



Mack, Janna (2018) *Today's diversity in Scotland's official past: investigating the depiction of immigrants in Scottish history textbooks*. [MSc].

<http://endeavour.gla.ac.uk/418/>

Copyright and moral rights for this work are retained by the author(s)

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This work cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author(s)

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, institution and date must be given



University
of Glasgow

**TODAY'S DIVERSITY IN SCOTLAND'S OFFICIAL PAST:
INVESTIGATING THE DEPICTION OF IMMIGRANTS IN SCOTTISH
HISTORY TEXTBOOKS**

Janna MACK

Dissertation submitted in part fulfilment of the requirements for the degree
of Master of Science (Educational Studies)

University of Glasgow

29.08.2018

Acknowledgements

I am eternally grateful to my supervisor, Professor Catherine Doherty, for recognising the potential of this work. Her guidance, discussions, and words of encouragement have shaped this dissertation. Thank you for having put up with many a semi-colon. I would like to thank my mother, for supporting my academic endeavours, and Nick, for keeping me up to date with current affairs and for cooking delicious meals. Some very special thanks goes out to all those who have come from every corner of the world to call Scotland home. Your resilience continues to awe me every day.

SUMMARY

In a post-Independence referendum and post-Brexit Scotland, young people of different ethnicities and cultures are educated for an uncertain world. The subject of History plays an important role in how these pupils come to understand Scotland as a nation. History textbooks, as vehicles of the curriculum, narrate the official story of the nation. This research looks at how identity formation of pupils of migrant backgrounds intersects with the narrative of official history textbooks. Which groups have entered the national history? Who is recognised as belonging to Scotland?

This dissertation will investigate which immigrant groups are depicted in Scottish history textbooks and what the contents of these presentations are. The research is situated against the backdrop of current political discourses which often paint an image of Scotland as an inclusive nation. Three contemporary textbooks at National 5 level from Scotland's leading educational publishers will be analysed. Relevant contents will be analysed using Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). Three core aspects of CDA will allow for a streamlined investigation: 'Attributes', 'Processes', and 'Circumstances'. This dissertation finds that textbooks depict Scottish natives alongside Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanian immigrants. However, historical research suggests that immigrants of Asian, Caribbean, and African origins have been present in Scotland from at least the 18th century onwards. While the textbooks construct a sympathetic image of the immigrant groups, the image of local Scots is comparatively negative, depicting their discrimination against newcomers. Official textbooks contradict the trend of current political discourses which paint an image of Scotland as an inclusive nation. Practical implications of these findings for history teachers include underlining contemporary relevant issues of the immigration experience depicted in the textbooks.

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction and Research Questions.....	1
Research Questions.....	2
Chapter 2: Literature Review.....	3
Chapter 3: Theoretical Framework: Identity, Nation, And Curriculum.....	8
Research Context.....	15
Chapter 4: Methodology.....	16
History in the Curriculum for Excellence.....	19
Sample.....	20
Methods.....	21
Fairclough’s (1989) ten questions for CDA.....	23
Limitations of CDA.....	27
Chapter 5: Analysis.....	28
Chapter 6: Findings.....	34
Irish.....	34
Italians.....	36
Jews.....	37
Lithuanians.....	38
Immigration to Scotland.....	40
Answering the Research Questions.....	41
Chapter 7: Conclusion.....	45
Bibliography.....	49
Appendix.....	54

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION AND RESEARCH QUESTIONS

If you look at the history books, where are we? The nurses, the people who worked on the buses, the people who worked in the factories, in the steelworks, *where* is that contribution written?

- Floella Benjamin, *Westminster Hour* 17th June 2018

Floella Benjamin, a Trinidad native and member of the House of Lords, came to the UK in the postwar years as part of the 'Windrush' generation. The Windrush generation is primarily of Caribbean descent and found their way to the UK in order to work and re-build the nation. In BBC 4's *Westminster Hour* discussion of June 2018, Benjamin laments that her generation remains invisible in the nation's official history. Her statements underline how important it is for immigrant groups to be recognised in official history.

The Scottish pupil sitting in a classroom today is more likely to be South Indian or Black British than twenty years ago. The 2017 make-up of pupil population in Scotland is roughly 85% White-British, 2% Pakistani, 1.3% 'mixed', 0.58% Chinese, and 1.21% Black (The Scottish Government 2018). The percentages of minority ethnic groups have roughly doubled compared to 2002, where the make-up was roughly 1.08% Pakistani, 0.27% Chinese, 0.2% Black (The Scottish Government 2003). I write here from the perspective of a mixed White and Asian student educated in a predominantly white European country. I was not represented in my Western European school textbooks. My predominantly white classmates, however, were. Through their ancestors, they could easily find themselves in our history textbooks. While they could feel part of the nation, I remained the 'other'. This dissertation aims to investigate who is represented in three current Scottish history textbooks. This research argues that the national history curriculum tells pupils the story of the nation. With the Scottish *Curriculum for Excellence (CfE)* describing itself as pupil-centred and inclusive of all, this dissertation aims to investigate who is represented in the history curriculum and what stories it tells of Scotland and its people. I wish

to reveal which young Scots can recognise themselves in the pages of the official past, and if so, what these representations reflect to them. Although the subject of History within the *CfE* has been analysed (e.g. Priestley and Hume 2010), no investigation has, to my knowledge, investigated how history textbooks create a version of the nation which is reflected to students and which influences their identity negotiation.

This is a timely investigation in the face of recent political events. The 2014 Independence Referendum split Scotland into two. The 2016 Brexit vote split Scottish voters from English and Welsh voters. Surrounding these major political events are different political discourses regarding issues of nationhood and immigration. In the face of increasing immigration, who can claim to be Scottish?

Research Questions

The two main questions and three sub questions are:

- **What images of Scotland and its people(s) are constructed in Scottish history textbooks?**
 - Are different nations and/or groups of people represented in the textbooks? If so, who are they?
- **How do Scottish history textbooks represent the growing diversity in the Scottish population?**
 - What are the contents of the different representations?
 - What attributes are attached to different groups?

In the following chapter, this dissertation will review four works which investigate curricular and textbook contents and situate them within social, political, economic and cultural contexts. In chapter three, the theoretical framework will be outlined. The present research is situated at the intersection of identity, nation, and curriculum. These concepts will be explained and the

research problem will be re-stated in conceptual terms. The research context will be presented and current political and social attitudes in Scotland will be investigated. Chapter four presents the methodology. The recommendations given by the *UNESCO Guidebook* for textbook research will be outlined and the sample of textbooks presented. An analysis of textbooks is an instance of Document Analysis (DA). The method for content analysis is Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). Here, Fairclough's (1989) ten questions will be laid out and condensed into three aspects: attributes, processes, and circumstances. In chapter five, the analysis process will be illustrated. In chapter six, findings will be reported against the backdrop of historical research into non-European immigration to Scotland. The research questions will then be answered. This dissertation finds that only European immigration to Scotland is depicted and that the only immigrant groups presented are Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanian. Finally, chapter seven summarises findings in terms of the theoretical framework. Possible implications for history teachers will be investigated, and the limitations of this dissertation will be addressed. It will be concluded that, although the textbooks only portray a limited group of immigrants, they portray various immigrant experiences which retain a potential relevance to every immigrant today. This dissertation will end by giving suggestions for further research.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter reviews relevant literature on curriculum and textbook studies. The curriculum study outlined here is Mao's (1997; 2008) investigation of Taiwanese state school reforms. Three textbook studies will be outlined: Crawford's (2006) study on the depiction of the 'Nanjing massacre' in eight Japanese textbooks from 1997 and 2002; Lin *et al.*'s (2009) comparative study of the depiction of the Korean War in US, Japanese, South Korean, and Chinese history textbooks; Sakki's (2010) Ph.D. thesis investigating the representation of the EU in contemporary curricula and history and civics textbooks in France,

England, Germany, Finland, and Sweden. The chapter concludes with an evaluation of these studies' impacts on the present research.

Mao (1997) examines the Taiwanese curricular reform in the 1990s. From the 1940s, Taiwan was dominated by a mainland-Chinese minority. The educational curriculum was taught in Mandarin only from a mainland-Chinese perspective and did not teach Taiwanese languages, culture, or history. However, in the latter half of the 20th century, the Taiwanese Han-Chinese gained political and economic power and women's and indigenous movements arose. In this changing climate, the curriculum was slowly 'indigenised'. The theoretical lens through which Mao analyses this curricular reform is Wagner's (1994) theory of 'embedding'. 'Disembedding' occurs when social contexts exclude certain individuals from constructing a social identity. 'Reembedding' describes the process whereby new social contexts allow individuals to reconstruct a social identity. The Indigenisation curriculum introduced more distinctively Taiwanese elements in the official curriculum. These elements included Taiwan-centric history, depiction of local culture, and the inclusion of Taiwanese languages. Mao interprets this curriculum change as a restructuring of the social boundaries which allows non-mainland Chinese Taiwanese to reembed social identity. However, the Taiwanese Han-Chinese selectively included elements of indigenous Taiwanese culture in the new curriculum. The re-defined social boundaries continued to exclude indigenous peoples who continued to experience disembedding.

Mao (2008) writes about the 1990s curricular reforms with the power of hindsight. The theoretical framework adopts Stuart Hall's (1990) conceptualisation of 'identity' as a process of becoming. In the indigenisation curriculum of the 1990s, indigenous Taiwanese languages and cultures were included in the curriculum because they were 'exotically attractive' (591) and provided possibilities for a construction of a distinctive 'Taiwanese' identity, different from the mainland Chinese. Ironically, the indigenous Taiwanese had little say in how they were represented in the indigenisation curriculum. In the late 20th century, China emerged as economic giant. Mao argues that although Taiwan underlined that it was more democratic than China, it also saw that it could use its cultural links to China to remain competitive in the global

economy. An indigenisation of the curriculum was thus no longer a priority. The 1999 'Nine-Year Integrated Curriculum' gave local schools and teachers more flexibility in content and teaching methods. According to Mao, this new curriculum evidences an underlining of 'the spirit of democracy' (590). Mao's discussions trace how the educational curriculum is interlinked with the perpetuation of a particular national identity and how a changing socio-political climate can precipitate change in curricular content. In particular, Mao shows how the curriculum can construct social identities which include and exclude certain individuals.

Crawford (2006) examined eight Japanese secondary school history textbooks and compared their 1997 versions with their revised 2002 editions. In a thorough contextualisation of his textbook analysis, Crawford describes the events of the 'Nanjing massacre', in which up to 300,000 Chinese soldiers and civilians were murdered by the Japanese army in Nanjing, China, between December 1937 and January 1938. He also explains how the topic of the massacre has been routinely suppressed by Japanese politicians and the media. Japanese textbooks must be approved by the Ministry of Education before appearing on the educational market, and must cover prescribed subject matter. According to Crawford, they are therefore all very similar in content. Crawford does not explicitly outline a theoretical framework. The methodology consists of a Discourse Analysis of passages related to the massacre. Crawford points out that while most of the 1997 editions refer to the exact numbers of victims of the massacres, the 2002 textbooks employ vaguer wordings, for example 'a lot' or 'many'. The 2002 editions state that there are various opinions about what happened in Nanjing, and that the exact numbers of victims, as well as details about the 'Nanjing incident' were still being investigated. In his conclusion, Crawford situates the textbook representations of the massacre within the political and economic climate of the 1990s. The Japanese economy was dwarfed by the rise of China and South Korea, which caused uncertainty amongst conservatives, who urged the promotion of Japanese nationalism and insisted on a positive depiction of a national past. This insistence has impacted history teaching in particular. The Nanjing massacre, while not denied, is therefore more often questioned in 2002

textbook editions. Crawford's study shows how a political emphasis on the depiction of a positive national past can result in the obscuring of negative historical events in official history textbooks.

Lin *et al.* (2009) investigate how the Korean War is represented in history textbooks from the US, South Korea, Japan, and China. The authors start their investigation by underlining the importance and potency of history as a school subject in the shaping of national understanding. Their study analyses varying numbers of books for each nation, but only the books of major publishers. All textbooks are used in early secondary school level, where the curricula of each country introduces the topic of the Korean War. While the authors do not present a theoretical framework, they outline a brief literature review of textbook studies. Research questions are also clearly defined. The authors compare textbook contents following Glaser and Strauss' (1967) method of constant comparison. Lin *et al.* (2009) find that the textbooks from the same country do not differ substantially in their depictions of the Korean War. There are however, some major differences between countries. In explaining the causes of the war, US, Japanese, and South Korean books underline the invasion of South Korea by North Korea, but Chinese books state that North Korea was invaded by the South. All textbooks agree that China was involved in the war by sending voluntary troops. US textbooks largely neglect the aftermath of the war, Japanese textbooks underline the economic boom following the war, South Korean books clarify that the war ended in armistice, and Chinese textbooks celebrate a victory for China. Lin *et al.* underline the importance of history textbooks in fostering how students understand their nation and point to the importance of presenting historical events through multiple perspectives. Their study suggests that textbook representations of major historical events can be slanted to correspond with a national bias.

Inari Sakki's (2010) Ph.D. dissertation investigates how the integration into the European Union is represented in history and civics textbooks of five different countries: France, England, Germany, Sweden, and Finland. She first investigates the concept of 'European identity' in terms of Social Identity Theory (SIT) and outlines the institutional acts which have led to the formation of the EU. She uses poll results to interpret what residents of the five countries

think about the EU. The textbook sample consists of civics and history textbooks from upper secondary school levels. At these levels, these subjects are either compulsory or widely studied. All textbooks are published by the countries' major educational publishers. The study's theoretical framework relies on SIT and Self-Categorization Theory (SCT). In Sakki's framework, national identities are social identities, which can be interpreted and experienced differently by different individuals. The main theory guiding the research methods in Sakki's study is Moscovici's (1961; 1973; 1984; 2000) Social Representation Theory (SRT). The methodology follows three stages. In the first stage, all relevant text is run through a text-mining software which statistically identifies re-occurring keywords and organises them into themes. The second stage involves qualitative content analysis following the principles of Grounded Theory. Sakki finds that in the textbooks of all five countries, there are positive and negative representations of the EU. French and German textbooks tended to have more positive representations, anchored around peace and cooperation, while British and Finnish books underlined threats to national sovereignty. Swedish textbooks positively associated the EU with peace, but negatively represented its lack of transparency. Overall however, representations of the EU in textbooks largely reflected the results of public opinion polls in their respective countries. Sakki shows that different countries can present different perspectives of an institution depending on the prevailing attitudes in that country.

