



MacDonald, Carrie (2012) *Mentors in violence prevention: an evaluation of the implementation of the bystander-focused approach to tackling gendered violence* [MSc.]

Copyright © 2012 The Author

Copyright and moral rights for this work are retained by the author(s)

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge

This work cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author(s)

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, institution and date must be given.

<http://endeavour.gla.ac.uk/93/>

Deposited: 9 December 2016

Enlighten Dissertations  
<http://endeavour.gla.ac.uk/>  
deposit@lib.gla.ac.uk



**Mentors in Violence Prevention: An Evaluation of the Implementation of  
The Bystander-Focused Approach to Tackling Gendered Violence**

By Carrie Macdonald

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the degree of MSc Criminology and Criminal Justice

Word Count: **16, 500**

Date: 10/11/12

## **Abstract**

*The aim of the following dissertation is to examine the issues surrounding gender-based violence with the intention of establishing a method of intervention that is best suited to tackling the issue. There was a particular focus on the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme. This is a relatively new innovative prevention programme that originated in North America over a decade ago, however, very recently the MVP programme has been launched in Scotland by the Violence Reduction Unit at Strathclyde Police Force and is currently being implemented within a small number of high schools in central Scotland.*

*This paper, in order to establish whether this specific method of intervention has the potential to enact attitudinal changes that are necessary to eliminate violence against women an evaluation of the theory of change adopted was contrasted against the wider body of relevant literature. What is more, since the sustainability of the MVP programmes as it has been adapted to suit the high school setting in Scotland depends heavily upon how faithful it has been to the original model, an evaluation of the application process was further considered. In order to achieve these specific aims qualitative interviews were utilised in order to maximise the potential outcome of this project*

## Acknowledgements:

Firstly, I would like to thank the Violence Reduction Unit at Strathclyde Police and in particular Graham Goulden for his assistance throughout this dissertation. I would also like to thank my supervisor, Jon Bannister for his contribution and guidance as well as all those who took part in this research. I would like to offer a special thanks to my fiancé Steven for his unwavering support and patience throughout this project.

## **Table of Contents**

<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
<b>Chapter One: Literature Review</b> .....	5
1.1 Overview.....	5
1.2 Definition.....	5
1.3 Scale of the Problem.....	7
1.4 Consequences.....	8
1.5 Current Policy .....	9
1.6 Underpinning Causes of Gendered Violence.....	14
1.7 Methods of Intervention.....	21
1.8 Bystander Approach.....	24
<b>Chapter Two: Methodology</b>	
2.1 Qualitative Research.....	32
2.2 Data Collection.....	35
2.3 Advantages and Disadvantages.....	36
2.4 Ethical Considerations.....	38
2.5 Alternative methods.....	38
<b>Chapter Three: Results</b> .....	40
<b>Chapter Four: Conclusion</b> .....	60

**Table of Contents Continued...**

**Bibliography**.....63

Appendices:

A. Participant Information Sheet.....68

B. Participant Consent Form.....69

## **Introduction**

### Justification for research

Male violence against women continues to be a serious social, legal and health problem which has profound, long lasting and sometimes irreversible consequences for the victims. While, practitioners and policy makers are now well educated on the causal and contextual factors that contribute to the perpetration of violence against women the seriousness of the problem remains and continues to be resistant to prevention. Although prevention methods are now widespread, traditionally these have focused on responses after the violence has taken place. More recently however, there have been calls for more innovative prevention programmes aimed at tackling gender-based violence before it manifests.

One prevention programme that has gained considerable momentum overseas is the Mentors in Violence Prevention (MVP) programme. The MVP was established at the North-eastern University in Boston, Massachusetts, and since its inception in 1993, the programme has been widely implemented in the United States in various social settings, including high schools, colleges and the US military. The programme is an example of one of the first bystander-focused approaches to the gender based violence field and targets not only potential perpetrators and victims, but also seeks to empower those who might otherwise be silent observers to potentially violent and coercive behaviour. The MVP programme is based on a peer leadership model, whereby a co-educational group of trained staff members educate youth participants ('peer mentors'), who in turn facilitate knowledge and skill building workshops attended by a larger number of their peers.

Led by the Violent Reduction Unit (VRU) at Strathclyde police the MVP programme is currently being launched in Scotland and since its inception in 2011, the VRU have been working in partnership with a number of local authorities and are currently at the very early stages of implementing the MVP programme into three high schools in central Scotland- two in the Inverclyde region and one in Edinburgh. The rationale for this is to, increase awareness about the problem of gender based violence, challenge messages that exist within a high school setting about relationships and how these might play into violence and to encourage leadership by empowering people with concrete options to effect change in their own lives and the broader community (Katz, 2006). While, evaluations of the MVP programme in high school settings across America, have found the programme to have a significant impact, with participants showing an increase in knowledge and awareness about gender violence, improved attitudes and behaviours related to gender violence and increased bystander efficacy (Katz, 2006). Due to the fact that the implementation of MVP in the Scottish context has only just been launched, it is out with the scope of this paper to conduct a similar impact evaluation. What this dissertation can do at this early stage however is undertake an examination of the extent to which the MVP programme is based on a clearly developed theory of change and whether or not that theory of change is in conjunction with the wider academic literature on tackling violence against women. Furthermore, by undertaking an evaluation of the planning and implementation process to date, this dissertation will also consider whether or not the MVP programme as it has been implemented in Scotland has stayed faithful to the original programme.



## Dissertation structure

### Chapter one: Literature Review

This dissertation commences with the Literature Review, which begins by outlining why violence against women is an essential area to study, before then going on to establish what is meant exactly by the broad definition of 'gender-based violence'. The literature then goes on to discuss the nature and scale of the problem from both a global and local context, including the consequences this type of violence might have for the victims. The wider implications gender-based violence has on society at large are also explained. This chapter then sets out key government policy and practice, including the criminal justice framework in order to establish what efforts are being made to tackle the problem before then going on to consider a number of the widely held theories on the causes of gender-based violence. The literature review goes on to review interventions that are currently in place. The main philosophies underpinning the bystander-focused method is then discussed in detail, before establishing whether this particular approach fits with the broader academic literature on the causes of gender-based violence

### Chapter two: Methodology

The second chapter examines the methodology used to conduct this research. It begins with a descriptive explanation of the specific aim of this research project. The chapter then clearly and concisely sets out the main research questions and provides a brief summary under each heading justifying its aims and objectives. Research methods are then discussed with specific reference to the qualitative strategy. The research justifications are then explored, and how the research may have been improved is considered.

### Chapter three: Results

This chapter analyses the findings of the primary research. All the themes mentioned in chapter two are re-discussed in this chapter when they are compared at length with the finding generated from the primary research. Some of these themes are similar to those that emerge from the literature review.

### Chapter four: Conclusion

The final part of the dissertation concludes by highlighting the key findings that have been reached in relation to the specific research questions. This chapter also makes clear any weakness found in the implementation of the MVP programme before considering the likelihood of the programme being successful in tackling gender-based violence.

