of the working-class and two of the middle-class histories detailed fathers leading the family in prayers or reading aloud from the bible. ¹⁴⁵ It is clear for some of the interviewees that the religious values their parents imparted on them held serious significance. Mr Scobie, whose father would read the bible to him, when asked what his parents raised him to consider important responded "Well, yes, fear God for one thing". ¹⁴⁶ However, as important as religious values appear to have been for a select few of the interviewees, the majority did not

_

¹⁴¹ Gillis A world of their own making PP.182, 186

Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.52

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story P.141

¹⁴² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Moar P.14, Mrs Laurenson No Mention, Mr Fergeson P.24, Mrs Darroch P.24

¹⁴³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. No religious activity: Mr Cox .15,16, Religious activity overseen by mothers: Mrs Scott P.22, Mr Milne P.23,24

¹⁴⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Working-Class: Mr Langford P.24, Mr Cooper P.23, Mrs Hanna P.18. Middle-Class: Mr Morrison P.18, Mrs Small P.23

¹⁴⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Middle-Class: Mr Robertson P.16, Mr Scobie P.16, Working-Class: Mr Johnson P.4, Mrs Mackinnon P.6, Mrs Hay P.5

¹⁴⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Scobie PP.11,16

mention them as vital, and as seen above around only a quarter of fathers were actively involved in their children's spiritual education. Consequently, while the sample shows religious practices that reinforced the authority of fathers within the home may have remained important for a few, it was only a minority of the families.

The interviewees were also asked whether they received their ideas on how to behave more from their mothers or fathers. Five stated that their mothers were a larger influence on them for a mixture of reasons. Each of these responses relate to the secondary literature in different ways. Mrs Hanna (working-class) stated how her father "didn't bother" with the children and left their stepmother to deal with them. Mrs Scott (working-class) responded it was because her father was preoccupied with gambling. Both avail to Tosh and Gillis's arguments that for various reasons some fathers willingly distanced themselves from family life. Mrs Mackinnon (working-class) stated how due to her father migrating for work for large periods her mother had a greater influence on her. Mr Johnson (working-class) replied how "Oh it was my mother, oh yes, it was always the mother. Always the mother that brings up children". 147 Both testimonies support the general consensus that fathers' association with the public sphere of work drew fathers away from the epicentre of family life and the increased emphasis on motherhood lead to women taking prime responsibility for children's moral development. Mr Fergeson (middle-class) states that he took after his mother because he found "squabbling" to be difficult, suggesting he was turned away from his father due to his "domineering" personality. 148 This could support the arguments of Tosh and Linda Pollock, that mothers took a larger role in raising children as fathers were seen as less adapt at gentler emotional guidance.149

¹⁴⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Johnson P6, Mrs Scott PP.14,15

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hanna P.12

¹⁴⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Johnson P.18

¹⁴⁹ Linda Pollack quoted in Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.52

However within the remaining interviews two stated they took their ideas of how to behave directly from their father and ten responded they took ideas on how to behave from both parents. On the one hand this shows a substantial number of women within the sample took sole responsibility for disciplining and instilling values within children, supporting the arguments that fathers' role as moral guardians was overtaken by mothers. On the other hand half the fathers in the sample were involved in disciplining their children and a slim majority were responsible for their children's behaviour and values. This direct relationship between fathers and their children would seem to undermine John Gillis' assertions that middle-class fathers had become 'indifferent' compared to their predecessors and that their relationships to their children had become mediated through their wives. However, a closer inspection of the reasons children were disciplined and the particular behaviour instilled in them suggests that the sample may again strongly support the ideas of Tosh, Gordon and Nair, and Davidoff *et al.*.

A significant number of the reasons interviewees gave for being punished involved actions that brought them into conflict with those outside the family unit. Mr Cox states how he "got a tanning" from his father for skipping school, at which point an inspector came to the house. For his son's truancy Mr Cox's father could have been fined and his son ran the risk of being placed in a remand home. Clearly in this example the actions of Mr Cox reflected upon his father and lead to the family receiving a warning and admonishment from an official public source. Both Mr Milne and Mr Scobie stated how they received punishment for "Saying cheek after next door neighbour" and doing wrong in front of visitors respectively. Again it is significant that the first examples of punishment

-

¹⁵⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Ideas of how to behave from father: Mr Cooper P.15, Mrs Darroch P.10, Ideas on how to behave from both mother and father working-class: Mr Milne P.15, Mr Cox P.11, Mr Langford P.18, Mrs Finlayson P.30, Mrs Hay P.14, Ideas on how to behave from both mother and father middle-class: Mr Moar P.10, Mr Morrison P.20, Mr Scobie P.12, Mr Robertson P.11, Mrs Small P.16, Mrs Laurenson P.29

¹⁵¹ Gillis A world of their own making P.190

¹⁵² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Mr Cox PP.10,29

¹⁵³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne P.15, Mr Scobie P.11

these three recalled involved elements from outside the family. From these we can clearly see that children's actions could reflect on their fathers in public settings. As such they support the arguments of Tosh and Davidoff *et al.*, the men's families and children were a source of authority and pride in the public world. Consequently when these children behaved poorly in ways that drew public attention, their fathers stepped in to remand or punish them.

The values and behaviours imposed by parents and fathers on the interviewees also support that parenting could be public in nature. Both working-class and middle-class interviewees stated how their parents placed a heavy emphasis on respecting your elders, not talking back or showing cheek, and respecting your parents' wishes. In addition there were several mentions of general hopes of children 'doing well for themselves' and living decent and respectable lives. Again we can see parents and fathers impressed that their children show respect and good behaviour not just within the family but wider community as well.