Mao's curriculum study and the three textbook studies are very clear in presenting their rationales as well as contextualising their research problem. Crawford's investigation additionally presents a rigorous investigation of historical facts. The sample of textbooks in each study focused on those published by the largest national publishers. Depending on whether researchers wanted to analyse the evolution of depictions through time or compare depictions across nations, the sample either excluded or included previous publications. However, only Sakki's thesis presents a theoretical framework. The lack of a cogent theoretical framework is especially apparent in Lin *et al.*'s study. Lin *et al.* underline the importance of history textbooks in the role of national identity formation and national understanding, but neither of these two concepts are explained. In terms of methodology, Crawford uses Discourse

Analysis and Sakki uses Grounded Theory. Lin *et al.* refer to Grounded Theory, but limit themselves to its comparison stage. In both Crawford and Li *et al.*, the methodology is only very briefly stated. Nicholls (2003) has indeed pointed out that most textbook studies suffer from a lack of clear methodological and theoretical frameworks, presenting a tendency to jump immediately to the presentation of findings and conclusions. The studies presented above all situate their findings within each country's social, political, and economic atmosphere. The contents of the curricula and textbooks reflect either public opinion (Sakki 2010), political and economic forces (Mao 1997; 2008), or political insistence in depicting a positive national past (Crawford 2006; Lin *et al.* 2009).

This dissertation aims to follow these studies in terms of their thorough contextualisation of the research issue and in the focused selection of the sample. Care will be taken to define a clear theoretical framework and to explain the methodology. The former will now be presented.

CHAPTER 3

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK: IDENTITY, NATION, AND CURRICULUM

The present research conceptually lies at the intersection of *identity*, *nationhood*, and *curriculum*. The theoretical framework presented here employs Hall's (1996) theory of cultural identity, Anderson's (2006) and Billig's (1995) theories of the nation and nationalism, and Taylor's (2002) 'modern social imaginary'. Kelly (2009) and Flinders *et al.*'s. (1986) theories of the school curriculum unpack its complex nature. The research problem will be re-conceptualised using this theoretical framework. Then, a consideration of the research contexts investigates the socio-political climate surrounding the Independence Referendum and the Brexit vote. According to Hall (1990; 1996), 'identity' is not a state of being, but an ongoing process of becoming. An individual's identity is not a 'true' or 'stable' core self, found underneath layers

of acquired or enacted personality traits. Rather, Hall's conceptualisation of identity is a positioning negotiated between society and social agent:

I use 'identity' to refer to the meeting point, the point of suture, between on the one hand the discourses and practices which attempt to 'interpellate', speak to us or hail us into place as the social subjects of particular discourses, and on the other hand, the processes which produce subjectivities, which construct us as subjects which can be 'spoken'. (Hall 1996: 5)

Identity, then, is the ongoing positioning which takes place at the point of suture between the social practices which position individuals in society (those which 'interpellate' the individual) and the agentive practices with which individuals position themselves in society (those from which the individuals 'speak'). Hall (1996) further argues that if this ongoing process of identity formation takes place in relatively stable communities with little population movement, then social practices and discourses draw on resources of common history and culture to position individuals. This is no longer the case in an age of postcolonial globalisation and migration. Migrants find themselves in different societies where practices and discourses position them differently. Hall nevertheless maintains that the *process* itself remains the same, and always uses those social resources which currently position the individual:

identities are about questions of using the resources of history, language and culture in the process of becoming rather than being: not 'who we are' or 'where we came from', so much as what we might become, how we have been represented and how that bears on how we might represent ourselves. (1996: 4)

Hence, how society represents, or positions, the individual influences the social boundaries supporting identity.

Nations and their citizens do not exist naturally, but are imagined into existence. In *Imagined Communities*, Anderson (2006) investigates how individuals come to imagine themselves as belonging to the same nation. He describes a nation as 'an imagined political community - and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign.' (Anderson 2006: 6) A nation is **imagined**

because all the members of a nation can never meet each other, but still imagine a relationship which binds them together. It is **limited** because a nation, even if it can expand and can be(come) very large, it can never comprise the whole of humanity. Anderson locates 18th century Western Europe as the origin of the concept 'nation'. This was a time during which religion declined and divine dynastic rule was increasingly questioned. Therefore, the nation is imagined as **sovereign**, or, self-governed. It is a **community**, because it is imagined as 'a deep, horizontal comradeship' (7), regardless of hierarchical structures.

Taylor's (2002) theory of the 'modern social imaginary' describes how individuals have a shared understanding of the society they live in, its members, and its practices. Drawing on Anderson's (2006) theory of the imagined political community, Taylor conceptualises the ways in which individuals of a community imagine their society to be. 'Social imaginary' refers to:

the ways in which people imagine their social existence, how they fit together with others, how things go on between them and their fellows, the expectations that are normally met, and the deeper normative notions and images that underlie these expectations. (Taylor 2002: 106)

The social imaginary of a community comprises the complex ways in which individuals understand how their society came to be, what it is, who its members are, and what kinds of relationships exist within their society and with other societies. The social imaginary also comprises the deep 'implicit grasp' (107) of knowing how to navigate social spaces. It is therefore the social imaginary which legitimises social practices.

Billig's (1995) term, 'banal nationalism' describes how the 'nation' is constantly, but not consciously, re-produced. Banal nationalism explains why it is considered common-sense to think of the world as divided into different nations. Billig points out that in common and academic usage, the word 'nationalism' tends to be associated with the political far-right and separatism. This usage locates nationalism in extreme situations or at peripheries, not in the established nations of the West. However, Billig argues that nation-states

exist because they are re-produced through unconscious ideological habits. Hence,

the term banal nationalism [covers] the ideological habits which enable established nations of the West to be reproduced. It is argued that these habits are not removed from everyday life, as some observers have supposed. Daily, the nation is indicated, or 'flagged', in the lives of its citizenry. Nationalism, far from being an intermittent mood in established nations, is the endemic condition. (Billig 1995: 6)

Hence, banal nationalism manifests itself in the limp flag hanging on public buildings, in the singing of the national anthem before sports events, in the inclusive 'we' often used in newspapers to talk about the whole country. Billig further outlines the concept of 'national identity'. He purports that the question of national identity is not 'What is national identity?' but 'What does it mean to claim to have a national identity?' (61). This question shows that Billig acknowledging Hall's conception of identity as an ongoing process of positioning between social and subjective practices. Billig conceptualises national identity as negotiated and reinforced within the habits of everyday social life. Nations can create identities by creating narratives of themselves; these are 'national histories'. The national history of a nation shows how the nation interprets itself. However, there is rarely only one national history. There are many competing national histories, told by different factions within the nation:

'classes, religions, regions, genders or ethnicities [] always struggle for the power to speak for the nation, and to represent their particular voice as the voice of the national whole, defining the history of other sub-sections accordingly.' (71)

Underlying power relations of a society determine which national history is told. For instance, as Mao (1997; 2008) has shown, if the narrated national identity of Taiwan is that of the Han, then ethnic minorities are excluded from the Taiwanese identity. Thus, national identity is the perceiving of the nation in a

certain way, and members of this nation adopt this way of perceiving into the subjective positioning of themselves.

Hence, identity here is understood as a positioning at the point of suture between social practices and the social subject. These social practices exist within an imagined community (the nation) and are legitimised through a nation's social imaginary. This social imaginary clarifies who is part of a nation - and who is not part of it. The social imaginary in turn is upheld through banal nationalism, because banal nationalism is the unconscious, daily reproduction of the nation. It is the school curriculum which is an important conduit for banal nationalism, because it presents pupils with a particular construction of their nation. Here, the complex notion of 'curriculum' must be unpacked. Kelly argues that the school curriculum is commonly understood as 'a body of knowledge to be transmitted' (71), often divided into individual subjects. However, the curriculum has many different dimensions: the total curriculum, the hidden curriculum, the planned and the received, the formal and the informal. To these, Flinders *et al.* (1986) have added the 'null' curriculum. The **total** curriculum refers to the reasons why the curriculum wants to transmit the knowledge it plans to transmit and what the intended effects of this knowledge are. The **hidden curriculum** refers to the knowledge which is not explicitly taught, but which pupils nevertheless pick up. For instance, while gender roles are not overtly taught, if boys are encouraged to do woodwork and girls needlework in art class, a gendered role division is implied. The distinction between the **planned** and the **received** curriculum is the distinction between the official curriculum and the actual curriculum, or, the difference between theory and practice. While the former is the curriculum described in official documents, the latter is the curriculum which the pupils actually experience in the classroom. The difference between the **formal** and the **informal curriculum** is that between activities which are commonly referred to as 'curricular' and those which are 'extra-curricular' (12). The **formal** curriculum hence comprises all those activities for which teaching time is specifically reserved, while the **informal** curriculum comprises all those activities and learning which takes place outside of teaching time, for example 'sport, clubs, school journeys' (12). Kelly argues that these four dimensions must be considered in any definition of

the school curriculum. The definition of curriculum proposed by Kelly is therefore necessarily broad: 'the curriculum is the totality of the experiences the pupil has as a result of the provision made' (13). 'Provision' here refers to the entirety of arrangements made to deliver the curriculum to the pupils. The present investigation is interested in investigating which history of Scotland is officially presented to pupils and hence focuses on the formal and planned curriculum. This research is thus only partial.

Kelly (2009) also underlines that every school curriculum has political and ideological aspects. **Political**, because the power of official curriculum planning tends to lie with the current government. **Ideological**, because the curriculum in all its dimensions has the power to transmit values, ideas, and attitudes. It is no wonder then, that political powers use the curriculum as a tool to transmit their own ideology to the next generation of citizens. According to Kelly, obvious examples where this use of the curriculum is especially overt are totalitarian governments such as fascist Spain, Nazi Germany, and communist Russia. While these are extreme cases, each curriculum has a political and ideological dimension. A less overt manifestation of dominant ideologies in curricula is, for instance, 'the practice of adding to the school curriculum whatever happens to be a current fad or predilection of the government in power - for example 'Britishness'' (47). Although Kelly does not further explain the concept of 'Britishness', he possibly refers to the inclusion of 'British Values' - 'democracy, the rule of law, individual liberty, and mutual respect and tolerance of those with different faiths and beliefs' (The British Government 2014).

Flinders *et al.*'s (1986) have also added the dimension of the 'null curriculum'. Flinders *et al.* point towards the importance of investigating not only what is taught in the curriculum, but also in what is *not* taught. While it is educational 'common sense' (34) that it is impossible to include all possible knowledge in a school curriculum, the omissions can be as significant as inclusions. The null curriculum can comprise omissions of intellectual processes, content, and affect. In terms of processes, curricula may not provide for teaching students how to interpret art or music, but are likely to teach deductive reasoning. In terms of content, omissions may range from whole

subjects, to individual facts. For example, the subject of classical logic may not be included in every curriculum. An example of a factual omission would be teaching that the Native American population declined after European settlers arrived, but not teaching why this decline happened. In terms of affect, school curricula may provide for educational texts to be written in a detached style in order to prevent inducing emotions. The present study investigates the images of Scotland and its people in Scottish history textbooks. The aim is to find *who* is represented *how* and whether these representations reflect contemporary diversity.

Following these theoretical concepts, this study will understand the modern Scottish nation as an imagined community. This imagined community has a social imaginary, which explains how the people of Scotland understand their nation, its citizens, and its social practices. Identity will be seen a process of positioning between the sutures of social and agentive practices. The Scottish curriculum is investigated through official history textbooks. It is argued here that school textbooks are part of the official curriculum. Apple and Christian-Smith (1991) have called school textbooks 'curriculum artifacts' (4) because they deliver the contents of the curriculum into the classrooms. Textbooks represent part of the planned and formal dimensions of the curriculum, but not the hidden, received, and informal dimensions of the curriculum. However, the focus of the present research is precisely to investigate what is currently officially presented to students. The role of the curriculum in nationhood and identity is explained through the ideological and political dimensions of the curriculum. What is included in the current curriculum is approved of by the current dominant social group and has the power to perpetuate certain ideas and attitudes. Hence, the dominant social imaginary of the Scottish nation is presented in the official educational curriculum. The images of the nation and its citizens in the history textbooks are understood as manifestations of how Scotland currently imagines itself, its past, and its citizens.

Pupils in Scotland with migrant backgrounds position their identity at the sutures of social practices legitimised by the social imaginary and their own agentive powers. The social imaginary delineates the identities the pupil

assumes. This dissertation hence looks at which groups are included in the social imaginary constructed in official textbooks to find out who is officially depicted as a member of the Scottish nation.

Research Context

As outlined in Doherty (2008), the curriculum's role in constructing and instilling a particular national identity becomes especially obvious after political, social, and economic events which prompt nations to re-define and re-imagine themselves. The Scottish Independence Referendum of 2014 and the Brexit vote of 2016 are potentially such turning points. The Independence Referendum split Scotland into two: 55.3% voted against Scottish independence and 44.75% in favour (The Guardian 2014). Hild (2016) analyses political and media discourses which surrounded the Referendum by studying websites, leaflets, posters, videos, photographs of campaign meetings, and interviews. The pro-Independence campaign underlined and embraced the ethnic and cultural diversity of Scotland's people. Nicola Sturgeon's speech in the run up to the Referendum specifically points out that ethnicity is *not* a deciding factor in who gets to be 'Scottish', because 'Scotland [...] is a melting pot of different identities: Scottish, British, Pakistani, Irish, Polish and many more besides.' (Sturgeon 2013) The pro-Independence campaign painted a picture of civic nationalism in which a Scottish identity is not based on ethnicity or culture, but on the sharing of civic values. 'Civic nationalism' is 'based on the idea that people can willingly become part of the nation as long as they adhere to its core values and take part in the life of the society' (Hild 2016: 153). Hepburn (2015), in an analysis of the political discourses surrounding immigration in the lead-up to the Referendum, points out that the SNP can be characterised by a civic nationalism which supports and values ethnic diversity and immigration. Similarly, Hild argues that the oppositional anti-Independence campaign out forward a non-ethnic vision of civil nationalism in which a 'Scottish' identity is contained within an overarching 'British' identity.