## **Chapter one: Literature Review**

### **1.1: Overview**

It is now well documented that violence against women represents a social problem of enormous proportion. It is a crime that occurs in all parts of society and can affect women and girls irrespective of socio-economic status, age, culture and ethnic background. With recent figures showing domestic violence accounting for 1 in 7 of all violent incidents reported the United Kingdom (British Crime survey, 2009) government and non-government organisations are now busy deriving strategies that aim to tackle the root causes of this type of violence as well as raising awareness about the widespread and serious nature of the problem. This chapter intends to review the relevant academic literature in order to define the nature and prevalence of the problem before then going on to develop a clear understanding its root causes. Current Government policy aimed at tackling the problem will also be discussed. Finally, this chapter will aim to interrogate methods of interventions best suited to support the evidence, with a particular emphasis on the bystander approach and its potential ability for preventing violence against women.

### **1.2: Definition**

Establishing what constitutes exactly as ‘gender-based violence’ is the subject of much discussion and debate and since its re-discovery as a significant social problem in the early 1970’s there now exists, changing and inconsistent definitions, with no one universal term to define the problem. The Scottish Government, in a publication entitled; *Preventing Domestic Abuse – A National Strategy*” defines gender-based violence as

*“Domestic Abuse (as gendered based abuse) can be perpetrated by partners or ex –partners and can include physical abuse (assault and physical attack involving a range of behaviour), sexual abuse mental and emotional abuse (such as threats, verbal abuse, racial abuse, withholding money and other types of controlling behaviour such as isolation from family and friends)”. (Scottish Executive, 2003)*

It is clear from the definition stated above that the Scottish Government recognises domestic violence as encompassing a broad range of actions and behaviours that can include emotional, psychological, sexual and physical abuse, as well as threats of such acts, coercion and constraints. Although domestic abuse is generally perceived to be something that is enacted on women and girls by men that are already known to them in some way, while this is indeed true in the majority of cases reported (Scottish Government, 2011) the problem of gendered-based violence extends beyond domestic abuse and includes any form of violence against women, whether occurring in public or private life, and is not limited to events where there is, or has been an intimate partner relationship between the perpetrator and victim (Humphreys, Houghton & Ellis, 2008).

In recognising the definition, it is important to note that while there is no denying or minimising the fact that women may use violence against men, research evidence shows that perpetrators are however overwhelmingly male and its victims are almost always female (Ellis, 2008) and in contrast to male violence perpetrated against women, in the vast majority of cases, men who experience this type of abuse, are isolated, stand-alone incidents (Walby & Allen, 2004) and we know from population survey’s that men are typically less likely to be harmed physically and do not report living in fear of their partner (Walby & Allen, 2004). Thus, while violence against men is not denied, it is the violence perpetrated by men against women that will be the focus of this paper.

### 1.3: Scale of the problem

Gender-based violence is an essential area of study as statistics tells us that between 1 in 3 and 1 in 5 women will experience domestic abuse at some point in their lifetime (Council of Europe, 2002). In the United Kingdom, there are an estimated 500,000 incidents of domestic violence in any given year (Walby, 2004). Tragically, on average 2 women each week across Britain are murdered by their partners or ex partners, accounting for an astonishing 35 per cent of all violent murders (Maguire, Morgan & Reiner, 2007). At a more local level, statistics have shown that in the year 2009-2010 there were 51, 926 incidence of domestic abuse reported to the police in Scotland. In 82 per cent of these cases the abuse was perpetrated by males against female victims (Scottish Government, 2010).

Due to its sensitive nature, gender based violence tends to be a 'hidden' phenomenon resulting in a vast underestimation of the real scale and impact of harm caused to victims (World health Organisation, 2010). The reasons cited for this vary and include embarrassment and fear or unwillingness to be involvement in the criminal justice system. What is more, many women experience this type of abuse but do not necessarily constitute it as a crime or an offence and therefore do not report it to the police. Also, estimates vary depending on the measures used and changing definitions in particular constitute a significant problem (Mears, 2003). Yet, as stark as these figures are, the general consensus is, that there is more of a tendency to under report, than over-report the scale and magnitude of violence against women (Mears, 2003)

#### 1.4: Consequences

Although the long term effects of gender-based violence are difficult to assess, considerable research has shown that victims of this type of abuse experience increased levels of depression, lower self-esteem, and higher levels of psychological distress when compared to women who are not involved in violent relationships (World Health Organisation, 2010). And according to the literature, battered women compared to non-battered women are more likely to suffer from eating disorders and attempt suicide. Further research has shown that female victims of violence, in England and Wales are up to 15 times more likely to misuse alcohol and 9 times more likely to abuse illegal drugs than women who are not victims of violence (Women's Aid, 2008). While it is out of the scope of this thesis to elaborate in greater detail about the impact this has on children living with violence, there is expansive research evidence documenting a strong link between domestic violence and the consequences this has on the wellbeing of children who grow up in violent homes. For example, according to the research literature, children are typically more likely to exhibit increased rates of behavioural, cognitive, emotional, and social development problems through the exposure of domestic abuse (World Health Organisation, 2010). Therefore it must be recognised that gendered violence can and does have negative consequences for young family members.

Added to the serious human cost of violence on women and families, there are also enormous social and economic costs for the broader community and society at large. The cost of violence against women to the economy has been estimated to exceed 20 billion each year in the United Kingdom (Walby, 2004) which includes health related costs, criminal and civil justice costs and social service and housing costs (Walby, 2004). For instance, many women as a direct result of violence perpetrated by men find themselves homeless, costing an estimated £160 billion a year for expenditure on emergency housing and housing benefit for victims and their families (Women's Aid, 2008).

What is more, according to Women's Aid, the health and physical impact of violence on victims reportedly costs the NHS an additional 176 million a year. This is an estimated 3 per cent of the total NHS budget being used to treat domestic violence victims (Walby, 2004). And finally, violence against women can impact greatly on an individual's working life. For example, it has been reported that 20 per cent of women who were in employment at the time of sustaining abuse had to take time off due to the health burdens caused by the abuse (Walby & Allen, 2004). The United Nations Fund for Women (UNIFEM) sums this up by stating that, by compromising their health, safety and well-being, victims of gendered based violence, "cannot lend their labour or creative ideas fully if they are burdened with the physical and psychological scars of abuse" (Carrillo, 1992).

### 1.5: Policy Context

The serious consequences of gender based violence on victims as well as the economy has meant that over the past 30 years significant changes within UK government and international and national policy have been made to address violence against women; in particular, sexual and intimate partner violence. In the 1993 United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Violence against Women (CEDAW) gendered violence was recognised as a fundamental infringement of human rights and became a major topic at the Global Platform for Action adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995 (Mactczak, Hatzidimitriadou Lindsay, 2001). The CEDAW declaration made clear that it understood gendered violence to fall within the realm of discrimination against women on which all countries party to the convention are expected to take the necessary steps to eliminate the problem (Kelly & Sen, 2007)

After signing the Optional protocol to CEDAW in 2004 (Kelly et al, 2007) Government institutions in the United Kingdom increased the priority given to issue of violence against women and began formulating policy recommendations in line with strategic objectives set out in the CEDAW and the Beijing platform for Action. In 2005 domestic violence policy in England, published the National Domestic Violence Delivery Plan, which introduced a range of policy initiatives, primarily in the criminal justice discourse. Strategies were based on the reduction of the prevalence of gendered violence, protection and justice as well as expanding provisions to support and protect victims. These included, professional training initiatives for police officers and prosecutors; specialised domestic violence courts; independent domestic violence advisers; and specialised and tailored treatment programmes for offenders (Mactczak et al, 2001).