Of course, this is not to suggest that public scrutiny was the only reason that fathers and mothers involved themselves in raising their children. Three other transcripts gave specific incidents where children were punished by their fathers. Mrs Hay received 'a smack' for trying to eat with dirty hands and Mr Morrison was given a stern lecture when caught smoking at age 14. In both cases fathers stepped in out of concern for their children's health and wellbeing. The last transcript in some ways demonstrates that the stereotype of Victorian fathers over-exercising their power was not always unfounded. Mr Fergeson stated how he also received corporal punishment for making too much

¹⁵⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Cox P.11, Mr Milne PP.14,15, Mr Langford P.17, Mr Johnson P.13, Mr Morrison P.7, Mrs Scott P.15, Mr Fergeson PP.16,17, Mr Moar P.9, Mrs Small PP.9,10, Mr Morrison P.20

¹⁵⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Morrison P.19, Mrs Small P.11

noise on a Sunday morning, which his father found unbearable. ¹⁵⁶ Overall however, the sample appears to support the arguments of Gordon and Nair, Davidoff *et al.*, and John Tosh. The majority of reasons given for punishment involved children in conflict with non-family members. Furthermore the values fathers helped instill in children included showing respect to others. All of this suggests that the private realm of family and home and the public world of society were often more permeable and interconnected than previously assumed. What is also significant, in contrast to the evidence for fathers nurturing and securing education for their children, there is little difference in the level of involvement of fathers in disciplining their sons and daughters. Consequently the sample in this regard supports Davidoff *et al.* more than John Tosh's work, as fathers' anxiety over their children's behaviour does not seem to have been focused on sons specifically. It is also important not to over or under exaggerate fathers' involvement in disciplining children. In half of the histories fathers were removed from the role of disciplining and instilling behaviour in their children.

Although more fathers were actively involved than John Gillis has suggested, it is clear that there were various factors at work which for many weakened the connections between fathers and their children.

Corporal punishment

Much of the recent historical literature into the role of fathers as disciplinarians has been a conscious attempt to move away from the "hackneyed" stereotypes that dogged the images of fathers in the nineteenth and early twentieth century. For middle-class fathers, John Tosh has noted that often 'tyrannical' fathers come across with greater clarity in the literature than fathers who

¹⁵⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Fergeson P.17

made more subtle and successful adjustments to the changing social world around them. ¹⁵⁷ As part as their attempts to rehabilitate working-class fathers from their images as drunkards or abusive ruffians Lynn Abrams, Julie-Marie Strange, and Trevor Lummis have looked into the rates of corporal punishment and found it highly questionable how common these images reflected reality. Lummis has suggested that the use of corporal punishment may have occurred, not because fathers looked for excuses to exercise their authority, but in part because children's actions incurred public criticism from neighbours and officials that pressured parents into punishing their children. ¹⁵⁸ Abrams has also noted that often fathers' reputations as tough disciplinarians could have been over exaggerated by mothers using them as a threat, and that in many cases a father's "bark was worse than their bite". ¹⁵⁹

Of the eighteen testimonies all but Mr Moar detailed the type of punishments received from their parents. Of these, fifteen histories detail one or both parents using corporal punishment at some point in their childhood. The incidents of corporal punishment sorted by the parent responsible are detailed overleaf.

Table 1 – Incidents of middle-class corporal punishment. 160

Mother	Father	Both Parents	No Corporal Punishment
Mr Scobie	Mr Fergeson	Mr Morrison	Mrs Small

¹⁵⁷ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.60

Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' P.49

Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief": P.139

¹⁵⁸ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.229

¹⁵⁹ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.229

¹⁶⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Small P.16, Mr Laurenson P.29, Mr Morrison P.11, Mr Fergeson P.17, Mr Robertson P.11, Mr Scobie P.11

Mr Robertson	Mrs Darroch	Mrs Laurenson

Table 2 – Incidents of Working-Class Corporal Punishment. 161

Mother	Father	Both Parents	No Corporal Punishment
Mr Langford	Mr Cox	Mr Milne	Mrs Finlayson
Mrs Mackinnon	Mr Cooper		Mr Johnson
Mrs Hanna	Mrs Hay		
Mrs Scott			

As can be seen from Tables 1 and 2, corporal punishment was used almost equally by mothers and fathers of both classes. The high incidence of corporal punishment may at first seem to run contrary to Linda Pollack's assessment that there was a shift away from beating as a routine punishment by the end of the nineteenth century. It is important at this point to again note that the issue of composure is of paramount importance. There are many reasons why an individual may want not want to disclose or downplay unhappy or potentially traumatic memories of their childhood. As such one should be extremely careful when assessing sensitive topics such as this. However on closer inspection there is evidence to support Pollack's arguments and those of Lynn Abrams that corporeal punishment was often used only in exceptional circumstances. In seven of the transcripts where interviewees stated that their parents used corporal punishment they stressed that it only happened

¹⁶¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Finlayson P.16, Mr Johnson P.13, Mr Milne P.7, Mr Cox P.10, Mr Cooper P.15, Mrs Hay P.14, Mrs Scott P.4, Mrs Hanna P.14, Mrs Mackinnon P.6, Mr Langford P.18 ¹⁶² Linda Pollack quoted in Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.52

¹⁶³ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.223

once or on rare occasion. 164 Furthermore several of the cases could relate to John Tosh and Davidoff et al.'s arguments that parenting had a public dimension, or Trevor Lummis' that parents were more likely to use corporal punishment when pressured by outside forces. 165 Mr Cox, Mr Langford, Mr Milne and Mr Scobie all state that their punishment ensued after skipping school, acting inappropriately in front of visitors, or showing cheek to neighbours. 166 As Trevor Lummis states, it is possible that the use of corporal punishment in these cases was in part motivated by public pressure and criticism. There is also evidence supporting Lynn Abram's arguments that fathers' reputations as tough disciplinarians may have been over-inflated. Mr Cooper and Mrs Mackinnon both state how although they were intimidated by their fathers, Mrs Mackinnon attributed it to her father being out of the house for long periods of time and Mr Cooper stated that his mother would often use his father as a threat, warning "I'll tell your father". 167 This is not to suggest that there were not authoritarian or tyrannical fathers. But almost all of the references to corporal punishment within the transcripts are followed by qualifications that it was not an act of unprompted act of malice, that it did not happen often, or it was followed by a positive memory highlighting their parents' generosity or kindness. Such as in the case of Mr Fergeson, who after stating his father would use corporal punishment proceeds to qualify his father's actions, stating "'Course they lifted their hand but they didna mean to be brutal you know" and going on to say how his father gave them a generous amount of pocket money. 168 This could be an issue of composure, of children reconciling their memories of their parents with less pleasant memories they do not wish to dwell on. The rarity of corporal punishment and the responses to it could also be a problem brought about by the size of the sample. However it could equally suggest that for the majority of fathers both middle and working-class the image of an abusive domestic tyrant was an unwarranted one.