In 2016, a majority of 52% voted to leave the EU. However, in Scotland, a majority of 62% voted to remain in the EU (Curtice 2016a). *British Social*

Attitudes (BSA) reports survey representative samples of the British population. The 2016 survey set out to investigate possible reasons as to why the British population voted to leave the EU. The survey found, *inter alia*, that 73% of respondents who had voted Leave were worried about the impacts of immigration on the UK (Curtice 2016a: 2). Immediately after the Brexit vote, Nicola Sturgeon announced: ‘We proved that we are a modern, outward looking and inclusive country and we said clearly that we do not want to leave the European Union.’ (BBC News 2016) But did Scots vote Remain because they were inclusive? A 2015 *Scottish Social Attitudes* (SSA) seems to suggest this to some degree. The survey found that 40% of Scottish respondents agreed with the statement ‘people from outside Britain who come to live in Scotland make the country a better place’ (SSA 2016). This is an increase from 2010, where 33% of respondents agreed with that statement. At the same time, 30% of respondents agreed that ‘people who come to Scotland from Eastern Europe take jobs away from other people in Scotland’ (ibid.). The only SSA survey concerning the Brexit vote asked respondents whether they felt Scottish or British. The fraction of Scottish voters who identify as Scottish rather than British has steadily risen from 2012 onwards, standing at 59% during the Referendum. However, it found its all-time high of 69% after the Brexit vote of 2016 (Curtice 2016b: 8). The survey does not investigate what respondents understand by feeling ‘Scottish’. It is therefore timely to investigate whom official textbook discourse presents as belonging to Scotland.

We can see that there are currently very different political discourses and social attitudes in Scotland, ranging from a ‘Scottish’/‘British’ distinction, to an understanding of civic nationalism and attitudes to immigration. This dissertation aims to investigate which, if any, of these discourses are present in the official educational curriculum.

CHAPTER 4

METHODOLOGY

This chapter will outline the methodology and present the sample of textbooks. The methods for analysis adopted here are Document Analysis (DA) and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). The choice of these methods will be justified and both methods will be defined. The choice of the sample will be guided by the methodological recommendations for textbook analysis found in the *UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and on Textbook Revision* (2010). Methodological limitations will also be addressed.

Bowen (2009) defines DA as the ‘systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents’ (27). The ‘document’ is defined as ‘text and images that have been recorded without a researcher’s intervention’ (ibid.). Bowen identifies the following advantages and disadvantages of DA. One benefit of using DA is that the data investigated is usually in the public domain, rendering data collection time- and cost-effective. Furthermore, documents remain stable throughout time and are usually not altered through research. Limitations of DA are that they have been written for purposes other than research and therefore may not be appropriate for academic investigations. Further, while many documents are easily accessible, some documents may be difficult to retrieve or decipher. In cases where an individual or group of individuals control access to documents, those documents which are easily available may be documents biased in favour of those who control their release. The documents analysed in the present investigation are history textbooks.

Contemporary Scottish textbooks can either be bought from retailers or borrowed from public libraries. While this provides for a relatively simple data *collection* process, data *selection* becomes more difficult. First, textbooks relevant to the research questions must be chosen, their contents must then be carefully scanned for relevant material, and finally, these contents must be systematically analysed. However, it is impossible to ascertain how the textbooks are actually used in practice by teachers and students. While this limitation could be addressed through interviews with teachers and students or through classroom observation, this is outside of the scope of the present investigation.

Here, it is useful to consider the six guidelines for textbook sampling offered in the *UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and on Textbook*

Revision (2010). First, the pedagogical contexts must be described. This entails investigating at which point in the educational trajectory the subject of the textbook is introduced and whether it is compulsory. It is also recommended to investigate who is in charge of writing the curricula and whether textbooks are the main or sole source of material used in the classrooms. Second, the *Guidebook* is explicit in recommending that the most widely used textbooks be investigated. There are two types of analyses which influence choice: vertical and horizontal. In a vertical analysis, the investigation aims to trace how the contents of textbooks have changed over time, and textbooks from various years should therefore be chosen. In a horizontal analysis, the investigation is interested in current or new representations, and should hence aim to cover as wide a sample as possible. Third, either a didactic or an analytic approach for the investigation should be followed: the didactic approach investigates pedagogic methods, the analytic method examines the contents of the text. Fourth, the financial resources at the disposition of authors and publishers need to be considered, as money may constrain the textbook's size, layout, and illustrations. The researcher should evaluate whether the textbook uses its resources effectively. Fifth, attention should be paid to the validity of the statements represented in the textbooks, as well as to the terms employed, the contexts depicted, how concepts are defined, and how periods of time are described. To determine that the claims made by the textbooks are valid, reference should be made to academic research. This fifth point summarises the focus of the present dissertation. Finally, the *Guidebook* recognises that the traditional authoritative structure of the textbooks is being replaced by a more discursive structure. Modern textbooks tend to focus less on the transmission of facts, and more on the learner's procedure of meaning making and understanding. In addition, Møeglin (2006) addresses whether textbooks are still relevant today, when the internet provides teachers and pupils with an easily available, seemingly endless stream of knowledge. Møeglin argues that textbooks are still relevant, because they are associated with authority and the knowledge they provide is considered legitimate. Information found on the internet lacks this legitimacy. The *Guidebook* asserts that **examination guidebooks** tend to retain a more authoritative structure than textbooks. They

‘condense the wide range of contents and skills into core elements, which can be seen as a canon of what really counts for getting good marks’ (UNESCO 2010: 50). Hence, revision guidebooks, where available, should also be investigated. These recommendations have informed the sample of textbooks investigated here.

History in the *Curriculum for Excellence*

In the Scottish education system, history is not taught as a separate subject until the fourth year of secondary school, known as ‘S4’. Prior to that, history exists only as a module within ‘Social Studies’ called ‘People, Past Events and Societies’. History is introduced as one of the subjects pupils can take in S4 in order to obtain a National qualification. In S4, these can be taken at three levels: National 3, 4, or 5, depending on the level of academic depth the pupil wishes to study the subject. The Scottish qualifications system is flexible, designed so that students can choose at which stage to take which qualification (McIvor 2014). The National qualifications are regulated by the SQA. Scottish pupils usually take the National 5 (N5) examinations at age sixteen, after which they can legally leave school. Although National Examinations are not compulsory in the Scottish school system, the N5 is taken by the largest number of students: in 2017, 295,083 pupils took N5 examinations (SQA 2017a). In comparison, 122,961 students sat the N4 examinations and 197,774 students sat Higher examinations (ibid.). Pupils have the choice of which and of how many subjects they wish to sit for the N5. SQA statistics show that, while Mathematics and English are by far the most popular subjects, History has emerged as the fifth most popular subject, after Biology and Chemistry, and is the most popular social science subject (ibid.). The course specifications for the National 5 history curriculum are summarised in a document freely available to download from the SQA website¹. The most recent course specification is for the 2017/18 academic session. The document states that the N5 history course comprises three main areas of study. These are:

¹ <https://www.sqa.org.uk/>

Scottish history, British history, and European and World history. A section within the Scottish history area is entitled 'Migration and Empire, 1830 - 1939', which rallies four 'Key Issues': Immigration to Scotland, 1830s - 1939, Experience of immigrants to Scotland, 1830s - 1939, Scottish emigration, 1830s - 1939, and Experience of Scots abroad, 1830s - 1939 (SQA 2017b: 7).

Sample

The importance of the N5 and the popularity of History is reflected on the national textbook market: all Scottish educational publishers offer N5 revision textbooks for History. History textbooks exist as revision guides for the N5 examination. The *Guidebook* recommends that the most widely used textbooks should be investigated. Here, the choice is complicated by the facts that textbook sales figures are not made available for the public. The three largest publishing houses of educational materials market are *Hodder Gibson*, *Leckie & Leckie*, and *BrightRED Publishing*. All three offer revision guidebooks for the N5 History examination. Education in Scotland is de-centralised, and different schools may offer different teaching practices. It is therefore possible that students buy the textbooks themselves for revision at home, or that schools buy the textbooks directly from the publishers for student use in class. However, only the books published by *Hodder Gibson* are officially endorsed by the SQA. As reported by Bain (2016), *Hodder Gibson* has linked the SQA endorsement with an increase in sales, suggesting that educationalists, parents, and/or pupils are more willing to use textbooks endorsed by the official examining authority. The present investigation aims to be horizontal and analytic. The focus is on the *contents* of *current* textbooks. It is therefore appropriate to choose the most recently published textbooks. This study furthermore aims to cover a cross-section of both SQA endorsed and non-endorsed history textbooks. This allows to explore whether the official endorsement prescribes a particular content. *Hodder Gibson* offers eight history textbooks for N5 revision. *Leckie & Leckie* is Scotland's largest educational publisher, currently offering two history textbooks for N5 revision. *BrightRED Publishing* is the largest independent educational publisher,

currently offering one history textbook for N5 revision. In order to narrow the sample to the most relevant textbooks, only those textbooks which explicitly mention migration into Scotland have been chosen. Textbooks focusing on Germany, the USA, the Slave Trade, and WWI have therefore been excluded. The sample is outlined in TABLE 1 below.

TABLE 1: Textbook sample for the present research.

Publisher	Title	Year Published	Author
Hodder Gibson	National 4 & 5: Migration and Empire 1830-1939*	2013	Simon Wood, Claire Wood
Leckie & Leckie	National 5 History - Course Notes	2014	Maxine Hughes, Chris Hume, Holly Robertson
BrightRED Publishing	National 5 History - Scotland	2014	Chris MacKay, Aileen MacKay

* indicates SQA endorsement.

Little information is available about the authors. An exploration with a search engine shows that Simon and Clare Wood are or have been history teachers in Scotland. This search yielded no results for Maxine Hughes, Chris Hume, Holly Robertson, and Chris and Aileen MacKay. These textbooks are the most recent editions available to the public. Here, it is important to address that these textbooks have been published before the Independence Referendum and the Brexit vote took place. As outlined above, Mao (1997; 2008) and Sakki (2010) have inscribed curricular and textbook contents within wider contexts of socio-political and economic sentiments which build up slowly and tend to persist. Therefore, these textbooks still have the potential to reflect the current social and political atmosphere which has precipitated the Referendum and the Brexit vote.

Methods

In order to analyse these books, all the passages of the textbooks which mention immigration will be identified. These passages will be analysed using Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). Fairclough and Wodak (1997) define CDA as

the analysis of 'real and often extended instances of social interaction which take a linguistic form, or a partially linguistic form' (25). They specify that the term 'discourse' in CDA generally refers to both text and speech. In *Language and Power*, Fairclough (1989) explains that all linguistic events are social because 'whenever people speak or listen or write or read, they do so in ways which are determined socially and have social effects' (23). Equally, 'social phenomena are linguistic' (23), because language shaped the way social practices are understood. To illustrate, this research will follow Fairclough's invitation to think about the word 'socialism' (23). How an individual or organisation understands this word can shape political actions. For example, a policy may be understood as being 'socialist' by a conservative party, but not by a socialist party. Fairclough and Wodak (1997) explain that discourse, through the ways in which it constitutes social situations and their objects and individuals, can contribute to the (re)production of unequal power relations (e.g. between genders, social classes, cultures, or ethnicities). The 'critical' in CDA refers to the aim of analyses to reveal how these power relationships appear in language, and how language perpetuates them (Fairclough and Wodak 1997).

Gee (2014) offers a useful conceptualisation of the terms 'D/discourse', which allows to connect the written text investigated in textbooks with the social reality of the Scottish classroom. Gee differentiates between 'discourse' on the one hand and 'Discourse' on the other hand. 'discourse' describes any linguistic, written or spoken communication. However, when communicating, people do not only use language - they also use 'clothes, gestures, bodies, environments, props, tools, technologies, objects, the social display of beliefs and values' (24). 'Discourse', with a capital 'D' describes these interactions which use 'both language and everything else at human disposal' (24). When individuals engage in a discursive event, they (try to) enact different roles. Gee calls these roles 'socially significant identities'. Socially significant identities are specific ways of being which are constructed, enacted, and recognised in different contexts by different people or groups. Each individual or group of individuals can have multiple, hybrid, partial, fluid, and/or contested socially significant identities, and these can change over time. Some identities have

conventional labels, such as 'African-American' or 'lawyer' (23), while others do not. Participants of a discursive event try to have certain socially significant identities recognised, and use both language and everything else which is at their disposal (body, clothes, environment) to have these identities recognised by others. The bid can be recognised, rejected, negotiated, or contested. Hence, 'Discourse' is 'communication through the lens of socially meaningful identities' (25).

Hence, when pupils read their history textbooks, they do not only read the discourse (in form of the written text), but they also engage in a Discourse. Their identity as a student in Scotland of a certain nationality and a certain ethnic background engages with the 'official' history of Scotland presented in these textbooks. CDA allows to explore the nature of this Discourse through the discourse.

Fairclough's (1989) ten questions for CDA

In *Language and Power*, Fairclough (1989) proposes ten questions to conduct CDA. These are divided into three linguistic aspects: vocabulary, grammar, and textual structure. Each aspect is investigated for its experiential, relational, and expressive values. **Experiential** value refers to indications in the text which demonstrate how the author or speaker experiences the natural and social environment. The **relational** value refers to the social relationships which are enacted in the text. The **expressive** value indicates how the producer of the text evaluates the individual, object, or event described - positively, negatively, or ambivalently. 'Text' in Fairclough (1989) describes both written and spoken discursive events.

Four questions should be asked of the text's vocabulary:

1) *What experiential values do words have?*

According to Fairclough, the choice of vocabulary in a text evidences the world-views of its producers. The underlying ideological framework of the text is therefore coded in its vocabulary. For example, using the word 'deprivation'

instead of 'selective granting' (113) can suggest that the author opposes the practice. The investigation of the experiential value of vocabulary items includes the examination of synonyms, re-occurring collocations, antonyms, or hyponyms.

2) *What relational values do words have?*

This question investigates how vocabulary is used to construct social relationships between individuals or groups of individuals. Vocabulary should be examined for negative and positive values. Euphemisms, for example, can be used to avoid negative values and may contribute to constructing a more positive relationship between participants. Words expressing formality can be used to express varying degrees of social distance between individuals, as well as deference or disregard of social status.

3) *What expressive values do words have?*

This question investigates expressive values in order to reveal the ideological framework of a text. Words expressing negative or positive evaluations can indicate the text producer's opinions.