It is well documented that the criminal justice system is a vital resource for victims of violence and must continue to be devised and implemented in order to support the wellbeing of female victims. However, criminal justice policy approaches, are on the face of it, limited to what they can hope to achieve in addressing gendered based violence. Scholar Johnson highlights two notable shortcomings within the criminal justice framework. Firstly, those offenders who are brought before the criminal justice system (and many are not) “are least amenable to change due to a history of violence” (Snider, 1998 as cited in Johnson, 1996: 71). And secondly, the effectiveness of charging and prosecuting perpetrators and treatment programmes for abusers, “in stopping violence has not been demonstrated conclusively and may even result in increased violence in some cases” (Johnson, 1996: 71).



In relation to prevention, a criminal justice framework alone cannot address the complex dynamics of gendered violence as the problem often presents itself in multifaceted ways. What is more, prevention efforts have typically focused on ‘risk avoidance’ or ‘individualised safety management’ for women and girls (Katz, 2006). These are problematic for a number of reasons. Firstly, giving risk avoidance messages in violence prevention continues to make women responsible for their own safety (Katz, 2006). Effectively, this excludes any sense of responsibility for preventing sexual violence from men and boys or, indeed the broader community (Powell, 2011). And secondly, using risk avoidance messages in gender-based violence prevention fails to take into consideration that in most cases, women are involved in an intimate relationships with or are an acquaintance of the person who perpetrates this violence towards them (Katz, 2006).

The Scottish Government has long been recognised as being at the international forefront of work to tackle gender-based abuse; particularly domestic abuse and has had a National Strategy on Domestic Abuse since 2000 (Scottish Executive, 2002). In more recent years, demonstrating a continuing commitment to tackling violence against women, the Scottish Government has integrated initiatives in line with the Gender Equality Duty (GED, 2007) which places a duty on all public bodies to have due regard to eliminating discrimination and promoting equality between the sexes (Scottish Executive, 2003).

The Scottish Executive, in a document entitled ‘*Preventing domestic Abuse-A national Strategy*’ sets out a clear and articulated policy framework for intervention as well as a focus for multi-agency activities and partnership working towards the long term goal of eliminating violence against women (Scottish Executive, 2003). Along with subsequent Government publications such as *Safer Lives: Changed Lives: A Shared Approach to Tackling Violence against Women in Scotland*” and “*The National Domestic Abuse Delivery Plan for Children and Young People*” gendered-based violence intervention are divided into four strategies -

prevention, protection of victims, provision of services and the participation of all agencies to ensure policy and practice developments around domestic abuse is informed by those who use the services (National Strategy, 2000). While all four of these divisions are recognised as playing a key role in ending violence against women, since the long term aim is to achieve changes in attitudes and behaviours in individuals and in society as a whole , it is the prevention element that is considered to be most significant (Scottish Executive, 2003).

Scottish policy has endorsed the World Health Organisation framework which utilises a public health approach to gendered violence (World Health Organisation). The public health approach relies upon the use of population-based data on incidents and prevalence to describe the problem, its impact and to identify both associated risk and protective factors. This data is then statistically analysed for any association between characteristics or life circumstances which are considered factors in causing or helping to reduce violence (Ellis, 2008). The evidence is then used as a means of drawing up interventions aimed at either reducing associated risk factors or increasing protective factors (Ellis, 2008)

Within a public health model, prevention strategies are recognised as a two- level structure; primary prevention: those that take place to stop violence from occurring in the first instance and are aimed at challenging social attitudes and behaviours, values and structures that sustain inequality and violence (Ellis, 2008). These are aimed at the wider population and typically take the form of both public and school based education (Ellis et al, 2008) and aspire to make significant changes to large numbers of the population. Secondary prevention, focus more on the immediate response after the violent action has already taken place and are generally in the context of support services for victims and treatment programmes for perpetrators (Ellis, 2008).

Adopting a public health approach as a means to eliminating domestic abuse is, according to some, problematic. While it is true that violence against women can often have serious health implications for victims of this type of abuse, it is argued that these cannot be explained in the same way as typical health and medical problems which fit with the public health framework more generally (Ellis et al, 2008). Therefore, it has been suggested that adopting a human rights discourse to gendered violence where emphasises is placed on attaining values of respect, equality and social justice may be a more suitable approach. According to Ellis (2008) the human rights framework to domestic abuse is far more relevant and consistent with current Scottish government policy and national legislation.

A further critique of the public health approach to domestic abuse is centred on the blurred distinction of primary and secondary prevention (Powell, 2011). While primary prevention efforts are intended to achieve changes in individual attitudes and behaviours through the long term, as previously mentioned in the majority of cases individuals have already perpetrated violence or indeed experienced violence in some way, and thus prevention comes after the event has already taken place (Carmody, Krogh, Flood, Heenan & Ovenden, 2009).

While there is significant diversity of best practice amongst the plethora of existing prevention approaches (and with the majority of resources traditionally directed at secondary prevention) it has become increasingly clear that in order for prevention programmes to adequately and successfully challenge negative attitudes and behaviours which accept violence against women as the norm, further consideration must be given to primary prevention efforts. The Scottish Government stipulate in the National Strategy that it perceives gendered based violence to be the result of “continuing unequal power relations between men and women, and a barrier for achieving equality” (National Strategy, 2000). Yet, in spite of an increased commitment from Government policy in addressing the issue of

gendered violence, most prevention efforts have, according to the literature, lacked theoretical clarity.

### 1.6: Underpinning theories

Due to the complexity of the issue, identifying the underlying causes of gendered violence is difficult to assess and there are many, competing and sometimes overlapping theories that exist to explain the problem. However, most theories cited in the criminological literature share some common understanding that can serve as a foundation for any successful prevention initiative, namely that violence against women is not inevitable; it can be identified and prevented and that its causes and causal relationships are in some way a learned behaviour.

#### The social learning theory

Men commit the majority of violent crime, yet the majority of men do not engage in violent behaviour (flood, 2001). Likewise, gender-based violence is not entirely universal. It is a social problem that occurs in most cultures, but there are exceptions and there are cultures where violence against women is exceedingly rare (Heiss, 1995, as cited in flood, 2011). This would, allow then for an adequate assumption that gender-based violence is the product of society rather than any inherited biological determinism. One of the most popular sociological theories to explain these series of events is the social learning theory.

When applied to the family, the social learning theory, more often termed the intergenerational transmission hypothesis, posits the view that the environment in which boys are socialised is a significant causal factor in gendered violence. Albert Bandura (1997), in

particular, proposed a social learning theory that focuses on externalised aggressive behaviour and how it can be implanted by roots of observational learning. According to Bandura, in one's environment behaviours are learned and modelled through observing the behaviour of significant others, namely, parents, caregivers, and older siblings and then these patterns of behaviour, even unfavourable ones become ingrained and replicated in adulthood as a legitimate means of reasserting authority (Humphreys & Stanley 2006).