_

¹⁶⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Langford P.18, Mrs Hay P.14, Mrs Scott P.4, Mr Scobie P.11, Mr Robertson P.11, Mr Morrison P.19, Mrs Darroch P.10

¹⁶⁵ Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' P.49

¹⁶⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Scobie P.11, Mr Cox P.10, Mr Langford P.18, Mr Milne P.7

¹⁶⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cooper P.15, Mrs Mackinnon P.6

¹⁶⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Fergeson P.17

<u>Chapter Three - Fathers and leisure: Play within the home, excursions, trips and holidays, and leisure without children.</u>

Fathers and leisure

John Tosh argues that middle-class fathers' anxiety over their sons' masculinity impacted how they interacted in play and leisure. Fearing that being too intimate with their sons would undermine their self-reliance and moral autonomy, some fathers would distance themselves once their sons passed infancy. ¹⁶⁹ This emotional distance, he argues, was not necessary with daughters, who were intended for a lifetime of dependence in the domestic sphere. ¹⁷⁰ Julie Marie Strange has noted similar trends with working-class fathers, stating that fathers were comfortable with their sons when they were infants, but as sons grew older both parties became more self-conscious in light of the son's burgeoning masculinity and the potential rivalry that could follow. ¹⁷¹ Gillis argues that fathers avoided forming too intimate relationships with their children for fear that they themselves would appear immature. ¹⁷² Instead he argues men withdrew into more masculine cultures such as 'adventure' literature and muscular Christianity. ¹⁷³ Indeed both Gillis and Tosh argue that middle-class men's leisure pursuits drew them away from the family and home in what Tosh dubs 'the flight from domesticity''. Disillusionment, fear of becoming effeminised, and boredom with the feminine domestic home, marriage, and family, pushed men away. At the same time the appeal of all male spaces including academia, empire, sports, and clubs lead to many men withdrawing to areas where

⁻

¹⁶⁹ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.58

Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth Public Lives P.61

¹⁷⁰ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.57

¹⁷¹ Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief" P.145

¹⁷² Gillis A world of their own making PP.192-193

¹⁷³ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.556 Gillis *A world of their own making* PP.194, 195 Tosh, John *A man's place* P.174

they could enjoy a shared masculine experience with their peers.¹⁷⁴ Similar arguments have appeared for working-class men, placing them at work, pubs, working man's clubs, allotments, or tending pigeons instead of with their families, though to a lesser extent.¹⁷⁵

Gordon and Nair have proposed alternative images of middle-class fathers in the Late Victorian period, stressing that fathers could be informal, indulgent, and intimate. They state that for the middle-class father in late-Victorian Glasgow, enjoyment of the masculine worlds of his profession and of his hobbies was by no means incompatible with an intimate day-to-day involvement with his children. As part of the evidence for this argument they cite the extended trips and vacations of Scottish middle-class professionals such as Walter Crumb, who took their children with them when they travelled. In addition they provide examples of men's leisure lives revolving around their children, even men whom were active in male only areas of leisure like the 'flight of domesticity' describes. The Abrams and Lummis have argued that working-class fathers' distance from their families has been also been overstated and that many enjoyed spending quality time with their children, taking them on outings or playing games with them within the household. Lummis has also stated that the rate of working-class men's drinking, which has often been intertwined with their supposed neglect of their families, has been overstated.

_

¹⁷⁴ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.556 Tosh, John *A man's place* PP.178, 179, 181, 187, 188

¹⁷⁵ Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' PP.220, 225

¹⁷⁶ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.554

¹⁷⁷ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.557

¹⁷⁸ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' PP.555-557

¹⁷⁹ Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP.51-52

Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.232

Play within the Home

Some transcripts support the arguments of Tosh, Gillis, and Strange that fathers became distanced from their homes and families within the domestic sphere. Mr Cox omitted any mention of his father playing with him within the home. When asked whether the family would sing songs together he responded "No, no. People had to rough it at that time. Any sing songs it was done in the street". This suggests that in Mr Cox's experience the home was too crowded for leisure activities and these were customarily done outside of the home. 180 Other transcripts also suggest that fathers' connection to their children within the home could be tenuous. Mr Fergeson, as previously noted, commented his father "didna take much to do with the family at all. Him being - engrossed, as she said, in his business". Mr Fergeson states how his father did not tell him stories or play games with him and the only time he sung or made music was when strangers and friends came to visit. From his narrative it appears that his father had little direct involvement with his children within the home. 181 Mrs Scott's father spent a lot of his time out of the home gambling and appears little within her childhood narrative. Though she does say her parents would play games with her when she was young. 182 These three transcripts show that some Scottish fathers did become distanced from their domestic homes for various reasons including moving into male areas of leisure and work.