4) *What metaphors are used?*

Rather than being a literary flourish, Fairclough associates metaphors with the representation of an experience in terms of another. For example, the fact that illness is often metaphorically presented as a battle indicates how society tends to think about illness. The choice of a particular metaphor over another expresses the way a person, object, or event is seen.

Four questions should be asked of the text's grammar:

5) *What experiential values do grammatical features have?*

Fairclough argues that grammar encodes events and relationships, the people (or animals) involved in these events and relationships, as well as the spatial

and temporal circumstances in which events and relationships take place. The circumstance is often described in the sentence's adjunct. Processes describe the actions happening in sentences; participants are the people or things who act or who are acted upon. There are three main types of processes: actions, events, and attributions. Each of these presupposes different configurations of participants. An **action** involves two participants, one of which acts, and one which is acted upon. An **event** involves one participant and one action. An **attribution** involves one participant and an attribute. The investigation of processes and participants entails finding out who or what has agency, and thus, who is ascribed responsibility for performing an action.

6) *What relational values do grammatical features have?*

Fairclough identifies three **modes**: declarative, grammatical question, and imperative. Here too, every modes presupposes a different positioning of the subject, and therefore accords the subject different levels of power and agency. In **declaratives**, the subject gives information and therefore has power. In **grammatical questions**, the subject is asking for information, and the addressee is in a position of power of supplying it. In **imperatives**, the subject has the power to demand that actions be performed. Further, modal verbs can signal authority and obligation between participants. For instance, the modal verb 'must' frequently supposes a relationship of authority and obligation. Pronouns too can have relational values. Pronouns can include or exclude the reader/addressee, and the use or avoidance of personal pronouns can indicate familiarity or impersonality, respectively.

7) *What expressive values do grammatical features have?*

Here, Fairclough only discusses modality. Modal auxiliaries (e.g. may, could, must) can also indicate whether the author/speaker views something as, for instance, a possibility, a certainty, or an obligation, a permission.

8) *How are (simple) sentences linked together?*

This question investigates how sentences are linked together through conjunctions such as 'and' or 'but'. The conjunction 'therefore' for example supposes that two events have a cause-effect relationship. Coordination and subordination of sentences can construct a hierarchy of information. In coordination, two simple sentences are linked together and equal importance is allocated to both. In subordination, one sentence is foregrounded and the other backgrounded.

Finally, two questions should be asked about textual structure:

9) *What interactional conventions are used?*

This question investigates conventions of spoken conversations. One aspect is that of turn-taking, i.e. the convention of speakers to 'take-turns' whilst communicating. If speakers have equal levels of power, they decide themselves when to take turns. If one speaker is superior in power, then this superior participant usually controls the turn-taking, for example through interruption, changing the topic, asking questions, and re-wording statements of other participants.

10) *What larger scale structures does the text have?*

The structure of the text usually dictates which elements it contains and how these elements are ordered. For instance, a newspaper article and an incident report contain different elements which are structured in different ways. These structures influence how a text is received and interpreted.

The advantage of Fairclough's ten questions for the present research is that they provide a tool for the systematic analysis of schoolbook texts. Question 8) is irrelevant because the aim of this dissertation is to equally investigate all lexical depictions of immigrant groups, regardless of any hierarchies of information. Question 9) is irrelevant because it relates to spoken discourse. Similarly question 10) can be dismissed because the larger scale structure is always that of the textbook.

The present investigation condenses the seven relevant questions into three aspects: **Attributes**, **Processes**, and **Circumstances**. The analysis will identify all named immigrant groups in the textbooks. These groups take on the role of the **participant**. '**Attributes**' refers to the vocabulary used to describe the immigrant groups. As Fairclough argues, attributes can be adjectives or nouns. Every adjective and noun describing the participant will be categorised as 'attribute'. The analysis of this aspect includes the investigation of experiential, relational, expressive, and metaphorical values of the vocabulary. '**Attributes**' corresponds to questions 1), 2), 3), 4) and 5) outlined above. '**Processes**' describes the actions which the participants perform or which are performed on them. This includes analysis whether verb forms are active or passive. Adverbs have been included in this category. This aspect corresponds to questions 5), 6), and 7). '**Circumstances**' describes the spatial and temporal situations in which participants and processes take place. As Fairclough points out, these are often coded in adjuncts. However, the distinction between what is an adjunct, which provides dispensable meaning, and an argument, which provides indispensable meaning and generally includes the object of the verb, is not straightforward (see e.g. Tutunjian and Boland (2008) who have argued that these distinctions are redundant). This dissertation defines as 'circumstance' phrases which provide additional information to an action or event. '**Circumstances**' corresponds to aspects of question 5).

Limitations of CDA

One criticism levelled against CDA is that CDA can be used to criticise texts which do not fit within a researcher's ideological standpoint. CDA researchers can theoretically choose any random element of a text and argue that it demonstrates an underlying ideology or power relationship. Widdowson (1998) criticises a CDA of a newspaper article conducted by Fairclough. He argues that Fairclough focuses on one word ('killer riot', in Widdowson's example) around which he constructs his argument. Widdowson (1998) shows that by focusing on a different word (here, 'elaborate' and its collocations), the text throws up an entirely different power dynamic. Verschueren (2001)

agrees with Widdowson (1998) and states that the tendency for unsystematic analysis in CDA can lead to researchers *imposing* a framework on the data, rather than objectively investigating the data for underlying ideologies and power relations.

Hence, the researcher bias must be addressed. Johnson describes the researcher bias (1997) as the process during which ‘the researchers find what they want to find, and then [...] write up the results’ (283). According to Johnson, researcher bias often stems from selective observation and recording of data, followed by letting personal expectations affect interpretation. The present study will address these limitations by choosing all textbook passages which evoke immigration and settlement, to ensure that text sampling is purposeful. These passages will then be systematically analysed according to the seven questions outlined above. Johnson (1997) argues that ‘reflexivity’ (284) can further minimise researcher bias. Reflexivity, or self-awareness, involves the researcher’s critical engagement with their own personal biases. This leads to understanding and the ability to control the researcher bias during the stages of this research. I therefore aim to be aware of my own experience as immigrant student and not let it guide the findings.

A limitation of compressing of Fairclough’s ten questions into attributes, processes, and circumstances is that it does not allow to investigate sentences in which immigrant groups are not one of the participants. It nevertheless allows for a focused investigation of immigrant groups.

CHAPTER 5

ANALYSIS

This chapter illustrates the analysis process. Using the methodology established in above, the three textbooks have been systematically analysed. First, relevant chapters in the textbooks have been identified. Wood and Wood’s (2013) *SQA endorsed Migration and Empire 1830-1939*, is divided in four chapters. Relevant for the present investigation are the chapters ‘Immigration

to Scotland, 1830s-1939’ and ‘Experience of immigrants to Scotland 1880s-1939’. In MacKay and MacKay’s (2014) *N5 - History Scotland*, the chapter, ‘Migration and Empire, 1830 - 1939’ and in Hughes *et al.*’s (2014) *National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes*, the chapter ‘Scottish: Migration and Empire, 1830 - 1939 are relevant. The chapter titles in all textbooks exactly follow the SQA History course specification document. The focus of the content analysis was on main text passages, as shown in FIGURE 1 below.

SECTION 1

Why were Irish people forced to come to Scotland?


Poverty was the main reason Irish people were forced to come to Scotland – this is called a **push factor**. Most Irish people did not own their own land. From the little money that they earned, they had to pay rent to landlords who often did not live on their lands. If anyone was unable to pay rent, they would be removed from the land and so might emigrate. Many Irish **smallholders** were pushed off the land when landowners wanted to make their own lands bigger so that they could use modern machinery.

Another reason that Irish people were forced to move was because of the growing population in Ireland. In the 50 years before 1841, the population doubled to eight million. There was not enough agriculture and industry in Ireland to support the population so many had to leave.

The third reason why Irish people left was because of lack of opportunities in Ireland. Irish industry was not growing strongly and so did not provide work. In the nineteenth century, the Irish textile industry suffered in comparison to Britain because British factories made cloth more cheaply. This meant that Irish people working in these industries left to earn more money in Britain.

GLOSSARY
Push factor a reason that forces people to move abroad
Smallholders farmers renting a small area of land from a landlord

Describe two ways the picture shows how poor farm workers were in Ireland.



The interior of an Irish house during the 1830s.

4

FIGURE 1: Scanned page from *Migration and Empire 1830-1939* with red outline showing the main text passage analysed. (Wood and Wood 2013: 4)

One immigrant group has been identified in all three textbooks: the Italians. Some passages are analysed below.

Example: Italians

Migration and Empire 1830 - 1939

1. Why Did Italian People Come To Scotland And Where Did They Settle?

Italian immigration to Scotland was at its height between 1890 and 1914 and the Italian population increased from 750 to over 4500 people. Most of the Italians who came to Scotland came from two areas of Italy: Lucca in the North and Frosinone and Abruzzo in the south. There was a long tradition of seasonal migration to Scotland from these areas. However, when the population of Italy increased in the late nineteenth century, it became harder to make a living. Some people left Italy and some of these people found their way to Scotland. (Wood and Wood 2013: 12)

N5 History - Scotland

2. Life in Scotland For Italians

The newly arrived Italian community was involved in a variety of occupations in Scotland. The most obvious were the Italian cafés, chip shops and restaurants that spread across Scotland. They also sold ice cream on the streets from barrows. Their cry was '*gelati ecco un poco*', and they became known as the 'hokey pokey' men.²(MacKay and MacKay 2014: 64)

3. **Source C** is an extract from *Who belongs to Glasgow?* By Mary Edward. It describes some of the occupations of Italians in Scotland. (MacKay and MacKay 2014: 64)

The publication of La Scozia ('a paper for the Italian colony in Scotland') in 1908 demonstrated that there were several other Italian businesses and organisations in Glasgow, including an Italian language school for adults and children in Union Street ... in one family the father worked

² This roughly translates to 'a bit of ice cream here'. No translation is given by MacKay and MacKay (2014).

as a miner, in another the men of the family worked on the railways ... although the café business was still predominant, in 1928 a college of Italian hairdressers opened in Glasgow, and many Italians are still associated with this kind of business. (MacKay and MacKay 2014: 65)

Passage 3. shows that the authors have quoted an extract from another book. Quoted passages will be presented, as in the original, in italics.

National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes

4. Italians began arriving in Scotland in larger numbers after 1880. Many were looking to escape extreme poverty, low wages, poor living conditions and the droughts that often caused food shortages in Italy. All these factors convinced many Italians to seek a better life abroad. (Hughes *et al.* 2014: 11)
5. Italians did not engage significantly with politics in Scotland. In the 1920s and 1930s some Italians associated themselves with Mussolini's Fascist Party, leading to some clashes with Scots when Second World War broke out. (Hughes *et al.* 2014: 22)

TABLE 2 illustrates how the above five passages have been analysed. To streamline the analysis, only the words 'Italian', 'Italians', and (pro)nouns directly replacing these are used as participants. As 'Attribute' has been identified every adjective or noun which describes the participant. Cases of predicative adjectives, that is, of adjectives which modify a subject via a verb, and of nominal predicatives, in which a noun modifies the subject via a verb, have been included in this category.³ An example of a nominal predicative is in the clause 'they therefore became known as the 'hokey pokey' men.' (MacKay and MacKay 2014: 64). 'hokey pokey' men' is an attribute because it modifies the subject 'they'. 'Processes' includes all verbs in clauses in which the participant is either the agent or the object. Hence, in the sentence 'Some people left Italy and some of these people found their way to Scotland' (Wood and Wood 2013: 12), the processes are 'left' and 'found'. 'Circumstances' here applies to adjuncts, or those parts of the sentence which provide additional

³ 'modify' here is used in the grammatical sense of 'adding meaning to'.

meaning to the sentence. For instance, in ‘They also sold ice cream on the streets from barrows’ (MacKay and MacKay 2014: 24), ‘ice-cream on the street from barrows’ provides additional information and is therefore identified as circumstantial.

TABLE 2. Analysis of the main text according to ‘attributes’, processes’, and ‘circumstances’. Italics indicate that the authors of the textbook quoted a passage from another source.

Participant	Attributes	Processes	Circumstances	Page
Migration and Empire 1830 - 1939 (Wood and Wood 2013)				
Italian(s)	Immigration to Scotland	was	at its height between 1890 and 1914	12
	Population	increased	from 750 to over 4500 people	12
	most	came	to Scotland ... from two areas of Italy	12
	some	left	Italy	12
	some	found	their way to Scotland	12
N5 History - Scotland (MacKay and MacKay 2014)				
Italian(s)	Newly arrived community	was involved	in a variety of occupations in Scotland	64
		sold	ice cream on the streets from barrows	64
	the ‘hokey pokey’ men	became known as		64
	street traders	soon set up	cafés	

	entrepreneurs			64
	not all	entered	the catering trade	64
	<i>many</i>	<i>are still associated</i>	<i>with this kind of business</i>	65
National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes				
Italians		began arriving	in Scotland in larger numbers after 1880	11
	Many	were looking to escape	extreme poverty, low wages, poor living conditions and the droughts that often caused food shortages in Italy	11
	many	to seek	a better life abroad	11
		did not engage significantly	with politics in Scotland	22
	some	associated	themselves with Mussolini's Fascist Party ... in the 1920s and 1930s... leading to some clashes with Scots when Second World War broke out	22

This framework of analysis has been applied systematically to all relevant main text passages in all three textbooks. The resulting tables can be found in APPENDIX 1.

CHAPTER 6

FINDINGS

This chapter provides an overview of the findings. These will then be situated in the context of historical research into immigrant groups in Scotland. Finally, the main and secondary research questions will be re-iterated and answered. Four immigrant groups are depicted across the data: Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanian.