The social learning theory goes on to explain further that, children who are exposed to violence in their family of origin are more likely to adopt similar behaviour when they learn that violent is an appropriate tactic for achieving desired results, particularly when it accomplishes positive results without drawing negative sanctions (Humphreys et al, 2006). Violence then becomes a legitimate method of resolving conflict which is transmitted from one family generation to the next. According to Gelles (1972) "Not only does the family expose individuals to violence and techniques of violence, the family teach approval of the use of violence" (1972:21). These positive results may include perceived status for the assailant, deference from victims and control within the family household (Lawson, 2012).

The intergenerational transmission of violence has been used extensively in the domestic violence literature to explain the continuity of violence, and there is considerable research evidence supporting this hypothesis. For example, an American study reported high levels of childhood experience of or exposure to violence amongst prisoner population in general, and specifically among the portion of prisoners that were violent to family members (Dutton & Hart, 1993). What is more, findings from The National Family Violence Survey (Straus, 1990a), showed that males and females, who had witnessed their parents being violent

growing up, were three times more likely to use violence towards their own spouse than those who did not witness violence in their family of origin (Cunningham, Jaffe, Baker, Dick, Malla, Mazaheri & Poisson, 1998).

While the theory that 'violence begets violence' has, and continues to receive widespread endorsement, in academic circles, despite a growing number of empirical studies supporting this theory, there are a number of researchers who have raised questions over its validity. Kaufman & Zeigler (1987) for example, reviewed the research that tested this theory and found that the rate of intergenerational transmission appears to be only 30 per cent (plus or minus 5 per cent). Thus, while this is indeed a significant number, it implies that two thirds of individuals who are exposed to violence as children do not go on to perpetrate violence (Kaufman & Zeigler, 1987). Conversely, the social learning in isolation from other theories does not explain why the intergenerational transmission of violence is not universal, or indeed account for the fact that there are a significant number of persons who are abusive adults but have not grown up in violent homes (Kaufman & Zeigler, 1987). And significantly, this theory cannot account for the gendered nature of this type of violence.

### Feminists approach

Feminist theorists have long maintained that male violence against women can be explained as a manifestation of wider gender inequalities, masculinities and the practice of patriarchy at multiple levels of the social order (Connell, 1987). Feminist theory is arguably the most dominant model for explaining male violence against women and is the theory currently used in Scottish government policy on domestic abuse:

*Domestic abuse is associated with broader gender inequality, and should be understood in its historical context, whereby societies have given greater status, wealth, influence, control and power to men. It is part of a range of behaviours constituting male abuse of power, and is linked to other forms of male violence’* (Scottish Executive, 2003: 30).

This school of thought stems from the belief that women maintain a subordinate position through the gender power differences and inequalities that exist within a social system that ensures and perpetrates the domination of men (Cunningham et al, 1998) and feminist theories tend to look at the historical roots of these inequalities to explain the deeply ingrained power imbalance that exists in contemporary society. Historically, traditions justified and legalised the rights of men to control and chastise their intimate partner with physical force, if it was in the confinement of their own home. For example, under the doctrine of *Coverture* husbands had the right to beat his wife with a stick “no thicker than his thumb” (Hasselt, Morrison, Bellack & Hersen, 1988: 140). What is more, legal rights relating to property and inheritance, divorce and child custody maintained and reinforced male privilege (Cunningham et al, 1998).

Indeed, up until the 1980s laws relating to domestic violence were absent and violence against women in the marital home was frequently seen as a private matter, whereby police and prosecutors more often than not avoided or trivialised domestic abuse and rape as “a natural expression of male authority” (Hasselt et al, 1988: 280). And it should be remembered that it is only recently that we have had a significant change in the legal status of women; rape within marriage has only been recognised as an act of crime in Scotland since 1989 (Women’s Aid, 2008).

The extent of patriarchy and rigid hyper- masculine gender roles can be seen to exist within virtually every facet of primary institutions in contemporary society (Cunningham et al, 1998), from the law through to health and education, on the macro level, to the structures of the nuclear family on the micro level (Cunningham et al, 1998). At the level of the immediate context, in which gendered violence takes place, particularly, families and intimate partner relationships (Flood, 2001), constructed views of masculinity and femininity are used as a means of reinforcing and justifying this violent behaviour, and that domestic abuse, for example, can be understood to be an expression of male power that is used by men to reproduce and maintain superiority and authority within patriarchal marriage (Adler, 1992). Research across cultures has revealed that a man who controls the economic and decision-making process in the household is one of the strongest predictors of society's high levels of violence against women (Heise, 1998 as cited in Flood, 2001).

It is further argued that patriarchal structures reinforce traditional gender roles attitudes which apply pressure on men and boys to conform to societal constructions of male expectations; males are often required to be physical, 'macho' and to be the authority figure within their family environment (Connelly, 1987). Thus it is argued that violence perpetrated towards women is an expression of the wider external pressures to conform to societal expectations. Scholars Dobash and Dobash (1979) for instance argue, that men who are violent towards women are "living up to cultural prescriptions that are cherished in Western society- aggressiveness, male dominance and female subordination- and they are using physical force as a means to enforce that dominance" (1979: 24)



Indeed, the theory that patriarchy and constructed view of masculinity, contributes to violence against women is certainly supported by research evidence. Several studies have shown that men who adhered to patriarchal, and/or rigid gender norms are more likely to use violence towards women. American based research among convicted sex offenders and college students have found that sexually violent men hold hyper masculine views about gender role privilege (flood, 2001). Likewise, a small qualitative research study carried out with 30 young Canadian men who belonged to violent peer groups or gangs has shown that men who hold patriarchal authoritarian attitudes about family and gender were most likely to practice physical, sexual and emotional violence in their intimate partner relationships (Totten, 2003).

Recognising gendered violence to be a consequence of the patriarchal structures of society, and gender role expectations importantly brings a critical focus to the fact that the wider culture plays a significant role in sustaining violence against women. Indeed, while there have been some significant social changes in recent decades, men and boys continue to be brought up in and socialised into a deeply ingrained misogynistic and male dominated culture (Katz, 2006) whereby exercising their power and control over women is perceived as being a gender privilege. Therefore, any prevention intervention aimed at tackling the deep rooted issue must incorporate strategies that foster major social and cultural change if there is any hope of violence against women being eliminated.

## The Mass Media

It is clear from the literature so far that, attitudes and beliefs tolerant of violence against women exist at the level of individuals, families and the broader society. Expanding on this is the idea that the mass media reflects and reinforces socially constructed views about gender, in particular its normalization of negative stereotypical attitudes about women. Walby and Allen (2004) for example, argue that the stigmatisation of women and girls in the mass media tends to glorify and even condone hostile and aggressive behaviours creating a ‘women blaming’ and ‘rape myth’ culture. A study into young people’s attitudes about gendered violence seems to support this view. An in-depth study involving 1395 young people aged 14 to 18, found that one third of young men and one sixth of young women who took part condoned violence in intimate relationships under certain circumstances (Burman & Cartmel, 2005). Furthermore, a recent review conducted by the Home Office, reported that 36 per cent of people believed that a woman should be held partly, if not fully responsible for being sexually assaulted or raped if she had been drinking (Papadopoulos, 2010). The same report further reported that 26 per cent of young people believed a female should be held wholly or partly responsible if she had been wearing provocative clothing (Papadopoulos, 2010).