In contrast the rest of the transcripts show a thriving culture of fathers spending time within the home. Roughly half of both the working-class and middle-class interviewees recall their fathers telling them stories or reading aloud for them. For Mrs Finlayson (working-class) and Mr Morrison (middle-class) this could be situated within larger communal traditions. Both refer to the tradition of

Middle-Class: Mr Moar P.4, Mr Morrison P.9, Mr Robertson P.15, Mrs Small P.19, Mrs Laurenson P.13

¹⁸⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cox, P.12

¹⁸¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Fergeson P.19

¹⁸² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Scott P.17

¹⁸³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Working-Class: Mr Milne P.7, Mr Langford P.10, Mrs Mackinnon P.3, Mrs Finlayson P.7, Mrs Hanna P.5,

'Caileying' where people would tell stories within their homes and their neighbour's houses. Both state how their fathers enjoyed taking part in these traditions and telling them stories. 184 Others recall how storytelling could be a more family orientated experience. Mrs Laurenson's father was away for many months of the year fishing, but when he returned he would regale his children with tales of places he had been to and the foreign people he had met. 185 For others, fond childhood memories of fathers telling stories stand in contrast to later complications in their relationship. Mrs Hanna in her narrative describes how her father "didn't bother" with the children in the areas of discipline and academia. However she recalls that when she was young her father used to sit her on his knee and tell stories, often making them up as he went along. 186 Again it is apparent that familial relationships were not always cohesive, however it appears Mrs Hanna's father was not completely separated from his children when they were infants. These transcripts support the arguments of Gordon and Nair, Abrams, and Lummis that fathers could be indulgent and involved with their children within the home, in contrast to the 'flight of domesticity' thesis. However it must be noted that many of the interviewees implied that these events took place early in their lives, which would also fit with Tosh and Strange's arguments that fathers could be close with their children when they were infants before issues of masculinity came to the fore.

Although slightly rarer than storytelling, half of the middle-class transcripts and two of the working-class transcripts detail fathers playing games with their children. Mr Langford (working-class) recalled how his parents would play party games with the children including Postman's Knock and plate spinning. Mr Robertson (middle-class) states how his father used to have pillow fights with his children and play "daft games" with them. Both of these instances of fathers involving

-

¹⁸⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Morrison P.9, Mrs Finlayson P.7

¹⁸⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Laurenson P.13

¹⁸⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Hanna P.5

¹⁸⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Langford PP.20,31

¹⁸⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Robertson P.12

themselves with juvenile antics stand in stark contrast with Gillis' assertion that fathers avoided overly associating themselves with the domestic sphere for fear of appearing immature. Furthermore, the transcripts detail fathers playing games with their grown children as well as their adolescent ones. Mr Robertson states how after he grew up his father continued to play games with him such as croquet. Mrs Darroch (middle-class) recalled how "when I was fourteen - I was promoted to play - play three handed bisique on summer holiday". And Mr Scobie also stated he would play more advanced games with his father such as draughts once he aged. Unlike storytelling, which was often focused on younger children, it appears fathers played games with their children often regardless of age or gender. Again this raises questions about fathers supposed 'anxiety' with being overly associated with both the home and their older male offspring. It is true that these perspectives are from children viewing their fathers, so there is little to detail the inner thoughts of their father's minds, however their actions appear to present them as comfortable playing with their children within the home.

This is compounded by the ubiquitous popularity of singing and musical nights within the home. Seven of the working-class interviewees and five of the middle-class interviewees recalled some form of singing or music within the home with fathers involved. ¹⁹³ This could involve the family sitting together whilst playing the gramophone and only having sing songs on special occasions, such as in Mr Milne's household. ¹⁹⁴ For some families musical nights involved parents singing or playing to their children. For example Mr Moar's father would sing sea shanties whilst making kishies in the

_

 $^{^{\}rm 189}$ Gillis A world of their own making PP.192-193

¹⁹⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Mr Robertson P.12

¹⁹¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Darroch P.12

¹⁹² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Scobie P.13

¹⁹³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Working-Class: Mr Milne P.17, Mr Cox P.12, Mr Langford P.20, Mr Cooper P.18, Mrs Hay P.24, Mr Johnson P.16, Mrs Hanna P.20, Middle-Class: Mr Moar P.14, Mr Fergeson P.19, Mr Morrison P.27, Mr Scobie P.13, Mr Robertson P.12, Mrs Laurenson P.30

¹⁹⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne P.17

home and Mrs Hanna's father would sing and play the Harmonium during his spare time. ¹⁹⁵ For many homes music nights involving everyone were regular fixtures of family life. Mr Morrison (middle-class) and his siblings were given musical instruments for Christmas. Using these instruments the family would have 'spontaneous' musical evenings where everyone played. ¹⁹⁶ Working-class families also boasted full musical nights. During musical nights in his home Mr Cooper would play the double bass, his brother the piano, and his father the harmonium. ¹⁹⁷ This anecdote stands out, as it details a father spending time alone with his grown sons within the home, with no hint of anxiety or self-consciousness. Mr Johnson's father played the violin and his mother would sing and compose songs. Together they would write and perform songs based on their children, and all of the family would play together during musical nights. ¹⁹⁸ For some families such as the Laurensons, musical nights could become large social events.

And then - the neighbours would come along and we'd have a cup of tea and sing... I was in the middle of the district and they would come from east and west and - maybe thirty of us and we had grand times.¹⁹⁹

Not only does Mrs Laurenson's testimony detail her father spending time with his children within the home, it shows her father doing so in front of his friends and community with no concern. Within a majority of testimonies there appears to a thriving culture of musical nights as social entertainment or leisure within the home. Furthermore these were practiced regardless of geographical location, age, class, or gender. This seriously undermines the idea fathers would distance themselves from their homes or were drawn out by male-only leisure. There does appear to be a handful of individual fathers who withdrew from any domestic recreational pursuits. However the vast majority appear to have been comfortable within the domestic home and fully enjoyed spending time with their

_

¹⁹⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Moar P.14, Mrs Hanna P.20

¹⁹⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Mr Morrison P.27

¹⁹⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Cooper P.18

¹⁹⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Johnson P.16

¹⁹⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Laurenson P.13

families and children. All of this supports the arguments of Lummis, Abrams, and Gordon and Nair, that many fathers saw time within the home with their family a relaxing and rejuvenative experience.