Irish

In Wood and Wood (2013), attributes of quantity, such as ‘many’ and ‘large number/s’ describe the large amount of Irish who came to Scotland. Attributes also identify the Irish as reapers, harvest labourers, and seasonal farm hands. One re-occurring trade associated with the Irish is that of the navigator, or ‘navvy’, designating a type of labourer working on canals or railways. Processes initially suggest the coming and going of seasonal workers, alternating between the verbs ‘came’, ‘worked’, and ‘returned’. When crops failed due to the potato blight, Irish farmers ‘were forced to come to Scotland’ (3), ‘were pushed off the land’ (4), and ‘were evicted from their homes’ (5). Passive constructions suggest that they had little choice or agency in their emigration. Secondary sources consist of 19th century newspaper articles and interviews with local Scots. These allow the authors to depict the attitudes the local population held towards the Irish. On the one hand, the Scots had a generally positive attitude of the Irish work ethic. An employer praises the Irish as willing workers who ‘*labour harder*’ (7) than the Scots. On the other hand, the Scottish population had generally low opinion of Irish. They ‘gained a reputation as strike breakers’ (31) and Irish navigators, who had a ‘bad

reputation for drunken behaviour' (31), were labelled as 'heavy drinkers' (28). Navvies 'were considered a problem by the Scots' (31). According to a newspaper article, the immigrants '*could hardly be recognised as human*' (27) and that they were '*picking up food that even animals*' (27) would not eat. Finally, the distinction between Catholic and Protestant Irish is underlined. While the Gaelic-speaking Catholic were perceived as a 'threat to the Protestant Scottish way of life' (31), Protestants tended to blend in. The depiction of Irish immigrants ends positively, with the authors explaining that the Irish were important for the economic development of Scotland. Many of them became 'skilled workers' (33) who were 'needed and recruited' (33) to build Scotland's canals and railways. Fairclough (1989) states that vocabulary expressing positive or negative evaluations can indicate the author's opinion. Here, the authors of the textbook cite secondary sources to express negative evaluations, while they underline the importance of the Irish for Scotland.

MacKay and MacKay's (2014) mostly use adjectives and nouns indicating large quantities, such as 'many', 'hundreds', 'influx', and 'flood'. Attributes designating employment are 'seasonal workers' (66), 'tattie-howkers' (a colloquial expression designating potato farmers) (66), labourers, textile workers, and 'navvies'. MacKay and MacKay employ the same strategy as Wood and Wood (2013) in both describing the Irish themselves and quoting contemporary sources depicting Irish immigrants. Here, the authors use some words with negative evaluations, such as 'the poorest of the poor' (68), 'scapegoats for the urban problems' (68), and 'drunken navvies' (69). The phrase 'gaining a reputation' reports how the immigrants were perceived by the native population. Hence, they gained a reputation of being 'disease carriers' (68), they 'quickly gained a reputation for trouble' (69), and 'got the reputation' (69) of breaking strikes. A news report condemns the Irish as '*dirty and less well clothed than the native population*' (68). Processes and circumstances initially suggest a large and continuous movement towards Scotland: 'had been coming' (66), 'flocked' (66), and 'flooded' (67). During the Potato Famine, the Irish 'were evicted' (66) from their homes. The passive construction obscures the agents responsible for the eviction and suggests an unequal power relationship in which the Irish are the weaker participant. In

terms of religious differences, processes related to Catholics describe how they only spoke Gaelic and ‘began to produce’ (69) football teams. Irish Protestants ‘did not face the same difficulties’ (69) as their Catholic counterparts.

Attributes in Hughes *et al.* (2014) identify the Irish as farmers and tenants, but also as priests. During the Potato Famine, many Irish ‘were thrown off their land’ (8) and ‘starved to death’ (9). Circumstances describe Scotland as a country where ‘there were jobs for them all’ (9) and where they ‘had family and friends’ (10) who had emigrated there earlier. Processes describing the Irish settlement portray them simultaneously as in power and powerless. Hence, while the Irish chose to settle across the central belt where there were jobs, they were also ‘forced to settle’ (15) in the slums. Negative evaluations are mixed with positive ones in the description of the Irish work ethic. Although they were ‘uneducated and unskilled’ (16), the Irish ‘were willing to work’ (16) and found ‘unskilled jobs in factories, textiles, mines and railway construction’ (16). In describing religion, processes portray both Catholics and Protestants as agents. The Catholic Irish tended to vote for the Labour party, contributing to the Party’s rise in Scotland and the Protestants ‘mixed well with native Scots’ (17).

Italians

In Wood and Wood (2013), the most common attributes describing the Italian groups are ‘community’ and ‘family’ - possibly evidencing the close-knit social networks Italians formed in and outside of Italy. Secondary sources consist mostly of interviews of Italian immigrants themselves. This enables the authors to depict the immigrant experience. A 19th century Italian immigrant states that Scots would call Italians ‘*aliens*’, ‘*foreigners*’, and ‘*Tallies*’ (42), suggesting that Italian immigrants were to some extent disparaged by the local population. Processes and circumstances such as ‘came to Scotland’ (12) and ‘left Italy’ (12) ascribe a purposeful agency to Italians. Passive processes explain why Italians arrived in Scotland. They were attracted to Scotland ‘by recruiting agents working for *padroni* (employers or patrons) based in London’ (13). The latter are also the reason why Italians ‘came to be so connected’

(13) with the ice cream trade. This suggests that some were ‘pushed’ into this trade rather than choosing to go into it.

MacKay and MacKay (2014) reference named families, known to Scottish audiences today as names of ice cream parlours: ‘Equii’, ‘Jaconelli’, and ‘Nardini’ (64). Italians are the agents of most processes, which suggests that they were in power to make their own decision to leave. While most ‘flocked to the USA’, many also ‘came to Britain’ (64). They ‘used agents (padroni)’ (64) to secure work in Britain - they were not used by the padroni. Although the majority of Italians came from peasant backgrounds, they became street traders and opened cafés in Scotland. They are therefore described as ‘entrepreneurs’ (64). It is argued that this word has a relatively positive evaluations, suggesting someone who is in charge. Other processes and circumstances present Italians as a small and close-knit community which ‘experienced less prejudice’ (65) than other immigrant groups.

In Hughes *et al.* (2014), attributes consist mostly of adjectives and nouns describing quantity, such as ‘many’ and ‘a significant number’ (12). In explaining the arrival of Italians in Scotland, Hughes *et al.* (2014) employ the active processes of ‘arriving’ (11), ‘looking to escape’ (11), and ‘seek[ing] a better life’ (11). Scotland is described as an attractive country which caused many Italians to stay: they ‘were attracted’ (12) by Scotland’s ‘higher wages, better living conditions and a more stable jobs market’ (12).

Jews

Attributes in Wood and Wood (2013) describe two types of immigrants: one type was ‘educated and wealthy’ (13), the other type was ‘Yiddish-speaking’ (13). Processes throughout the Jewish narrative consist of active processes, depicting them as in control of their actions. Circumstances explain that it was the latter group of Jewish immigrants who came ‘to escape persecution and poverty in Eastern Europe’ (13). While most ‘sailed on to start a new life in the USA’ (13), others settled in Scotland, especially in Glasgow.

In MacKay and MacKay (2014), attributes initially describe the small number of Jews living in Scotland prior to 1881. Of the ‘only around 200’ (62)

in Edinburgh, most were 'prosperous' (62) 'Dutch or German business men' (62). Processes alternate between active and passive constructions. Initially, the small community of Jews in Glasgow took action by setting up a synagogue and buying land 'to use as a graveyard' (62). The group of Jews who came after 1881 'fled from the pogroms and persecution' (62) in Eastern Europe. They settled in the cheapest areas of Glasgow, the Gorbals. Passive processes relate predominantly to persecution and the fate of Jewish children. After WWI, more Jewish immigrants arrived from Germany, where they 'were blamed for Germany's defeat in the Great War' (62). During WWII, Jewish children 'were sent' from Europe to 'youth hostels, foster families or farms' (62) in Britain. Processes and circumstances further point out that Jewish immigrants looked out for their own community. They tended not to rely on help from Scottish organisations but from the Jewish community. However, they were accused of unsavoury business practices, such as running 'sweat shops' (62). They became wealthier, with many moving 'to better housing in the West End of the city' (62). The authors quote a 20th century interview with a Scottish resident, who states that Jews '*were flourishing and showing off a bit*' (63), which made them unpopular with Glaswegians.

Hughes *et al.* (2014) use attributes of quantity to describe how the Jewish community grew, but clarify that it was 'never large' (21). Here too, Jews are primarily put in charge of their actions. They 'were escaping religious persecution' and 'were leaving because of economic persecution' (11). Most came to Glasgow and settled 'where accommodation was cheap' (21). Hughes *et al.* describe Jewish immigrants as 'hawkers and peddlers' (21) and door-to-door salespeople. Their enterprising spirit is furthermore suggested when it is described that they 'set up businesses as tailors, bakers, watchmakers and jewellers' (21). This additionally points out that they were skilled craftsmen.

Lithuanians

Wood and Wood (2013) write that, on the one hand, Lithuanians 'were forced to leave because of persecution by the Russian government' (12). On the other hand, they 'were attracted by work in the coalmines [...] around

Coatbridge near Glasgow' (11). However, a stronger process is also described: some Lithuanians 'were persuaded to go to Scotland' (12) by employers who wanted to break miners' strikes. A quoted interview with a descendant of Lithuanian immigrants illustrates their dilemma. Only their journey to Scotland was paid for by employers. Once there, they '*had no money*' (12) to sail on to the USA or to go back home. Scotland was to be 'a stepping-stone' (12) *en route* to the USA. Lithuanians accommodated their Scots employers by changing their Slavic surnames to easier to pronounce Anglicised ones. The authors link this name-change to a loss of Lithuanian identity. Attributes describe how Lithuanians were called "'dirty poles'" (41) by Scottish peers. Their reputation improved when they 'joined with Scots in campaigning for better pay and conditions' (41). A passive construction describes how the distinct Lithuanian community disappeared when they 'were eventually absorbed into the local community' (41).

Hughes *et al.* (2014) describe Lithuanian immigrants as 'economic migrants' (11), 'desperate to escape the crushing poverty at home' (11). Processes depict them taking purposeful action to leave Lithuania 'in search of a better life' (11) and to escape conscription into the Russian army. Processes and circumstances divide Lithuanian immigrants in Scotland into two camps: those who only 'bought tickets for Scotland' (11) because they wanted a cheap stopping-off point on their journey to the US, and those who 'planned to settle in Scotland from the beginning' (12). The latter were 'hoping to find jobs in coal mines and factories' (20). They were 'easy targets' (20) for the local population to harass. Lithuanians changed their surnames 'to local sounding names in an attempt to integrate' (20) better into Scottish society. Processes also suggest social mobility. Lithuanians 'moved out of the mines and factories' (20) and opened businesses. They 'joined the Independent Labour Party' (22) to campaign for better conditions for workers.

Hence, representations of individual immigrant groups do not vary significantly between the textbooks. While the SQA endorsed *Migration and Empire* (Wood and Wood 2013) contains longer narratives than the other two books, it does not differ significantly in content. What is significant however, is the fact the Lithuanian immigrant groups are completely omitted in

BrightRED's National 5 History by MacKay and MacKay (2014). It is possible that the Lithuanians, who are described as the smallest immigrant community in the other two textbooks, do not appear due to their low numbers in Scotland.

The UNESCO *Guidebook's* fifth recommendation includes the investigation of academic research in order to assure that the claims made by the textbooks are accurate. In addition, Flinders *et al.*'s (1986) concept of the 'null curriculum' states that it is important to investigate what is not included in the curriculum. Investigating every claim made by the textbooks would be outside of the scope of the present dissertation. However, the null curriculum can be appraised by examining immigrant groups which are attested in historical research but have not been represented in any of the textbooks.

Immigration to Scotland

Dunlop and Miles (1990) draw together evidence from company censuses and newspaper articles to investigate the presence of South and East Asian, African, and Caribbean immigrants in Scotland. They find that these immigrants were present in Scottish society from at least the middle of the nineteenth century onwards. For once, Scottish civil servants, missionaries, merchants, and militaries who have been to the colonies would return to Scotland with their Caribbean or Indian slaves and servants. Glaswegian newspaper articles from the nineteenth century mention the presence of runaway or abandoned slaves and servants of colonial origin. Further, the fact that a 'black' (148) music hall performer appears on the record of a Glaswegian poorhouse record, suggests the presence of African or Caribbean immigrants. 19th century business records also show that a small number of Indians worked as eye-specialists in Edinburgh. An Indian man who emigrated to Glasgow in the 1880s founded the 'Lascar Mission in Glasgow', a charity for Indian seamen in Glasgow which ran until 1922. Additionally, the sons of wealthy Indians were sent to the universities of Glasgow and Edinburgh to study. An Edinburgh Indian Association for students was founded in 1883. Since at least the 1920s, students of Indian and Caribbean origin were refused entry into dance halls in Edinburgh, 'on account of their

racial origin' (161). This practice was raised as a problem in the House of Commons. In 1903, a third of nightly boarders in *Glasgow Sailor's Home* were listed as being of seamen of Indian origin. The Home's report also indicated the presence of Chinese, African, and Caribbean boarders. In the 1920s, the *Motherwell Times* wrote that Glasgow 'had been literally besieged with numbers of Lascars or Indian natives seeking work in various local industrial centres' (quoted in Dunlop and Miles 1990: 152).

Thus, although exact numbers are impossible to assess, immigrants of Asian, Caribbean, and African origin have been present in Scotland from the eighteenth century onwards. Their presence was prominent enough to have warranted newspaper articles and parliamentary questions.

Answering the Research Questions

The research questions will now be re-iterated and answered. The sub research questions allow to answer the main research questions. The sub questions were:

**Are different nations and/or groups of people represented in the textbooks?
If so, who are they?**

Different nationalities are indeed represented in all three textbooks. Scotland is described as a country of immigration. Immigrants hail from Europe, from Ireland, Italy, Eastern Europe, and Lithuania. Scots are also depicted in the narratives of all four immigrant groups. While Wood and Wood (2013) and Hughes *et al.* (2014) describe Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanians immigrants, the Lithuanian group is completely omitted in *BrightRED's National 5 History* by MacKay and MacKay (2014).

What are the contents of the different representations?

The Irish are portrayed as uneducated, unskilled, and poor, but also as hard workers. Grammatical processes underline that they had little choice in

leaving their country. Once in Scotland, they took charge in settling where they could find employment, although they had little choice but to live in slums. The Scots employers welcomed the hard-working Irish, but most of the population held them in disregard, thinking them violent, drunk, diseased. Catholics experienced discrimination, while Protestants are described as integrating easily. All three textbooks point towards the impacts the Irish made on Scotland's industry and politics. The **Italian** narratives depict them as a small, close-knit community. While all textbooks agree that they took action in leaving Italy, Wood and Wood (2013) depict them as having become involved in café businesses due to recruiting agents, while MacKay and MacKay (2014) portray them as entrepreneurs. There were two groups of **Jewish** immigrants: well-educated and wealthy businessmen and poorer, Yiddish-speaking Jews who were fleeing from Eastern Europe. The latter group settled in Glasgow, where they, 'flourished'. Although they are described as victims of persecution, Jewish immigrants are generally depicted as in power of their actions. They set up businesses and helped other members of the community. **Lithuanians** are described as forced out of Lithuania due to Russian persecution. While some were attracted by employment opportunities, others were paid to settle in Scotland by future employers. Initially discriminated against, Lithuanians anglicised their Slavic surnames and became active in unions. They assimilated well - so well, in fact, that a distinct Lithuanian community eventually disappeared. **Scots** also appear in the immigrant narratives. They are described as discriminating the Irish for breaking strikes and being Catholics, as being jealous of successful Jewish immigrants, and as using derogatory terms towards Italians and Lithuanians.