The idea that the mass media’s sexualisation of women and young girls minimise and even normalise aggressive behaviours is a view supported by the UK Government. In 2011 the Government commissioned a review into the sexualisation of young people and found “a clear link between consumption of sexualised images, a tendency to view women as objects and the acceptance of aggressive attitudes and behaviours as the norm” (Zero Tolerance/YWCA Scotland, 2012: 3). The same review concluded that frequent exposure to

stereotypical ideas is a contributing factor in violence against women (Zero Tolerance/YWCA Scotland, 2012).

### Summary

It is clear then from a critical analysis of the theory derived literature on gender-based violence that the problem is the result of a complex interplay of personal, situational and sociocultural factors which help create and maintain power imbalances between men and women and gender role expectations (Flood, 2011). As such efforts to end violence against women remain a complex and challenging task and one that cannot be expected to happen overnight. However, if there is any hope of eliminating violence perpetrated towards women in the long term, prevention efforts must aim to achieve change in attitudes at the individual level. While it is important that strategies continue to focus on secondary prevention methods, they must also incorporate methodologies that address community and societal norms, traditional gender role beliefs as well as structural relations and social practices that contribute to male violence against women (Flood, 2011).

### 1.7: Methods of Intervention

Ever since Scottish government policy has made tackling gender based violence a national priority, there has been a plethora of intervention measures made available under the rubric of ‘preventing violence against women’. The Scottish government, for example, has invested in a number of comprehensive public campaigns such as ‘Zero Tolerance’ and more recently ‘Dolls House’ (Scottish Executive, 2009) which use, billboards, leaflets, newspapers and TV marketing channels in order to raise awareness about the nature and prevalence of gender violence in the hope of changing attitudes which condone and tolerate violence against women (National Strategy, 2000). Although this does mark a significant shift within Scottish government policy in that, efforts are being made to raise awareness by mobilising the wider community to take action to stop violence against women it is unlikely that public awareness campaigns alone will result in significant behavioural change.

#### Early Intervention

There is broad agreement in both international and national literature that any prevention method that hopes to address adequately and successfully the attitudes and behaviours that give rise to gender-based violence, then efforts must firstly incorporate an early intervention approach to the problem. One method in particular that has gained considerable momentum over the years, in both national and local government policy is the idea of working with children and young people within the context of school-based education.

Indeed, the rationale for working with the general population of children and young people in schools is plentiful. As an analysis of the theory-derived literature shows, many children and young people are exposed to and influenced by violence in relationships and families. According to one estimate between 27 and 60 per cent of school-aged children experience domestic abuse in some form (Children and Young People's Unit 2001). What is more, the justification for working with children and young people is further strengthened by the research evidence showing that violence-supportive attitudes and behaviours are already visible amongst these particular age groups, with some children and young people even experiencing violence in their own dating relationships. According to a recent study conducted by the NSPCC, one third of girls aged between thirteen and seventeen have experienced unwanted sexual acts within a relationship (Papadopoulos, 2010) and one quarter have been victims of some form of physical violence (Barter et al, 2009).

In light of the research evidence, the social learning theory provides a useful rationale for an early intervention school based approach, as it suggests that, since all behaviours are learned, then, according to scholars Humphrey and Stanley (2006), "desirable ones can be acquired in the right environment or undesirable ones can be un/ re learned" (2006: 70). What is more, developmentally, adolescence is a critical time period to intervene, because not only is it a time frame when young people are first venturing into intimate partner relationships but it is also an age where there is considerable pressure to conform to peer group norms and cultural expectations (Katz, 2006). Thus, school based early intervention programmes provide a unique opportunity to access a large number of target audiences whereby instilling attitudes and behaviours favourable to non-violence can be promoted and embedded within an environment that is potentially less stigmatising. The school environment further offers an

opportunity in which teachers are ideally positioned to identify and support children, who may already be experiencing violence (Ellis et al, 2008).

### School-based application

While there are a number of school-based intervention programmes in existence in Scotland, up to the present time, no rigorous evaluation of these programmes has been conducted and therefore it is difficult to assess the impact these programmes might have on violence prevention. However, according to the literature on school-based intervention there is a general agreement that key considerations must be employed if such an approach is to be effective in changing attitudes and behaviours in the long term.

Despite feminist research providing a comprehensive and credible account of the causes and consequences of gendered violence, much of the existing school-based programmes are, however, theoretically inconsistent with feminist understanding of the problem. The majority of existing school-based programmes, adopt a gender-neutral approach and often focus heavily on individualistic cognitive-behavioural methods, instead of (or as well as) addressing the social and cultural knowledge, practices and processes that foster men and boys' violence (Humphreys et al, 2006). Therefore, in order for programmes to be delivered effectively, it is crucial that topics on gender equality, gender stereotyping and gender roles are addressed accordingly (Ellis, 2008).

One further critique of existing school- based programmes is that there is a tendency to focus heavily upon preventing attitudes and behaviours that support a culture of violence, rather than on promoting and instilling positive attitudes towards women and girls (Ellis, 2004). Yet, according to Schewe (2002) this approach is in fact counter-productive as research has shown that, conflictingly, it is in fact far more effective and sustainable for programmes to focus on instilling and promoting desirable conduct.

### The curriculum

In order to maximise the effectiveness of violence prevention programmes within the school setting, there is a general consensus surrounding the relevant literature of the need to ensure that the programme is fully embedded within the curricula, rather than being delivered on a one-time bases which is typical of some existing programmes. Hester and Westmarland state that “the long term impact of programmes on violence reduction is likely to depend on the extent to which the issues are embedded within the curriculum and wider school activities” (2005:17). Such a comprehensive approach would allow for a greater impact on creating a non-violent school climate while further presenting an opportunity for active leadership to promote positive values and respect (Dusenbury, Falco, Brannigan & Bosworth, 1997).

### Summary

It is clear from the research evidence that early interventions are deemed essential in order to address the root causes of violence against women and a school based intervention approach in particular, if done well, has a distinct advantage as a site to respond proactively to the problem of gendered violence. The school setting not only offers a unique opportunity to

raise awareness about the complex dynamics that foster violence against women but has the further advantage of preventing violence from occurring in the first instance. However, drawing upon the research literature it is clear that any educational programme that hopes to succeed in prevention violence in the long term must first and foremost fully incorporate an appropriate theoretical framework for understanding gendered violence and at the same time, work towards promoting and instilling positive attitudes and behaviours as opposed to discouraging unfavourable ones.