Excursions, trips, and holidays

Evidence of fathers spending recreational time with children outside of the home further supports the ideas of Gordon and Nair, Abrams, and Lummis that many fathers had no issue indulging their children. Furthermore many of the testimonies again support arguments the public and private spheres could be more permeable than the 'flight from domesticity' thesis suggests. All except one of the middle-class transcripts detail fathers taking their children out on trips without their mothers. Por some interviewees these outings could be regular. Mr Robertson, Mr Fergeson, Mrs Darroch, Mr Scobie and Mrs Small all went on trips with their fathers at least once a week. Often this took the form of Sunday walks when their fathers had days off. When asked if her father enjoyed their company Mrs Small responded "Oh yes. Oh yes, but just - you see, his work took up a lot of time", and as a result they only really saw him on weekends and holidays. The sample also details a number of more elaborate excursions including days out to nearby cities, visiting the theatre and opera, or special occasions such as weddings. In some cases it appears fathers' hobbies fostered common ground between them and their progeny, especially sons. Mr Robertson was taken golfing and horse riding with his father. Later in Mr Robertson's life he continued with

²⁰⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Fergeson PP.21,22, Mr Morrison PP.9,10,43,44, Mr Scobie P.6,19, Mr Robertson PP.12,13,20, Mrs Small PP.8, 14,15, Mrs Darroch PP.12,13, Mrs Laurenson PP.14,30

²⁰¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Fergeson PP.21,22, Mr Scobie P.6,19, Mr Robertson PP.12,13,20, Mrs Small PP.8, 14,15, Mrs Darroch PP.12,13,

²⁰² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small P.8

²⁰³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Fergeson PP.21,22, Mr Morrison PP.9,10,43,44, Mr Scobie P.6,19, Mr Robertson PP.12,13,20, Mrs Small PP.8, 14,15, Mrs Darroch PP.12,13

both of these hobbies, owning his own horses and winning a golfing trophy. ²⁰⁴ Mr Morrison states how the relationship between him and his father actually improved after he aged because the two were able to share a common interest in local government. ²⁰⁵ Both of these testimonies raise questions, as both detail fathers becoming closer to their sons as they aged. Furthermore both golfing and politics are identified by Tosh and Gillis as distinctly masculine areas which fathers withdrew into when escaping the overly feminine domestic home. ²⁰⁶ This could suggest that fathers attempted to connect with their sons in arenas that were not perceived as effeminised as the home. However the rest of Mr Morrison's and Mr Robertson's narratives show their fathers were equally comfortable playing with their children within the home. Consequently it appears more likely that their fathers simply enjoyed spending time with them and so wished to share their hobbies with them.

Similarly, the working-class transcripts reveal a majority of working-class fathers often took their children on excursions without their mother, though these excursions are not as common or costly as within the middle-class sample. ²⁰⁷ Again, Sunday walks appear to have been a popular pastime. Mr Langford explicitly states that her father took her out on Sundays as it was the only time he was free to spend time with him. ²⁰⁸ Mr Milne, Mrs Hay, and Mr Cooper were all taken on walks and picnics to concerts in parks, the Glasgow botanical gardens, or to local landmarks such as castles. ²⁰⁹ Mrs Finlayson recalls that the trips to Stornoway market with her father "were like going to Paris". ²¹⁰ She also describes how it was "a great event" to be allowed to help her father make biscuits in his

²⁰⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Robertson PP,12,13,20

²⁰⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Morrison P.21

²⁰⁶ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.556 Tosh, John *A man's place* PP.178, 179, 181, 187, 188

²⁰⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Working-Class transcripts containing excursions: Mr Milne P.19, Mr Langford P.21, Mr Cooper P.19, Mrs Finlayson PP.5,6, Mrs Hanna P.23

²⁰⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Langford P.21

²⁰⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne, P.19, Mrs Hay P.23, Mr Cooper P.19

²¹⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Finlayson PP.5,6

bakery and it was a "great treat" when he gave them leftovers.²¹¹ Though this was not leisure time for Mrs Finlayson's father, it was for Mrs Finlayson. Her narrative describing how her father invited her to take part in his public world of work also proves that the public and private spheres could be more permeable than considered. The one pastime where there appears to be a large class division is the visiting of friends, family, and neighbours. No middle-class interviewees stated they were taken visiting by their father, either making no mention of this, stating they were taken by their mother, or in the case of Mr Morrison because their fathers were too busy with other pastimes.²¹² By contrast six of the working-class interviewees recalled being taken visiting by their father. As Mr Langford and Mrs Finlayson show this could involve enjoyable pastimes such as playing 'daft' games or listening to stories.²¹³

Fathers appear to have been less involved within family holidays and extended trips. Five of the middle-class transcripts detail the interviewees and their mothers going on holidays, but only three record that their fathers accompanied them. However the three instances where fathers went on family holidays show fathers taking extended leave from their work (between a fortnight and six weeks) to spend time with their families and children. The three working-class interviewees who went on holidays with their parents describe far less extravagant affairs, but they still show fathers taking a week or weekend off work to spend with their family. However these fathers are clearly within a minority. Within both working-class and middle-class transcripts interviewees state their

⁻

²¹¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Finlayson P.5

²¹² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Mr Moar, Mr Fergeson P.21, Mr Morrison P.30, Mr Scobie, Mr Roberston, Mrs Small, Mrs Darroch P.12, Mrs Laurenson.

²¹³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Milne P.19, Mr Langford P.21, Mr Cooper P.19, Mr Johnson P.16, Mrs Finlayson P.7, Mrs Hay P.16

²¹⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Middle-Class holidays without fathers: Mr Fergeson P.21, Mrs Small P.10, Middle-Class holidays with fathers: Mr Darroch P.12, Mr Robertson P.14, Mr Scobie P.15.

²¹⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Darroch P.12, Mr Robertson P.14, Mr Scobie P.15.

²¹⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne P.19, Mr Langford P.10, Mrs Finlayson P.6

families could not afford holidays or their fathers were too busy to take the time off.²¹⁷ In this respect the transcripts are open to interpretation. On the one hand they show fathers of both classes spending extended periods of time in just the company of their families, as Gordon and Nair have drawn attention to. On the other hand this ideal was only accessible to a minority of fathers within the sample. Together finances and work limited the amount of time the majority of fathers could spend with their children, supporting arguments that changing workplace practice drew fathers away from their families.