What attributes are attached to different groups?

The **Irish** are described across all three textbooks as seasonal workers, agricultural labourers, workers, 'navvies', but also as strike breakers. Across all textbooks, it is made clear that there were 'many' of them, that they were a 'flood', an 'influx', 'large numbers'. The attributes 'poor', 'uneducated', 'unskilled', and 'drunk' also re-occur across the data. Historical sources

describe them as ‘a separate race, ‘dirty, ‘drunken’, ‘violent’, and ‘disease-carriers’. **Italian** immigrants are described as ‘entrepreneurs’, ‘street traders’, ‘‘hokey pokey’ men’, but also as ‘aliens’, ‘foreigners’, and ‘Tallies’. The **Jewish** narratives across the data ascribes the group very positive attributes, such as ‘educated’, ‘wealthy’, and ‘prosperous’. Attributes describe **Lithuanian** as ‘easy targets’ for local Scots, who called them ‘dirty poles’. As Scots are not described directly, no attributes are attached to them.

The main research questions can now be answered.

What images of Scotland and its people(s) are constructed in Scottish history textbooks?

In the three textbooks, Scotland is depicted as a country of immigration. Although Scotland is depicted as attractive to immigrants because of its employment opportunities, high wages, and safety from persecution, many immigrant groups had planned to only stay in Scotland temporarily and sail on to the USA. In MacKay and MacKay (2014), Scottish society ‘absorbs’ (41) the Lithuanian immigrant group. Here, Scotland is not a cultural mosaic, but a ‘monoculture’ into which one eventually integrates.

The people of Scotland consist of native Scots and Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanian immigrants. The images constructed of the native Scots is often negative. They resented the Irish and Lithuanian workers for working for lower wages, while Scottish employers welcomed their cheap labour. The Catholic Irish were especially scorned by the Scots, who made them responsible for the urban problems the Irish fell victims to. By contrast, images of the individual immigrant groups are sympathetic, outlining the struggles of immigration. The Irish are described as often having had no other choice but to come to Scotland and settle in slums. They were discriminated against because they were many, Catholic, and Gaelic-speaking, but all they wanted to do was to work. Italians are hard-working entrepreneurs who maintained close-knit social networks. Jewish narratives are stories of surviving persecution, mutual aid, and upwards mobility. Lithuanian narratives outline loss of identity, resilience, and eventual

complete integration.

Hence, Scotland and its people in history textbooks constructs Scotland as a country of immigration, but not always as the first choice of immigrants. Images of local Scots are negative, portraying exploitation, discrimination, and jealousy. This is contrasted with the construction of sympathetic images of the immigrant groups.

How do Scottish history textbooks represent the growing diversity in the Scottish population?

The textbooks investigated here did not depict any non-European immigrants in Scotland. Dunlop and Miles (1990) have however confirmed the presence of non-European immigrants in Scotland from the 18th century onwards. On the one hand, it appears reasonable to concentrate on the immigrant groups which present the largest numbers. It is also true that the Irish, Jewish, Italian, and Lithuanian immigrants and their impacts on Scotland are well-researched (e.g. Maitles 1995; Dzialtuvaite 2006; Audrey 2017). On the other hand, considering that the presence of South and East Asian immigrants have been interesting enough to have warranted newspaper articles and parliamentary questions, it is surprising that they are completely absent in the three history textbooks investigated here. Considering that increasing numbers of children of Asian immigrants are sitting in Scottish classrooms today, it would be reasonable to show that immigrants of non-European origin have been present in Scotland for centuries. Of course, a counter-argument here would be that the numbers of non-white pupils in Scottish classrooms are low compared to the white majority. But, as Floella Benjamin's (2018) statements suggest, it is important for minorities to be recognised in official texts. However, the textbooks do call attention to the discrimination and difficulties of the immigrant. They depict the low opinions the Scots had of the newcomers and explain that immigrants were often made responsible for social and economic problems. They show that immigrants were made responsible for lowering wages, that they threatened the way of life of the local population,

that they were thought of as poor, violent, dirty. These issues are still very relevant today. The narratives of the immigrants are sympathetic and portray resilience and the contribution immigrants made to Scottish society.

Hence, Scottish textbooks represent the growing diversity in the Scottish population, not by depicting the history of Asian and Black immigrants in Scotland, but by depicting the experiences, struggles, and successes of immigrant groups in the past.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

This concluding chapter will broadly summarise this dissertation. The research findings will be conceptualised in terms of the theoretical framework and situated against the literature review. Implications for history teachers will be outlined and research limitations will be addressed. Finally, suggestions for further research will be given. This dissertation has set out to investigate how immigrant groups are depicted in Scottish history textbook. The aim was to investigate if and how Scotland's growing diversity is reflected in its history textbooks. This investigation takes place at the backdrop of a currently turbulent political landscape which produces varying discourses around nationhood and immigration. The theoretical framework has united the concepts of identity, nation, and curriculum. This framework has allowed to conceptualise Scotland as an imagined community with shared social imaginary. This imaginary creates an understanding of who is a member of the nation and who is not. History textbooks, as vehicles of the formal curriculum, present the social imaginary to pupils by presenting them with the narrative of the nation and its members. Following recommendations in the *UNESCO Guidebook* for textbook research, three of the most recent history textbooks by Scotland's major educational publishers have been investigated. In order to ensure purposeful sampling, only chapters relevant to immigration in Scotland have been analysed. Fairclough's ten questions for CDA were condensed into 'Attributes', 'Processes', and 'Circumstances'. This dissertation has found that

four immigrant groups are depicted in history textbooks: Irish, Italian, Jewish and Lithuanian immigrants. The latter are completely omitted from one of the textbooks. Scots are depicted alongside immigrants in each textbook and in each narrative. Images of the Scots are often negative, while images of the immigrant groups are generally sympathetic. It has been argued that the textbooks do not portray the growing diversity of the Scottish population by representing the history of Asian and Caribbean, and African immigration to Scotland. Rather, the textbooks depict various immigrant experiences of discrimination and resilience which are very relevant today.

These findings will now be re-iterated in terms of the theoretical framework. The textbooks portray the nation as comprising native Scots and Irish, Italian, Jewish, and Lithuanian immigrants. The history curriculum, condensed into history textbooks, therefore transmits a social imaginary which includes these five groups, but excludes other groups. If, then, identity takes place at the sutures between the social practices of the social imaginary and the agentive practices of the individual, pupils who are not of either Scottish, Irish, Italian, Jewish or Lithuanian backgrounds are not included in the Scottish social imaginary. Social practices make it difficult for them to negotiate an identity as a Scot. However, even if they cannot find themselves on the pages of Scotland's official past, they can nevertheless relate to these experiences.

This investigation has found that the contents of the representations in three Scottish textbooks do not vary substantially from each other. This is consistent with findings in Crawford (2006) and Lin *et al.* (2009). Mao (1997: 2008) argued that major changes in the political, social, and economic climate of Taiwan coincide with curricular changes. Sakki (2010) has also found that the depiction of the EU in textbooks tend to reflect results of public opinion polls. Political discourses position Scotland as a modern, inclusive nation, which welcomes immigrants. This dissertation has found that, contrary to these political discourses, Scots are not depicted in a positive, inclusive light. Lin *et al.* (2009) have found that textbooks of different countries can underline those parts of history which present successes for the own nation. The present findings do not necessarily suggest this. Scotland is depicted as a successful,

thriving nation, with employment opportunities and relative stability. However, none of the textbooks pretend that Scotland was the first choice of destination for many immigrants. Neither do the textbooks create very positive images of the Scottish population.

These findings have potential implications for history teachers. History teachers could, for instance, point out that the immigrants depicted in their textbooks all hail from Europe, but that immigrants in Scotland today hail from all over the world. Considering that many of the difficulties faced by immigrants in the textbooks have contemporary relevance, such as being accused of taking away employment, being discriminated because of religion, it could also be beneficial to teachers to underline these issues and situate them against a contemporary backdrop. The behaviour of Scots as described in the textbooks could also be used to exemplify tolerance and intolerance. It is, of course, possible that history teachers already do this. This is, indeed, one of the limitations of the current research. Textbooks present only the formal, planned dimensions of the curriculum. Although Kelly (2009) has argued that all dimensions of the curriculum must be investigated, the present research has not investigated the hidden, informal, and received curriculum associated with history at National 5 level. It may indeed have been useful to conduct interviews with teachers and pupils of migrant backgrounds to explore classroom practice. Further, as has been addressed in the methodology section, the condensed version of *CDA* investigated here has not allowed to investigate sentences in which the subject was not immediately related to an immigrant group. Neither has textbook content been analysed which is not part of the main text. Hence, images, maps, and practice questions to students have been ignored. However, that images can have as complex a meaning as texts have already been pointed out by, for instance, Van Leeuwen (2001). It is therefore proposed that further research in this area may look into analysing the pictures, illustrations, and maps in textbooks. Another potentially fruitful avenue would be to look at how the *emigration* of Scots is portrayed and whether there are similarities and differences in the immigrant/emigrant experience.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Textbooks

Hughes, M., Hume, C., Robertson, H. (2014). *National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes*. Paisley: Leckie & Leckie.

MacKay, C. and MacKay, A. (2014). *National 5 History - Scotland*. Edinburgh: BrightRED Publishing.

Wood, S. and Wood, C. (2013). *National 4 & 5: Migration and Empire 1830-1939*. Glasgow: Hodder Gibson.

Bibliography

BBC News. (2016). Brexit: Nicola Sturgeon says second Scottish independence vote 'highly likely'. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-scotland-politics-36621030> [Last accessed: 08/08/2018].

Benjamin, F. (2018). Westminster Hour. 2018 [Radio]. BBC 4, 17/06/2018.

Billig, M. 1995. *Banal Nationalism*. London: Sage.

Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27-40.

Crawford, K. (2006). Culture Wars: Japanese History Textbooks and the Construction of Official Memory. In S. J. Foster, K. A. Crawford. (eds). *What Shall We Tell the Children: International Perspectives on School History textbooks*. Greenwich, Connecticut: IAP, pp. 49-68.

Curtice, J. (2016b). From Indyref1 to Indyref2? The State of Nationalism in Scotland? *Scottish Social Attitudes 2016*.

Curtice, J. (2016a). The vote to leave the EU: Litmus test or lightning rod? *British Social Attitudes*, 34.

Doherty, C. (2008). *Re-imagining and re-imagining the nation through the history curriculum*. Paper presented at the AARE Annual Conference, Brisbane.

Dunlop, A., & Miles, R. (1990). Recovering the history of Asian migration to Scotland. *Immigrants & Minorities*, 9(2), 145-167.

Dzialtuvaite, J. (2006). The role of religion in language choice and identity among Lithuanian immigrants in Scotland. In T. Omoniyi, and J. A. Fishman (eds). *Explorations in the sociology of language and religion*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, pp. 79-85.

Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and Power*. Harlow: Longman.

Fairclough, N. & Wodak, R. (1997). Critical Discourse Analysis. In T. van Dijk (ed.) *Discourse as Social Interaction*, pp. 258-84. London: SAGE.

Flinders, D.J., Noddings, N. and Thornton, S.J., (1986). The null curriculum: Its theoretical basis and practical implications. *Curriculum Inquiry* 16(1), pp. 33-42.

Glaser, B.G. & Strauss, A.L. (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing.

Gee, J. (2014). *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method*. London: Routledge.

Hall, S. (1990). Cultural Identity and Diaspora. In J. Rutherford (ed). *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*. London: Lawrence and Wishart, pp. 222-237.

Hall, S. (1996). Who needs identity? In S. Hall and P. Du Gay (eds). *Questions of Cultural Identity*. London: Sage, pp. 1-17.

Hepburn, E. (2015). New Scots and Migration in the Scottish Independence referendum. *Scottish Affairs*, **24**(4), pp. 409-418.

Hild, E. 2016. Renegotiating Scottish Nationalism after the 2014 Independence Referendum. [Online]. *Etudes Ecosaises* (18). Available at: <http://journals.openedition.org/etudeseccossaises/1134> [Last accessed: 04/08/2018].

Johnson, R. B. (1997). Examining the validity structure of qualitative research. *Education*, **118**(2), pp. 282-292.

Kelly, A. V. (2009). *The curriculum: Theory and practice*. Sage.

Lin, L., Zhao, Y., Ogawa, M., Hoge, J., and Kim, B. Y. (2009). Whose history? An analysis of the Korean war in history textbooks from the United States, South Korea, Japan, and China. *The Social Studies*, **100**(5), pp. 222-232.

Maitles, H. (1995). Attitudes to Jewish Immigration in the West of Scotland to 1905. *Scottish Economic and Social History*, **15**(1), pp. 44-65.

Mao, C.-J. (1997). Constructing a New Social Identity: Taiwan's Curricular Reforms of the Nineties. *International Journal of Educational Reform*, **6**(4), pp. 400-406.

Mao, C. J. (2008). Fashioning curriculum reform as identity politics—Taiwan's dilemma of curriculum reform in new millennium. *International Journal of Educational Development*, **28**(5), pp. 585-595.

Mclvor, J. (2014). A guide to the new National 4 and 5 qualifications. [Online]. BBC News Scotland. Available at: <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-scotland-27032316> [Last accessed: 05/08/2018].

Moeglin, P. (2006). The Textbook and after... In E. Bruillard, B. Aamotsbakken, S. V. Knudsen, M. Horsley (eds). *Caught in the Web or Lost in the Textbook?* Caen; Eighth International Conference on Learning and Educational Media, pp. 15-33.

Moscovici, S. (1961). *La psychanalyse, son image et son public*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France.

Moscovici, S. (1973). Introduction. In C. Herzlich. *Health and illness: A social psychological analysis*. London: Academic Press.