### 1.8: Bystander Approach

One violence prevention innovation that has gained considerable momentum over the years and one that indeed works to promote positive behaviours and values is the bystander-focused approach to prevention. Gender-based violent prevention efforts have typically focused on the crude binary model; women and girls are victims or potential victims, and men and boys are perpetrators or potential perpetrators (Katz, 2006). This narrow approach is problematic for a number of reasons. Targeting all men as perpetrators can lead to men inevitably becoming defensive as they feel they are being blamed for the violent actions of 'other' men. This might lead to men becoming disinterested on the basis that they feel this type of intervention is not relevant to them since they themselves do not perpetrate violence against women (Katz, Heisterkamp & Flemming, 2011). The bystander approach is one of a few primary violence prevention programmes that transcend the limitations of the perpetrator-victim binary. It works to give all community members a sense of responsibility and empowerment to actively intervene in potentially violent or disrespectful conduct.



## History

While bystander prevention approaches aimed at violence against women are still in their infancy, the influence of the bystander on criminal activity more generally have been informed by decades of social psychology research that has evaluated the conditions impacting upon the likelihood that an individual witnessing a crime- a bystander- will take action to intervene in the event of an emergency (Powell, 2011). The most widely endorsed bystander framework comes from the work of scholars Latane and Darley (1969) who identified a five stage model of the processes bystanders must negotiate beforehand (Cassey & Ohler, 2011). First, bystanders must notice that a problematic situation exists. Secondly, they must recognise that the problem is an emergency and is likely to have negative consequence for victims. Thirdly, bystanders are more likely to act if they have made a commitment to intervene, and therefore assume partial responsibility for addressing the problem. Fourthly, bystanders are more likely to get involved if they do not see the victim as somehow being responsible for the incident. Finally, bystanders then must decide how they are going to intervene- directly or indirectly- and negotiate whether they have the necessary skills to do so (Latané and Darley, 1969).

Progress towards taking action at all of these stages can be significantly hindered if there are multiple bystanders as this can reduce the responsibility felt by a single person and therefore lessens the likelihood he or she will intervene. What is more, multiple bystanders' decreases the likelihood of persons intervening as it may be assumed someone else is taking appropriate action and therefore alleviates them personally from any responsibility. This process known as the 'bystander effect' (Casey & Ohler, 2011) has been demonstrated across a variety of emergency situations; the most high profile being the rape and murder of Kitty Genovese in 1964. The case sparked widespread academic interest in the field of social psychology, as it

was reported that despite 38 neighbours witnessing or overhearing her cries for help; no-one called the police or intervened to help (Katz et al, 2011).

### Bystander approach to gendered violence

The philosophies underlying the bystander focused approach has recently been applied to the field of gendered based violence prevention and has been utilised by the Mentors in Violence Prevention (MVP) project. The definition of a bystander has several connotations, and depending on the academic field, can mean, someone who witnesses a crime and does nothing about it, conversely, someone who is victimised themselves (an ‘innocent bystander’). The MVP project adopt a much broader definition of the bystander and includes; essentially anyone who is present when an act of violence or any other similar unacceptable behaviour takes place but is neither the victim nor the perpetrator. Similarly, the definition of bystander can mean anyone that was not present at the time of a violent or abusive incident but is a member of a peer culture and therefore has some kind of relationship with others who might be perpetrators or victims. This can be a friend, a member of the family, a team mate, a classmate or indeed someone who they might work with (Katz et al, 2011).

The bystander approach to preventing violence against women, works to encourage positive attitudes and behaviours in young people with the intention of these positive values then being used to empower individuals to challenge and change broader community norms that sustains this type of violence (Banyard, Eckstein & Moynihan, 2009). The bystander programme educates individuals about gendered violence in order to ensure that they are able to recognise potential problematic situations in which the intervention of a pro-social

bystander may be required. Utilising the work of Latane and Darley, a core element of the bystander focused programme is to equip individuals with the necessary skills in order for individuals to confidently speak up in the face of violent, coercive and disrespectful behaviour but to do so safely (Banyard, Plante, & Moynihan, 2004).

Although still evolving in the field of gender-based abuse, the bystander approach has gained considerable academic support in recent years for its ability to provide all community members with a supportive, tangible role in preventing violence against women and for its potential to help shift cultural practices and ideologies that sustain this type of violence (Casey et al, 2011). As scholars Banyard et al (2004) state, the bystander approach has the “capacity to fundamentally shift violence related social norms as more people take a vocal stance against exploitive or misogynistic behaviour” (2004: 64).

While it is true that the bystander prevention framework encourages both men and women to be empowered pro social bystanders, this approach particularly sees the potential in engaging men as potential ‘allies’ in eliminating violence against women and girls. Involving men in this way, helps redefine sexual and intimate partner violence not just as a women’s problem, but an issue of concern shared by both men and women (Katz, 2006). Although men have long been addressed in secondary based interventions as perpetrators (Flood, 2001) the bystander approach addresses men and boys in a way that invites rather than indicts by giving them a positive role to play in stopping violence against women and girls.

One further justification behind utilising men as empowered pro-social bystanders is that men have a much greater influence over social norms and behaviours of their male peers, and given that violence supportive sexist norms and beliefs may be implicitly reinforced in certain male peer cultures, then ultimately this gives men a critical role to play in ending violence against women (Casey et al, 2011). Research has found that the likelihood a man will intervene to prevent violence against women, is profoundly influenced by gendered social norms in his peer culture. According to Berkowitz (2002) men tend to undervalue the extent of which other men are uncomfortable with disrespectful behaviour towards women and suggests that societal misconceptions about what it means to be masculine is likely to prevent men from being an active bystander when faced with inappropriate behaviours from other men. Carlson (2008) for example, found in his research that male “bystanders to sexual assault were more afraid of their masculinity being called into question” (2008:3). Scholars Messerschmidt and O’ Sullivan (2003) further support this view, suggesting that a sexually violent action such as gang-rape can often be seen as an act of male-bonding “where the participant’ and observers desire to be seen as ‘masculine’ by other men is key to understanding men as bystanders to incidents of sexual assault” (2003: 20).

In relation to the underlying causes of gender-based violence, some of which have been discussed in this paper, by offering strategies that seeks to address the role of men in preventing violence against women, the bystander-focused approach is supported by much of the feminist theory. Feminists research on causes of violence against women continually point to the need to challenge societal and community norms that foster violence against women. A key element of the bystander focused approach to gender-based violence is that it aims to alter beliefs in rigid gender norms and peer based social norms, including masculinity (Katz et al, 2011). At an individual level, the empowered bystander approach focuses on

challenging other men's adherence to attitudes and norms supportive of gender-based violence, rather than reinforcing them and therefore has the ability to reduce an overall tolerance towards violence against women.

Again, relating to the wider literature on the causes of violence against women, the bystander approach sits with much of the social learning theory on the issue. As discussed previous the social theory maintains violent behaviour is more probable when it is learned from observing persons that are perceived to have more power and/or status (Foshee, et al, 1998). The bystander approach adopted by the MVP programme utilises a method using "popular opinion leaders" (Katz et al, 2011). This is an approach that makes use of those individuals who are thought to have the most influence over a larger number of their peers. These individuals are then selected to be chief spokesperson to model and promote views that are intolerant of gender-based violence, with the hope of changing attitudes and behaviours in their wider peer groups. Thus, it is hoped that individuals will be encouraged to model positive behaviours and values shown by these leaders in the same way young people are inclined to model negative behaviours and attitudes from family members or other people they look up to.