Male Only Leisure

According to Tosh and Gillis part of the impetus for the 'flight from the domesticity' came from the allure of male only social spaces. Additionally, Gillis has argued it appears the preference for socialising outside the home was more prevalent amongst middle-class men. The transcripts offer some evidence to suggest that there is merit to their thesis. Over half of the middle-class transcripts record fathers being active in arenas that excluded their children. Mr Fergeson's father would go into town to see his friends and enjoyed taking walks on Sundays by himself. Mrs Small, Mrs Darroch, and Mr Robertson detail their fathers spending large amounts of time at clubs, meetings, and dinner parties. Mr Robertson's father attended so many parties during most weekdays he would come home, have dinner, and then go out again. Mrs Darroch's father often missed dinner at home altogether, returning late in the evening after meetings and dinners. Mr Morrison's narrative details his father having a large network of friends and an active social life. His father

²¹⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Working-Class no holidays with fathers: Mr Cooper P.20, Mr Cox P.14, Mr Johnson P.21, Mrs Hay P.17, Middle-Class no holidays with fathers: Mr Fergeson P.21, Mrs Small P.10

²¹⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Fergeson PP.13, 27, 33

²¹⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Small P.21, Mrs Darroch P.15, Mr Robertson P.18

²²⁰ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Robertson P.18

²²¹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Darroch P.15

played in a football team, played shinty, was part of a minstrel troupe, helped organise music concerts, and was friends with many important members of the community.²²² When asked whether his father took him visiting Mr Morrison responded:

Not very much, no, my father was a very busy man, you see, with all his own activities, and - my mother was very busy with her large family, and - they didn't go visiting very much, either of them.²²³

The degree to which these men withdrew from the home into masculine cultures and leisure to an extent supports the 'flight from domesticity' thesis.

The narratives of working-class transcripts appear to show working-class fathers engaging less in allmale areas of leisure. Only two of the transcripts note that their fathers regularly drank and went to the pub. Mr Milne's father was a member of the local working man's club and enjoyed having a cup of tea in the house before moving to the pub and having a political argument over a pint with his 'boozing pals'. In addition he enjoyed going to watch games of football and betting at the races on his own. 224 Mrs Scott's father enjoyed going to the pub in addition to servicing his gambling habit. As a result she states "- to tell you the truth - he never was much at home. I mean there's nothing really I can say about my father". 225 However there is also evidence that Scottish working-class fathers' reputation for hard drinking may have been exaggerated. Three of the interviewees responded that their fathers were teetotallers and six stated the neither of their parents ever went out to pubs or clubs. 226 Here there appears to be a geographical divide amongst the transcripts. Five of the interviewees came from the Isle of Lewis and Barra. Neither the working-class nor middle-class

²²² Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Morrison PP.19,28,30,43,4

²²³ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mr Morrison P.30

²²⁴ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Milne PP.25,30

²²⁵ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mrs Scott PP.14,15,23,24

²²⁶ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Teetotallers: Mr Langford P.14, Mr Cooper P.11, Mrs Hay P.10, Never went out to pubs or clubs: Mr Cox P.17, Mr Langford P.25, Mr Cooper P.24, Mrs Scott P.24, Mrs Finlayson P.10, Mrs Hanna P.20, Mrs Hay P.20

interviewees from these rural areas state their fathers went to clubs or pubs.²²⁷ Mrs Finlayson explicitly stated that there were no clubs, pubs, or sports that her father could attend.²²⁸ But there is evidence that men from urban areas also abstained from pubs and clubs by choice. Mr Cox, raised in Edinburgh, stated how his mother and father both liked a drink, but they didn't go out at night because they were too exhausted.²²⁹ How closely this sample matches overall trends of male participation in drinking and pub culture in Scotland is unclear. However the sample supports the arguments of Gillis, that whereas middle-class men were separated from and withdrew out of family life working-class men were not subject to the same pressures. It also corroborates the evidence of Lummis and Abrams that the rate of working-class father's absence from the home in lieu of male only leisure and drinking may have been dramatically overstated.

-

²²⁷ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work.* Lived on Scottish Islands: Mr Johnson, Mrs Mackinnon, Mrs Finlayson, Mr Moar, Mr Morrison

²²⁸ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. *Family Life and Work*. Mrs Finlayson P.10

²²⁹ Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work. Mr Cox P.17

Conclusion and Final thoughts

By thoroughly examining all the sections relevant to fathers and family within the transcripts of the Edwardians interviews, this study has aimed to faithfully recreate the personal lives and relationships of the persons involved. One of the core themes that have been considered is the extent to which Late Victorian and Edwardian families were orientated around the ideal of separate spheres. It is clear from the sample that mothers did indeed take on a number of parental responsibilities for childcare and nurture that had previously been undertaken by men and fathers. In addition to taking prime responsibility for child-care and domestic tasks within the home in all of the cases within the sample, many mothers were also the ones who disciplined the children and instilled values and behaviours in them. However it is also clear that the ideology of separate spheres were neither universal nor unyielding. Instead, as Tosh, Gordon, and Nair have argued, they could be both porous and interconnected.²³⁰

Whilst it is clear that the removal of men from the home by paid employment had a large effect on family life, much as Gillis has argued, it varied enormously how practical it was to allocate gender roles within the family.²³¹ It is questionable to what extent collective memory has diminished recollections of fathers helping within the home, but there are trends that run throughout the sample. Middle-class men were more likely to achieve the breadwinner ideal and have enough disposable income to hire servants to help with domestic chores. However it appears that incidences of middle-class fathers refusing to help with domestic chores on principle were a minority. By contrast working-class interviewees recalled their fathers being more involved with domestic tasks. The majority of working-class fathers were recorded as helping within the home and there were

²³⁰ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.554 Tosh, John *A man's place*. PP.1-8

²³¹ Gillis A world of their own making P.187

working-class fathers present who actively contributed whenever possible. This corroborates the studies by Lummis and Abrams who have come to similar conclusions.²³²