Moscovici, S. (1984). The phenomenon of social representations. In S. Moscovici, R. Farr. (eds). *Social representations*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 3-55.

Moscovici, S. (2000). *Social Representations. Explorations in Social Psychology*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Nicholls, J. (2003). Methods in school textbook research. *International journal of historical learning, teaching and research*, 3(2), pp. 11-26.

Pingel, F. (2010). *UNESCO Guidebook on Textbook Research and Textbook Revision. 2nd Edition*. Paris: UNESCO.

Priestley, M., Humes, W. (2010). The development of Scotland's curriculum for excellence: Amnesia and déjà vu. *Oxford Review of Education*, 36(3), pp. 354-361.

Sakki, I. (2010). *A Success Story or a Failure? Representing the European Integration in the Curricula and Textbooks of Five Countries*. Ph.D. Dissertation. Helsinki: University of Helsinki.

Sturgeon, N. (2013). *Scotland and Europe*. Speech made on 03/01/2013. Available at: www.scotland.gov.uk/News/Speeches/Scotland-europe-25-01-2013 [Last accessed: 05/08/2018].

Taylor, C. (2002). Modern social imaginaries. *Public culture* 14(1), pp. 91-124.

The British Government. (2016). *Guidance on promoting British values in schools* published. [Online] Available at: <https://www.gov.uk/government/news/guidance-on-promoting-british-values-in-schools-published> [Last accessed: 08/08/2018].

The Guardian. (2014). *Scottish Independence Referendum: Final Results in Full*. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/politics/ng-interactive/2014/sep/18/-sp-scottish-independence-referendum-results-in-full> [Last accessed: 28/06/2018].

The Scottish Government. (2003). *School Census September 2002 - Additional Analysis*. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.gov.scot/Publications/2003/12/18704/31162#bt5> [Last accessed: 08/08/2018].

The Scottish Government. (2016). *Scottish Social Attitudes 2015: Attitudes to discrimination and positive action*. Available at: <http://www.ssa.natcen.ac.uk/media/38903/attitudes-to-discrimination-and-positive-action-2015.pdf> [Last accessed: 12/08/2018].

The Scottish Government (2018). *Summary Statistics for Schools in Scotland, No. 8: 2017 Edition*. [Online]. Available at:

<https://www.gov.scot/Publications/2017/12/3099/downloads> [Last accessed: 08/08/2018].

Scottish Qualifications Authority. (2017a). *SQA Statistics 2017: Attainment Statistics (December) 2017*. [Online] Available at: <https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/63001.8312.html> [Last Accessed 10/02/2017].

Scottish Qualifications Authority (2017b). *National 5 Course Specification: National 5 History*. [Online]. Available at: <https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/47447.html> [Last accessed: 13/08/2018].

Tutunjian, D. and Boland, J. E. (2008). Do we need a distinction between arguments and adjuncts? Evidence from psycholinguistic studies of comprehension. *Language and Linguistics Compass*, 2(4), pp. 631-646.

Van Leeuwen, T. (2001). Semiotics and iconography. In T. van Leeuwen and C. Jewitt. (eds.). *Handbook of Visual Analysis*. London: Sage.

Verschueren, J. (2001). Predicaments of criticism. *Critique of Anthropology*, 21(1), 59-81.

Wagner, P. (1994). *The Sociology of Modernity: Liberty and Discipline*. New York: Routledge.

Widdowson, H. (1998) The theory and practice of Critical Discourse Analysis. *Applied Linguistics* 19(1), 136-51.

APPENDIX 1

IRISH IMMIGRANTS

Participants	Attributes	Processes	Circumstances	Page
Wood and Wood. 2013. National 4 and 5 History: Migration and Empire 1830-1939. Paisley: Hodder Gibson.				
Irish		came	To Scotland	2
		To work	For the summer	2
		Returned	Home to Ireland	2
		Were likely to come to	Scotland because it was part of the same country	2
		Moved to	Scotland because it would have been relatively cheap to do so	2
		Came to	help bring in the harvest	2
	reapers	Were known as		2
		worked	from the end of June to the end of October	2
	most	Returned to	Ireland with the profit from their work	2

	Some of the workers ... agricultural labourers	Stayed on to be		3
	Many	Came	for the opportunities offered by better jobs and better prospects	3
	Some	Only intended to stay	in Scotland for a short time	3
	more	settled	In Scotland	3
		Possible to have	a life that still enabled them to stay in touch with their family, their culture and their religion	3
		Mostly settled	in the west of Scotland and its surrounding area	3
		settled	wherever there were jobs	3
	So many	settled	in Edinburgh that the area around the Cowgate in the city was known as 'Little Ireland'	3
		Were forced to come	To Scotland	3
	most	Did not own	Their own land	4
		earned	Little money	4

	Had to pay	rent to landlords who often did not live on their lands	4
	Would be removed	from the land	4
	Might emigrate		4
Many smallholders	Were pushed	off the land when landowners wanted to make their own lands bigger so that they could use modern machinery	4
	Were forced to move		4
	left	Because of lack of opportunities in Ireland	4
	Working	In these industries [textiles]	4
	Left to earn	More money in Britain	4
	Starved		5
many	Could not pay	Their rent	5
	Were evicted	From their homes	5
some	Were forced to leave		5
1 - 1.5 million	died		6

	A million more	emigrated		6
	Most emigrants	Went to	The USA if they could afford it	6
	The poorest	Travelled to	Places like Scotland and England	6
		settled	in places that were nearest to where the ships reached	6
		Did not have	the money for onward travel	6
	most	settled	In the west... in Scotland	6
		Came	because there were jobs available in Scotland	6
	Many	Came	To Scotland	7
		Could get paid more	For their skills	7
		Worked hard		7
	<i>Harvest labourers</i>			7
		<i>Work more willingly</i>		7
		<i>Labour harder</i>		7

	<i>Irish reapers</i>	<i>Far surpass</i>	The Scots	7
		<i>Far exceed</i>	<i>them in the quantity of corn cut down</i>	7
	immigrants	Had found	permanent jobs in a number of Scottish industries ... by the 1880s	26
	workers	Were employed	in coal mines, iron works and the factories of Scotland	26
	workers	Helped build	the canals and railways that would provide transport for the people and trade for Scotland	26
	immigrants	settled	In Scotland	26
	workers	Were concentrated	in Glasgow and the west of Scotland	26
	Large numbers	Worked	in the jute mills of Dundee, the breweries of Edinburgh and the mining areas of Lothian, in the east of Scotland	26
	many	Were employed	in the cotton industry	27
		settling	in the cloth-producing towns of Ayrshire and Lanarkshire	27
		Are most remembered	in the heavy industries of coal mining and iron-making	27

	navvies	Building the railways		27
		built	These railways	27
	Immigrants	Lived	in these slum conditions	27
	poor	were		27
	Immigrants	lived	in the poorer parts of Scotland's cities	27
	Migrants	Concentrated	in the Old Town in the Cowgate and Grassmarket areas ... in Edinburgh	27
	so many	Living	in this area that the local Edinburgh people called it 'Little Ireland' or 'Little Dublin'	27
	immigrants	Concentrated	in the slums of the Saltmarket, Cowcaddens and Maryhill	27
	<i>Men and women</i>	<i>Living</i>	<i>In a chronic state</i>	27
		<i>Could hardly be recognised</i>	<i>As human</i>	27
		<i>Picking up</i>	<i>Food that even animals will turn away from</i>	27

		<i>Swearing fighting trampling</i>	<i>On one another ... in a room that could not hold ten with decency</i>	27
		<i>filling</i>	<i>The room with foul air</i>	27
Some immigrants		Drank	Alcohol	28
		To forget or to escape	their everyday life	28
Heavy drinkers		Were labelled as		28
		Caused	The diseases	28
<i>labourers</i>		<i>Came to have</i>	<i>a reputation for fighting, drunkenness and general 'bad' behavior.</i>	28
		had	their own culture, social customs and habits	29
Some		Spoke	a different language	29
Immigrants		had	Their own identity	29
Different		were		29
Catholics and Protestants		shared	certain customs and habits that made them different from the Scottish population	29

	Seventy-five percent of immigrants... Catholic	were		29
	Many more Catholics	Were arriving and needing	The help of parish priests	29
	Young Catholics	Were encouraged to socialise	In Church	29
	The children of Irish Catholic families	Did not mix	with local children so the differences between Protestant Scots and Catholic Irish continued	30
	Protestant Irish	Shared	their religion with the majority of Scots	30
		Created	their own separate identity with something that still exists in Scotland today - the Loyal Orange Order	30
	Irish Protestants	Brought	the Orange Lodge with them to Scotland	30
		Gained	a reputation as strike breakers	31
		Took	jobs of striking workers	31
	Strike breakers			31
	Navvies	Gained	a particularly bad reputation for drunken behaviour	31

	Navvies ... 'swarms of wild irishmen'	Described as		31
	navvies	Fought	amongst themselves	31
		Were considered	a problem by the Scots	31
	Irish Catholics ... a threat to the Protestant Scottish way of life	were		31
	Irish Catholics	Were accused	not having any loyalty to Scotland	31
		Were said to be	Loyal to the Pope	31
	<i>population</i>	<i>Has not been assimilated</i>	<i>Into the Scottish population</i>	31
	<i>A completely separate race of alien origin</i>			31
	Working-class Irish and Scottish people	faced	the same problems over pay and working conditions	31
	About 75 percent of the membership of the Lanarkshire miner's union	Made up	By 1900	32

	Many immigrants	Seem to have got on very well	the same problems over pay and working conditions	32
	Immigrants both Catholic and Protestant ... very important in the economic development of Scotland	Were		33
		Mostly worked	in unskilled manual industries	33
	Protestant Irish workers	Being deliberately recruited	by Scottish engineering and shipbuilding firms	33
	Not only important as muscle to build industrial Scotland	Were		33
	Skilled workers	Were needed and recruited	From Ireland	33
	Irish men living in Scotland	joined	the armed forces to fight Britain against Germany ... at the start of the First World War	33
	Irish Catholics	had supported	... in Scotland... the Liberal Party because the Liberals had promoted the idea of the Irish ruling themselves	33
	Catholics	switched	their support to the Labour Party	33

	Trade union members	were		33
	Protestant Irish community	Tended to vote	for the Conservative Party	33
MacKay and MacKay (2014). N5 History - Scotland. Edinburgh: BrightRED Publishing.				
Irish		Had been coming	to Scotland for quite some time before this tragedy [the Potato Famine]	66
		flocked	To these jobs	66
	Many... seasonal workers	were		66
		Found employment	In farming	66
	'tattie-howkers'			66
		Usually returned	to Ireland when the work was finished	66
	Many others	stayed		66
		had	A much more tragic reason for coming to Scotland ... with the onslaught of the Potato Famine	66
	Poorer	Were dependent	on the potato as their main food crop	66

	Labourers and their families	Were evicted	From their homes	66
		Often faced	the stark choice of starvation or emigration	66
	Influx of Irish ... a flood	became	Into Scotland	66
	The majority	settled	in areas they could get work	66
	Many	Went to	Dundee and the surrounding towns to work in the mills	66
	A large proportion of these migrants ... Single girls	were		66
	influx	Did not cease	Into Scotland... after the famine	67
	emigrants	knew	that they would have friends, families and former neighbours	67
		could easily contact and rely on	for support	67
	Textile workers	To labour	in jute mills ... in Dundee	67
		Had worked	in mills in Donegal, Londonderry, Monaghan, Sligo and Tyrone	67

	flooded	Into this environment ... especially after the 1840s and 1850s when the famine and its aftermath were most keenly felt	68
Newcomers ... the poorest of the poor	were		68
'disease-carriers' and the cause of the ills of Glasgow	Got the reputation of being		68
scapegoats for the urban problems	Became		68
<i>poor</i>	<i>Frequently lie</i>	<i>on the floor, on straw or shavings</i>	68
	<i>Have</i>	<i>Beds</i>	68
<i>Three or four</i>	<i>Lie</i>	<i>in the same bed</i>	68
<i>males and females</i>	<i>Sleep</i>	<i>next to one another</i>	68
<i>dirtier and less well clothed than the native population</i>	<i>are</i>		68
Catholic workers	would sometimes find it difficult	to get jobs because of their religion	68
some Irish immigrants	Found it difficult to get	A job	69
many more	provided	the manpower for Scotland's Industrial Revolution	69

	Large numbers of Irish labourers	Found	work building canals or navigations	69
	many Irish “navvies”	Were working building	new railway lines ... by 1840	69
		Quickly gained	a reputation for trouble	69
	drunken Irish navvies			69
	<i>Some hundreds of navigators</i>	<i>Turned out and brandishing</i>	<i>Clubs and picks</i>	69
		<i>Broke</i>	<i>Windows</i>	69
		<i>Assaulted</i>	<i>every Scotch person they could meet with</i>	69
		<i>Jumped, yelled and altogether frightened</i>	<i>for their lives the peaceable inhabitants</i>	69
	Labourers			69
	some	worked	In the coal mines ... in Lanarkshire	69
	Strike breakers	Got the reputation of being		69
	Predominantly Irish Catholic areas	began	to produce their own [football] teams	69

	large numbers of Protestant Irish	arrived	in Scotland to work ... during the 19 th century	69
		Did not face	the same difficulties as the Catholic Irish	69
	Protestant	Were		69
		Spoke	English	69
	Many of the Catholic Irish	Only spoke	Irish Gaelic	69
	Large numbers of the Northern Irish	worked	In the Clyde shipyards	69
Hughes et al.'s (2014). National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes. Glasgow: Leckie & Leckie.				
Irish		Could only do	Unskilled jobs, such as labouring or farm work	8
	Those who farmed their own land	Only produced	Enough to survive	8
	Tenants			8
	Those who couldn't pay	Were thrown off	Their land	8
		Came to rely on growing	One crop, the potato, on any scrap of land they could	9

	90% of the Irish population	Was dependent on	The potato for their main calorific intake and for selling ... by 1800	9
		Starved		9
	families	Reduced to eating	Grass from the fields and seaweed from the beaches	9
	Around 2 000 000 people	May have starved	To death	9
	Another 2 000 000	left	For new lives abroad	9
	Families who	came	To Scotland there were jobs for them all, whether it was down a coal pit or in the jute factories of Dundee	9
	Even the poorest	Could afford	The trip to Scotland	10
	many	Had visited	Scotland previously for work on the railways or at harvest time, and it was therefore familiar to them	10
	Some	Even had	Family and friends who had stayed across in Scotland	10
	immigrants	Tended to settle	In west and central Scotland, mainly in Glasgow and the surrounding towns ... in the nineteenth century	15