### Summary

## **Methods**

The aim of this research project is to evaluate the implementation of the Mentors in Violence Prevention programmes in Scotland to date and provide some indication as to whether this particular intervention programme can be successful in preventing violence against women in the long term. Although the MVP project has been implemented in various settings across the USA for over a decade now, the programme remains only at the very early stages in Scotland. For that reason a full evaluation of the extent to which the MVP project has successfully altered attitudes and behaviours towards violence against women is not possible at this present time. The long term sustainability of the MVP project in Scotland can only be made available once a longitudinal study of behavioural change has taken place and therefore the outcome of this is unlikely to be made available for some years to come.

What this research project can aim to do however, at this early stage of implementation, is to explore the theory of change embodied in the MVP and by undertaking an extensive review of the relevant academic literature considers whether or not that theory of change is compatible with tackling the complex problems surrounding gender-based violence. Furthermore, since the success of the MVP programme depends heavily on its applicability then this paper will also undertake an evaluation of the implementation process to date and consider whether, the MVP programme in Scotland has remained true to the original American design. The specific research questions that will be addressed in this project are outlined below.

Research Questions:

1. Is there a clear theory of change embodied in the MVP?

The main aim of this research question is to establish a clear theory of change adopted by the MVP and how the programme intends to make a difference to the problem of gender-based violence. By undertaking an extensive review of the relevant literature, a critical examination of the compatibility of the theory of change adopted is contrasted with the academic literature in order to establish whether there is a strong theoretical basis for the MVP initiative.

2. Has the deployment of the MVP in Scotland remained faithful to the original design?

The aim of this research question is to establish whether or not the MVP programme can be successfully implemented by individuals other than the original Boston-based staff, as well as whether the programme can be effectively adapted into the high school population in Scotland. As such a number of themes will be addressed including, any practical and contextual issues that are at play.

2.1: Qualitative Data

In order to accomplish the research objectives this research utilised a qualitative collection and systematic analysis of literature, documents and data obtained through secondary research. It involved undertaking a library-based research in an attempt to conduct a critical analysis of existing literature on the topic. The secondary data utilised were in the form of a range of books, journal articles and websites related to the subject matter, as well as Home

Office reports which provided relevant and published empirical data as well as up to date Scottish policy and practice on the topic of interest.

Due to the nature of this research project, a qualitative approach was deemed to be more suitable as this particular method provides rich and detailed data about a specific social phenomenon. Rather than producing a large amount of quantifiable data that cannot give any indication as to the significance participants give to their experience of the social world, it was therefore decided that a qualitative approach would be utilised in order to gain a better understanding of respondent's thoughts, feelings and beliefs on this particular topic of interest. Since this research formulates a general set of themes to be addressed the methodological approach adopted was inductive in nature in that a clear hypothesis was not set before the research commenced. Instead, the aim was to develop theoretical insight as they emerge out of the fieldwork (Maguire, 2002). According to Glaser and Strauss (1967) since the aim of the grounded theory method is to discover a theory, data must be collected and analysed concurrently in order for comparisons to be made. Indeed whilst data is never theory neutral, it is important however to set aside one's preconceived theoretical perspective to allow a substantive theory to emerge.

The epistemological position underlying this piece of research is interpretivist in nature. An interpretivist approach is one that emphatically denies that social science can be studied in the same way as the natural sciences. Because human beings attribute meaning to their lives then it is crucial researchers grasp the way in which people make sense of their subject reality and attach meaning to it (King & Wincup, 2008). This understanding of human action is derived from Weber's notion of *Verstehen*; which involves the researcher "appreciating the connection between an action and the meaning it has to the actor" (Bryman, 2008: 364). And finally, the ontology of this research adopts a constructivist approach in that the social world is regarded as something that human beings are in the process of fashioning-social entities



should be considered social constructions built up from the perceptions and actions of social actors (King et al, 2008).

## 2.2: Data Collection

The primary research carried out for this project was in the form of a semi-structured interview. This method was considered the most effective way of obtaining data as a semi structured interview accommodates flexibility which allows specific issues to be addressed but at the same time allows the respondents to answer freely without being confined by a certain set of answers. The flexibility of the semi-structured interview further allows the researcher to follow up relevant lines of inquiry mid interview in response to unanticipated leads. Therefore six standard interview questions were used to obtain general information about the topic of interest, followed by a number of tailored prompts to elicit deeper narratives about respondents' experiences. The interviews ranged from 40 to 60 minutes in length. 7 respondents were interviewed in person at various locations. Two were interviewed by telephone due to geographical locations. All interviews were audio recorded as this allowed the researcher to be 'on high alert to what was being said- it is best he or she is not distracted by having to concentrate on getting down notes on what is said' (Hagen, 2000: 184). Audio recording were then repeatedly replayed in order for any relevant quotes initially missed to be identified and included in the data.

## Participants

The Violence Reduction Unit at Strathclyde police were invaluable in providing contact information for potential participants who were directly involved in the training of the MVP project and because of this, it was made possible to locate key individuals that were instrumental to this research project. Furthermore, the credibility in working in collaboration with the VRU meant that respondents were enthusiastic and obliging when approached about taking part in this research. Respondent's role in the implementation of the MVP training varied; one of the respondents was responsible for bringing the MVP to Scotland and developing the project within the high school setting. Five of the respondents who took part in the MVP training are involved in community youth work at various settings throughout central Scotland. Two respondents hold senior positions within the schools involved in the project and are therefore directly involved in coordinating the MVP project within the high school setting.

### 2.3: Advantages and disadvantages

The main advantages of using semi-structured interviews is that they enable the interviewer to “follow up and probe responses, motives and feelings” (Jupp, 2006: 157), thus, giving ‘some latitude to ask further questions in response to what are seen as significant replies’ (Bryman, 2004: 113). Also, the personal nature of face to face interviewing has the further advantage of recording physical cues, such as facial expressions and hand gestures which can “enrich the qualitative aspect of the data” (Jupp, 2006: 157). As Bell (2005) notes,

questionnaire responses have to be taken at face value, but a response in an interview can be developed and clarified.

Despite the advantageous features of the semi-structured interview, there are limitations to any form of sociological research, and the method chosen for this project is no exception. Interviewee bias may cause distorted findings. As the VRU provided the contact details of potential interviewees there was the potential risk that respondents may be involved in a dependent relationship. This may have resulted in respondents providing certain answers to the interview questions in order to influence a preferred outcome. However, the fact that all respondents were contacted independently and the fact that their decision to take part in the research was entirely their own choice and was not determined by the VRU diminished any concerns in relation to interview bias.

More general disadvantages of the interview are that they can be very time consuming and costly and for that reason, selected key quotations were noted down rather than transcribing the interviews in full in order to eliminate that problem as much as possible. One further limitation of this research method is that the success of the research carried out may be limited by the relatively small number of respondents involved. While it may have been advantageous to interview the MVP programmes peer mentors, due to time constraints and ethical concerns relating to interviewing persons 18 years and younger, this was made impossible.