On probing deeper into family life and the division of parental responsibilities within the household there is evidence showing realms of the 'public' and the 'domestic' were often permeable and interconnected. The sample shows fathers as involved with the disciplining of both sons and daughters. An examination of the cases in which fathers punished their children and the incidents in which corporal punishment was used proves that fathers' involvement within this area cannot simply be attributed to men eagerly over-exercising their authority within the home. Although there were undoubtedly abusive fathers, the sample suggests that their pervasiveness should not be overstated. An alternative explanation for fathers' involvement in disciplining children is the fear of scrutiny the heads of households were exposed to. As John Tosh and Davidoff et al. have noted both middle-class and working-class men's political, economic, and social authority in public was often derived from their responsibility and power over their families.²³³ Consequently, when children's actions brought criticism from neighbours or official sources, fathers quickly stepped in to reprimand them. This public dimension of paternal responsibility can also been seen in the rate of fathers involving themselves with preparing their children for success in future life. This also adds a gendered element to fathers' roles. Men appear to have concerned themselves a great deal with securing their sons' future prospects, but far less interested in those of their daughters despite almost all of the women in the sample going on to engage in paid employment. This suggests, as

⁻

²³² Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood' PP. 46 Abrams, Lynn, 'There was no one like my daddy' P.230

²³³ Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet The Family Story PP.148,151,154 Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.50,55,57,58

John Tosh has argued, the locus of fathers' concern was their sons, who were destined for a life in the public sphere and would carry on his name.²³⁴

However whilst the sample suggests that fathers were concerned with public scrutiny it does not appear to have compelled fathers to enforce distance between themselves and their progeny, either for the sake of tarnishing their own masculine reputations or undermining their sons' 'manly independence'. The sample shows an overwhelming majority of men spent time entertaining and playing with their children both within the home and outside it. The greater prevalence of the breadwinner wage and increased disposable income afforded to the middle-classes, which in some respects distanced middle-class fathers from their home and family, allowed some middle-class men more time and money to spend on leisure time with their children compared to working-class fathers. Regardless, the majority of both middle-class and working-class fathers appeared to enjoy the recreational they spent with their children and found many instances play with them. 'The Edwardians' sample is slightly limited as a source in this line of enquiry. The sample represents father-child relationships from the perspective of the children, so it is hard to discern whether fathers did indeed wrestle with fears of appearing too intimate or immature. But in examining their actions it is hard to see any evidence of the anxiety or turmoil that Gillis and Tosh have suggested existed.²³⁵ The proportion of men who took their children out on excursions, went on holiday with them, socialised with them in front of non-family members, and even on one occasion took their children to work with them suggest that many fathers took no issue with being seen as close with their children. As Gordon and Nair have suggested there appears to have been little preventing

_

²³⁴ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' PP.54,55,57,58 Tosh, John *A man's place* P.197

²³⁵ Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood' P.57 Gillis A world of their own making PP.192-193

fathers at the turn of the nineteenth century from acting both as professionals and close and indulgent fathers.²³⁶

It is clear that some men were drawn away from the family by all male areas of leisure as John

Tosh's 'flight from domesticity' describes. 237 However there does not appear to be evidence that this occurred because men sought to escape an overly feminised home and family. Many men boasted rich social lives of clubs, pubs and drinking. But in many of these cases it appears that fathers' male-only areas of leisure were not incompatible with spending time with their family. To take Mr

Robertson and Mrs Hay as middle-class and working-class examples respectively: Mr Robertson's father enjoyed going to dinner parties most days of the week and Mrs Robertson's father spent a lot of time out of the home as a kirk elder. But Mr Roberson's father also had pillow fights with his children when they were young and played golf with them when they were older. Mrs Hay's father spent time playing and singing for his daughter and taking her on trips to the park. As Gordon and Nair argue, for both of these men neither their role within the public sphere or their homo-social worlds of leisure were incompatible with spending time with their families. 238

We see that in the past, as today, the concept of fatherhood was an intersection of both public perception and personal interpretation. It is clear that as John Tosh has described, men continuously passed between the worlds of public and private.²³⁹ However the ways in which fatherhood related between the two is less certain. This study has found that for many Scottish fathers, the public authority provided as the head of a household was also a source of concern. The actions of a man's family could expose him to criticism and so many attempted to ensure that their children lead

²³⁶ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.556

²³⁷ Tosh, John *A man's place* PP.178, 179, 181, 187, 188

²³⁸ Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' P.556

²³⁹ Tosh, John *A man's place*. PP.1-8

respectable lives. This meant ensure their good behaviour and, in the case of sons setting them up for future life. By contrast however fathers do not appear to have feared for the masculinity of themselves or their sons in the same way. While fathers took steps to ensure their sons would lead respectable and productive lives, they do not appear to have imposed distance between them for fear of undermining their masculinity. Furthermore, similar to how many fathers moved with ease between work and the family, many fathers appeared to move with ease between all male areas of leisure and spending recreational time with their children. That is if they participated in all male areas of leisure to begin with. During the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, for the majority of both middle-class and working-class fathers in Scotland, families continued to be a source of pride, authority, and comfort.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

- Brown, Callum, Barr, Wendy, Hertwig, Christine, Stephenson, Jayne, Conna, Karen, Little, Sharon, Thomson, Flora, Craik, June, Morgan-Klein, Philip, Turner, Anne, Carruthers, Betty, Shepherd, Katrina, 'Scottish Women's Oral History Project' http://atom.lib.strath.ac.uk/publication-about-scottish-womens-oral-history-project Last accessed 07/01/2018
- Cheyenne Roundtree, 'Do YOU have 'dad guilt'? Nearly two-thirds of working fathers admit they are jealous of stay-at-home dads', *Daily Mail*, (23 June 2017), Available From: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/health/article-4633556/The-rise-dad-guilt-Nearly-two-thirds-working.html last accessed 12 January 2018
- Doughty, Steve, 'Families need fathers, claims study', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-52993/Families-need-fathers-claims-study.html last accessed 12 January 2018
- Doughty, Steve, 'Working mothers risk damaging their child's prospects', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-30342/Working-mothers-risk-damaging-childs-prospects.html last accessed 12 January 2018
- Greenslade, Roy, 'Mail Online goes top of the world', *The Guardian*, 25 January 2012, available from: https://www.theguardian.com/media/greenslade/2012/jan/25/dailymail-internet, last accessed 12 January 2018
- Harris, Sarah, 'Children of working mothers lag behind', *Daily Mail*, (Publication date not given), Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-130555/Children-working-mothers-lag-behind.html last accessed 12 January 2018
- Macrae, Fiona 'Working mothers 'have FATTER children': Rise in obesity is blamed on women going out to work', *Daily Mail*, 27 June 2016, Available from:

 http://www.dailymail.co.uk/health/article-3662309/Working-mothers-FATTER-children-Rise-obesity-blamed-women-going-work.html last accessed 12 January 2018
- Matthews, William *British Autobiographies: An Annotated Bibliography of British Autobiographies Published Or Written Before 1951* (University of California Press, 1984)

- Mr Cooper Oral Testimony in Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition. Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Cox Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection].* 7th Edition. Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Fergeson Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Johnson Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Langford Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Milne Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Moar Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Morrison Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mr Robertson Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018

- Mr Scobie Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Darroch Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Finlayson Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Hanna Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Hay Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973.* [data collection]. 7th Edition. Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Laurenson Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Mackinnon Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Scott Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018
- Mrs Small Oral Testimony in *Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition.* Thompson, P., Lummis, T. (UK Data Service.2009). SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018

Thompson, P., Lummis, T. Family Life and Work Experience Before 1918, 1870-1973. [data collection]. 7th Edition. (UK Data Service.2009). Available From: SN: 2000, http://doi.org/10.5255/UKDA-SN-2000-1 Last Accessed 07/01/2018

Thompson, Paul 'The Edwardians' - A list of Publications based on 'The Edwardians' https://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/catalogue/?sn=2000&type=Data%20catalogue Last Accessed 07/01/2018

Thompson, Paul 'The Edwardians' Abstract

https://discover.ukdataservice.ac.uk/catalogue/?sn=2000&type=Data%20catalogue Last accessed 04/01/2018

Thompson, Paul 'The Edwardians' User Guide

http://doc.ukdataservice.ac.uk/doc/2000/mrdoc/pdf/2000uguide.pdf Last Accessed 07/01/2018

Various Authors, Destiny obscure: autobiographies of childhood, education and family from the 1820s to the 1920s Editor Burnett, John (Routledge 2013)

Ward, Alex, 'No time to cook, sew or have a lie-in: Survey finds a third of busy mothers let traditional tasks like ironing their bedsheets fall by the wayside', *Daily Mail*, 10 July 2017, Available from: http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-4680138/Survey-finds-mothers-ditchtraditional-tasks.html, last accessed 12 January 2018

Secondary Sources

Abrams, Lynn "There was no-one like my daddy': Fathers, the Family and the Marginalisation of men in Modern Scotland' in *Scottish Historical Review* Vol 78, No.206 Part 2 (Edinburgh University Press 1999)

Abrams, Lynn Oral History Theory (Taylor and Francis 2016)

Davidoff, Leonore and Hall, Catherine Family Fortunes: Men and Women of the English Middle-Class 1780–1850 (Taylor and Francis 2003)

Davidoff, Leonore, Doolittle, Megan, Fink, Janet & Holden, Janet *The Family Story: Blood, Contract and Intimacy 1830-1960* (Longman, 1999)

- Gillis, John R. A world of their own making: myth, ritual, and the quest for family values (Harvard University Press 1997)
- Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth 'Domestic Father and the Victorian Parental Role' in *Women's History Review* Vol 15, No 4, (Routledge 2006)
- Gordon, Eleanor and Nair, Gwyneth Public Lives (Yale University Press 2003)
- Hammerton, A. James, *Cruelty and Companionship: Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Married Life* (Routledge 1992)
- Humphries, Jane *Childhood and child labour in the British Industrial Revolution* (Cambridge University Press, 2010)
- Johansson, Thomas and Andreasson, Jesper Fatherhood in Transition Masculinity, Identity and Everyday Life (Palgrave Macmillan 2017)
- Lauzen, Martha M. "The Celluloid Ceiling: Behind-the-Scenes Employment of Women on the Top 100, 250, and 500 Films of 2015," *Center for the Study of Women in Television and Film*, (San Diego State University 2016) Available From: http://womenintvfilm.sdsu.edu/files/2015_Its_a_Mans_Celluloid_World_Report.pdf last accessed 12 January 2018
- Pollack, Linda Quoted in Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood: The Case of Early and Mid-Victorian England in *Gender and History* Vol 8 No 1 (1996)
- Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father figure* Ed. McKee Lorna & O'Brien Margaret (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982)
- Strange, Julie Marie 'Fatherhood, Providing and Attachment in late Victorian and Edwardian Working-Class Families' in *The Historical Journal* 55, 4 (Cambridge university press 2012)
- Strange, Julie-Marie "Speechless with Grief": Bereavement and the Working-Class Father c.1880-1914" in *Gender and fatherhood in the nineteenth century* Edited by Trev Lynn Broughton and Helen Rogers (Palgrave Macmillan 2007)

- Strange, Julie-Marie. *Fatherhood and the British Working-Class, 1865–1914* (New York: Cambridge) University Press, 2015)
- Tosh, John 'Authority and Nurture in Middle-Class Fatherhood: The Case of Early and Mid-Victorian England in *Gender and History* Vol 8 No 1 (1996)
- Tosh, John A man's place: masculinity and the middle-class home in Victorian England (Yale university Press 2008)
- Young and Willmott (1962) P.18 Quoted in Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father figure* Edited By McKee Lorna & O'Brien Margaret (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982)
- Zweig (1962) P23, Quoted in Lummis, Trevor 'The historical dimension of fatherhood: A case study 1890-1914' in *The Father figure* Edited By McKee Lorna & O'Brien Margaret (Tavistock Publications Ltd 1982)