	Many	Also made it over	To Dundee and, to a lesser extent, Edinburgh	15
		settled	In these places because there were jobs available	15
	immigrants	Arrived		15
		faced	A significant amount of resentment from native Scots	15
	many	Forced to settle	In the poorest areas of the cities: the slums	15
	Immigrants... uneducated and unskilled	Were generally		16
		faced	Discrimination in the jobs market, usually because they were Catholic	16
		Took on	Unskilled jobs in factories, textiles, mines and railway construction for low pay and often difficult conditions	16
		Were willing to work	For so little	16
	The vast majority of Irish immigrants ... Catholic	were		16

		Tended to keep	Themselves to themselves, and thriving communities developed as a result	16
	priests	Worked hard to provide	Some stability for the immigrants	16
	Protestant Irish	Also arrived	In Scotland, generally from the 1880s onwards	17
	These immigrants	Mixed well	With native Scots due to their shared religion and faced much less difficulty in gaining jobs in skilled industries than their Catholic counterparts	17
	Catholics	Were on the road to being accepted	As part of Scottish society... by the 1930s	17
		Assimilated well		17
	Irish Catholics	Initially voted	for the Liberal Party because the Liberals supported Irish independence	22
	Unhappy with the way the Liberals dealt with the issue	became		22
	Irish Catholics	Were voting mainly	For the Labour Party	22
		Playing	An important role in its rise in Scotland	22

ITALIAN IMMIGRANTS

Participants	Attributes	Processes	Circumstances	Page
Wood and Wood. 2013. National 4 and 5 History: Migration and Empire 1830-1939. Paisley: Hodder Gibson.				
Italian(s)	immigration	was	At its height between 1890 and 1914	12
	population	increased	From 750 to over 4500 people	12
	Most of the Italians	came	To Scotland... from two areas of Italy	12
	Some	left	Italy	12
	Some	Found	Their way to Scotland	12
		attracted	To Scotland by recruiting agents working for <i>padroni</i> (employers or patrons) based in London	13
		Came to be so connected	With this business [ice cream trade]	13
		settled	All over Scotland	13
	Large communities	were	In all the main cities like Glasgow and Edinburgh	13

		Started to arrive	In Scotland from the 1890s onwards	42
Most immigrants		Were trying to escape	Hunger and poverty back home in Italy	42
community		numbered	in Scotland ... about 4500	42
families		Were spread out	Across Scotland	42
community		Worked hard	... in Scotland	42
		Did not always integrate	With the local Scottish population	42
<i>Aliens, foreigners, the Tallies [slang for Italians]</i>		<i>Worked all day to serve</i>	<i>them fish and chips and ice-cream</i>	42
families		Wanted to make	Enough money	43
		To return to	Italy	43
		<i>spoke</i>	<i>Italian</i>	43
		<i>had</i>	<i>Italian friends</i>	43
		<i>Brought up</i>	<i>That we had to marry Italians</i>	43

		<i>Got on very well</i>	<i>With the Scots boys who came into the shop and would chat with us</i>	43
	most	found	Work in family businesses such as cafés, fish and chip shops and ice-cream parlours	43
MacKay and MacKay (2014). N5 History - Scotland. Edinburgh: BrightRED Publishing.				
Italian(s)		Have introduced and dominated	the café and restaurant culture enjoyed by Scots	64
	The Equi family ... the Jaconellis... the famous Nardinis			64
	The number of Italians	Living	In Scotland	64
		increased	From 750 to 5000... between 1890 and 1914	64
	Most	came	from two distinct areas: Lucca, in Tuscany, and Frosinone, south of Rome	64
	Peasant			64
	population	Was rising substantially	During this period	64

	Peasants		64
	The majority of Italian emigrants	flocked	To the USA 64
	many	Came	To Britain 64
		Often making	London their first port of call 64
		used	agents (<i>padroni</i>) who ensured that the emigrants had work in their new country 64
		moved	to areas of Scotland where there were already Italian families 64
		Would join	a community that had strong links to their original home in Italy 64
		Came over	64
		<i>Would settle</i>	<i>where their own villagers were, their own friends</i> 64
	<i>A big crowd from Barga</i>	<i>Have gathered together</i>	<i>In Glasgow and the West</i> 64

<i>Most of them that came to Edinburgh</i>	were	<i>from the villages in the Abruzzi</i>	64
	<i>Made for</i>	<i>the Grassmarket because it was the most similar to an Italian piazza</i>	64
<i>Italian colony</i>	<i>More or less centred</i>	<i>around St Mary's Street, the Pleasance and the Grassmarket</i>	64
The newly arrived Italian community	Was involved	in a variety of occupations in Scotland	64
	sold	ice cream on the streets from barrows	64
the 'hokey pokey' men	became known as		64
street traders	soon set up	cafés	64
entrepreneurs			64
not all	entered	the catering trade	64
<i>many</i>	<i>are still associated</i>	<i>with this kind of business</i>	65
	experienced	less prejudice than other immigrant groups to Scotland	65
relative low numbers	did not prove	a threat to Scottish jobs	65

		did not inspire	the level of hostility which was common in dealings with Irish and Lithuanian immigrants	65
	families	married	to an extent within their community	65
Hughes et al.'s (2014). National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes. Glasgow: Leckie & Leckie.				
Italians		Began arriving	In Scotland in larger numbers after 1880	11
	Many	Were looking to escape	Extreme poverty, low wages, poor living conditions and the droughts that often caused food shortages in Italy	11
		To seek	A better life abroad	11
	Many	Were initially attracted	To Scotland because it was cheaper to stop off in Scotland on the way to America than to go there directly	12
		Saw	Scotland, essentially, as a stopping off point	12
	A significant number	Ended up staying		12

	many	Were attracted	To Scotland by the promise of higher wages, better living conditions and a more stable, reliable jobs market	12
		Did not engage significantly	With politics in Scotland	22

JEWISH IMMIGRANTS

Participants	Attributes	Processes	Circumstances	Page
Wood and Wood. 2013. National 4 and 5 History: Migration and Empire 1830-1939. Paisley: Hodder Gibson. [SQA Endorsed.]				
Jews		Had migrated	To Scotland	13
	Educated and wealthy	Tended to be		13
	many	Came	To Scotland	13
		To escape	Persecution and poverty in Eastern Europe	13
	most	Sailed on	to start a new life in the USA	13
	Some	Settled	In Scotland	13
		Settled	In Scotland ... In big cities, especially Glasgow	13

	More than 7000		In Glasgow	13
	two different kinds of Jewish immigrants	were		13
	Well-educated people	Tended to live	north of the River Clyde	13
	Yiddish-speaking Jews		From Poland and Russia	13
		settled	in the cheaper Gorbals district of the city	13
	Jewish population of Glasgow	Increased	In 1939	13
	Jewish men, women and children	Escaped	Nazi Germany and Austria	13
MacKay and MacKay (2014). N5 History - Scotland. Edinburgh: BrightRED Publishing.				
Jews	... small ... number	Living	In Scotland... in 1840	62
	Only around 200	Were living	In Edinburgh by 1900	62
	Most... Dutch or German business men	were		62
		Set up	A synagogue	62

		bought	A piece of ground to use as a graveyard in Glasgow	62
	The small number	Was to rise	After 1881	62
	More than a million	fled	From the pogroms and persecution	62
	Many	Journeyed	To the USA	62
	About 100000	settled	In Britain between 1881 and 1914	62
	A number	settled	In Scotland	62
	settlers	Were joined	There [the Gorbals] by the Irish and Italian communities	62
	Around 5000 to 6000 Jews	Were living	In the Gorbals... in 1901	62
		Were blamed	For Germany's defeat in the Great War and for the economic problems which followed	62
	The number of Jews	rose	In 1939... In Scotland ... to 15000 in Glasgow and 2000 in Edinburgh	62

	Who wished to flee Nazi Germany			62
	Around 10000 children	came	To Britain on their own (parents were not allowed)	62
	children	Were sent	To youth hostels, foster families or farms	62
	The number of Jewish people	Had started to increase more rapidly	Towards the end of the 19 th century	62
	Many	settled	In the Gorbals in Glasgow	62
	More prosperous	Became		62
		moved	To better housing in the West End of the city	62
	Over 1000 Jews	Were employed	By 1900... in 'sweat shops' (cramped unhygienic small factories) producing garments for the tailoring trade	62
	Jewish community	Was also associated	With the tobacco trade	62
	immigrants	Were helped to start	Their own business with loans from groups such as the Glasgow Hebrew Benevolent Loan Society	63

	Jewish community ... not free from criticism	was		63
		Working and trading	On Sundays	63
		staying	In the Gorbals	63
	some	Experienced	Discrimination	63
	others	Received	A warm welcome	63
	<i>some</i>	<i>Were flourishing and showing off a bit</i>		63
	Many younger Jews ... assimilated	Were becoming	By the 1920s and 1930s	63
	Younger Jews	Had few problems going to	The cinema or theatre on a Saturday	63
Hughes et al.'s (2014). National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes. Glasgow: Leckie & Leckie.				
Jews	A large number	Arrived	In Scotland ... between 1880 and 1914	11
	Many	Were escaping	Religious persecution in Russia	11
	many	Were leaving	Because of economic persecution	11
		Were often discriminated against	When applying for jobs or starting businesses, making it harder for them to earn a living	11

	immigrants	settled	In Glasgow	21
	families	Tended to settle	In the same areas	21
		creating	Jewish communities in areas like the Gorbals where accommodation was cheap	21
		Tended to interact mainly	With other Jews but this was no different to other immigrant groups	21
	Community ... never large	Was		21
	Immigrants	Tended to work	As hawkers and peddlers	21
		Selling	Goods door to door	21
		Set up	Businesses as tailors, bakers, watchmakers and jewellers	21
		Had assimilated fairly well	Into Scottish society by the 1930s ... despite the challenges Jews faced	21
		Tended to stay	In their own communities	21

		Had generally integrated well	With Scots, both in the workplace, in schools, and in general society too	21
--	--	-------------------------------	---	----

LITHUANIAN IMMIGRANTS

Participant	Attributes	Processes	Circumstances	Page
Wood and Wood. 2013. National 4 and 5 History: Migration and Empire 1830-1939. Paisley: Hodder Gibson. [SQA Endorsed.]				
Lithuanians	Large numbers of Lithuanians	Came	To Scotland ... in the 1890s	11
		Were attracted	By work in the coalmines and the iron and steel works around Coatbridge near Glasgow	11
	Around 5000-6000 Lithuanians	living	In Scotland ... by 1914	11
	Most	Came	to Scotland for economic reasons	12
	Many	Came	from farming backgrounds where it was extremely hard to make a living because the landholdings were so small and the farming methods basic	12
	Other Lithuanians	Were forced to leave	because of persecution by the Russian government	12

	Most of the Lithuanian emigrants	hoped	To reach the USA	12
		came	to Scotland as a stepping-stone because there was a well-established shipping route that linked Europe to Scotland and then to the rest of the world	12
		Came	to Scotland because employers in Scotland tried to attract Lithuanians to come and work here	12
		Were persuaded to go	To Scotland	12
		<i>Had</i>	<i>No money</i>	12
		<i>To leave</i>		12
		<i>Go on to</i>	<i>America</i>	12
		<i>Leave here and go back</i>	<i>To their own country</i>	12
	A community of Lithuanians	grew	In the Coatbridge area	12
		arrived	in Scotland in the late nineteenth century	41

		worked	in the growing industries of coal, iron and steel in Lanarkshire and Ayrshire	41
	community ... different	Was visibly	From the local Scots	41
		spoke	A different language	41
	Catholic	were		41
		Tended to live	Together in the streets of the Scottish towns where they settled	41
		developed	Their own communities	41
	Lithuanian community ... Small compared to the Irish one	was		41
		Were eventually absorbed	Into the local community	41
	Identity ... lost	Was	When names were changed	41
	Children ... 'dirty poles'	Picked on as being		41
	Children	Went to	Local schools	41
		Were not enough to have	Separate schools	41

	Community	Fairly quickly lost	Its own identity	41
	Many	Gave up	Their old surnames	41
		Went to	Scottish schools	41
		Were treated badly	When they first arrived in Scottish communities	41
	miners	Were used to break	Strikes	41
		Were willing to work	For less money than the Scots	41
		Soon joined	With Scots in campaigning for better pay and conditions	41
Hughes et al.'s (2014). National 4 & 5 History - Course Notes. Glasgow: Leckie & Leckie.				
Lithuanians		left	Their home on the shores of the Baltic	11
	some	Were escaping	conscription into the Russian army	11
	Some ... economic migrants	Were simply		11
	Desperate to escape the crushing poverty at home			11

		Prepared to go	Anywhere in search of a better life	11
		Saw	America in their sights	11
		bought	Tickets for Scotland only because it was cheaper than going to the US directly	11
	Those Lithuanians who	Planned to settle	In Scotland from the beginning	12
	immigrants	Tended to settle	in the industrial towns in the west of Scotland	20
		Hoping to find	Jobs in coal mines and factories	20
	The largest Lithuanian community	To develop	in Scotland in this period was in the town of Coatbridge where there was a large coal mine	20
	Population ... around 6 000	was	At its peak	20
		Were not fully welcomed	By Scots ... at first	20
	Many Lithuanians	Had changed	their surnames to local sounding names in an attempt to integrate into their new communities more easily	20
	Easy targets	Were		20

	immigrants	Were		20
	Catholic	Were		20
	miners	Began to strike	alongside their Scottish counterparts for better pay and conditions	20
		Had	a strong sense of community	20
		Being found organising	Social events like trips to the seaside and sports days	20
	Their children	Attended	Local schools	20
	many	Moved out	of the mines and factories to establish local businesses	20
		Even established	Two local newspapers and insurance societies	20
		Had assimilated well	Into their communities ... by 1914	20
	Many men	Left	To fight for Russia	20
	These men	Did not return	To Scotland ... after the war	20
	The remaining Lithuanians	Began to drift	Back to their home country	20

		played	an important role in the trade union movement that fought for better conditions in the workplace	22
	many	joined	the Independent Labour Party which fought for changes in the political system that would help the working class	22