#### 2.4: Ethical Considerations

Throughout the process of collecting data from the semi-structured interviews, crucial guidelines set out by the code of ethics for research in the field of social science had to be taken into consideration and these requirements were rigorously adhered to and at no stage of this research were ethical constraints breached. Following approval from the university committee, all seven adult respondents each received a participant information sheet which set clear instructions on what would be entailed on agreeing to take part in this research (see appendix A). Once respondents had been informed of all the details and fully understood the purpose of the research, consent was sought via a consent form (see appendix B) before the interview commenced. All respondents' remain anonymous in order to protect the respondents' identity.

#### 2.5: Alternative method

The use of questionnaires was briefly considered for this project as this type of method may have enhanced the findings of the research by allowing a larger number of questions being asked to a greater number of people, which could be more easily generalised and analysed (Bryman, 2012). What is more, questionnaires limit the likelihood of bias responses, and are generally less time consuming. However, response rates were a particular factor on not choosing this type of research method, as there are no guarantees that participants would complete the questionnaire on time, or indeed return it at all.

## Summary

The qualitative approach used was deemed more appropriate for this research because despite the drawbacks mentioned earlier, semi-structured interviews could be designed in such a way as to generate a better understanding of the reasoning behind respondents thoughts and beliefs on this particular subject and gain a better insight into why the MVP specifically may be able to succeed over other initiatives in reducing violence against women. Such an in depth interrogation would not have been possible with other research methods such as questionnaires.

## **Results and discussions**

This chapter explores the findings of the qualitative interviews conducted with those involved in Violence Prevention programme. The data gathered from the interviews will also be discussed in relation to the wider academic literature on gender-based violence critically examined in Chapter One of this paper.

### **3.1 Research Question One: Is there a clear theory of change embodied in the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme?**

In order for this research question to be accurately interrogated it was important to first find out what the interviewees themselves considered to be the main underpinning cause(s) of violence against women.

#### **Causes of gendered violence**

*“Socialisation of men and boys”* (Shaun Cuavin, Shell Twilight Basketball Manager)

In response to this question the most cited reason given by the interviewees was that they believed it was the way in which men and boys are socialised. When asked the question about the main cause(s) of gendered violence, one respondent stated that he believe that it was the culture in which men are brought up that shapes their attitudes towards women, stating that

*'Men are not born violent they become violent as a result of beliefs and norms about what it means to be a man and a women'* (Gavin Grosby, Edinburgh City Council). This understanding of gendered violence was reiterated by a number of other participants who claimed that men are taught that they are entitled to certain privileges over women. When asked about the causes of gendered violence on interviewee stated; *"power, a sense of privileged entitlement and the way men and boys are socialised"* (Graham Goulden, VRU). One further respondent stated: *"It is a societal problem it is now common place to see huge disrespect for women"* (Shaun Cauvin, Youth Community worker). Again, one interviewee stated; *"the socialisation of men, women are viewed as men's property"* (Alan Heisterkamp, Waitt Institute)

*'Constructs of Masculinity'* (Gavin Grosby, Edinburgh City Council)

While the socialisation process was the most consistently cited response given on the cause of gendered violence, it was mentioned on numerous occasions that traditional constructs of masculinity and manhood was perceived to be a contributing factor. One participant stated; *"The pressure to conform to gender stereotypes is huge for men"* (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council). One further interviewee claimed *"The way in which men are supposed to behave and the specific roles they are expected to fill is huge pressure"* (Rachel Barr, Youth Worker, Portobello High School). This interviewee went on to state that *"I mean men are not meant to be emotional or affectionate; they need to be seen as the big man"* (Shaun Cuavin, Shell Twilight Basketball Manager). The notion that there are social pressures to abide by gender norms was echoed by the response of two other interviewees, where it was emphasised that if men are not seen to fit these stereotypical views of masculinity then they

are likely to be seen by other men and women as being *“feminine, weak or gay”* (Graham Goulden, VRU).

*“Media defines our culture of violence”* (Graham Goulden, VRU)

It was made evident from the research findings that the mass media is seen as having a significant role to play in teaching violence- supportive attitudes, especially amongst the younger generation. One participant stated that; *“the sexualisation of women is a massive issue and as a society, tolerance to what is perceived to be acceptable in the media has changed dramatically”* (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council). When probed further the interviewee went on to state that *“increasing we see young girls being exploited by mass media- through films, music videos and lyrics and through magazines-this sends out the wrong message about girls”* (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council). One further interviewee contributed to this viewpoint by stating that the media are responsible for *“Separating men and women even more by glorifying and normalising images of young women in a derogatory fashion”* (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council). One interviewee stated; *“the media do not cause violence against women but supports the messages that do cause violence”* (Alan Heisterkamp, Waitt Institute)

*“Taught behaviour, a learned behaviour”* (Graham Goulden, VRU)

When asked the question on what respondents perceived the causes of violence against women, one further heavily cited response given was that they understood the problem to be a direct result of attitudes and behaviour that are learned from a young age. One interviewee stated that: *‘The most important thing is your upbringing, the way you are brought up and*



*what you see at home, how a mother and father might treat each other. That's how you learn what is acceptable behaviour*" (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School). This concept of learning violent and other forms of disrespectful conduct from one's family life was echoed by a further interviewee who said: *"I work with young boys on a daily basis and they have very hostile attitudes about women. I believe that they learn these from their home environment"* (Shaun Cuavin, Shell Twilight Basketball Manager). One further interviewee claimed *"exposure to violence in the early years and a lack of role model. These children are more likely to be violence in their adult years"* (Graham Goulden, VRU).

Consistency with wider literature:

From the research data gathered so far it is evident that those involved in the MVP programme have an appreciation of the causes of gender-based violence that is consistent with the wider body of literature on the issue critically discussed in Chapter One of this paper. Research participants repeatedly cited the socialisation process of men and boys as being a key contributing factor in men's violence against women. This is strongly illustrated by much of the feminists understanding of the problem, where it was convincingly argued that men's violence against women is a manifestation of the social and institutional systems that subordinate women. The literature review further highlighted that patriarchal structures reinforce the constructed dichotomy of masculinity and femininity (Flood, 2005) again this was echoed by the research participants who clearly understood the misperceptions of gender role expectations, particularly distorted views of masculinity to be a leading factor in men's violence against women.

It was further highlighted in the literature review that pressures to conform to stereotypical gender roles and expectations that maintain violence against women, is supported and

reinforced by the mass media, particularly their proliferation of sexualised imagery of women and girls. Again this is consistent with the causes cited by those involved with the MVP programme, where mass media was repeatedly vocalised as being an influential factor in sustaining violence against women.

While it was made apparent from the research gathered that the main causes of violence against women is recognised as being exasperated by the patriarchal structures that help maintain gender inequality in contemporary society, respondents' appreciation of the problem goes beyond a feminist understanding as it was continually emphasised by the respondents that they perceive the problem of gendered violence to be the result of attitudes and social norms that are learned from the home environment. This view is reflective of the intergenerational hypothesis proposed by the social learning theory. As was critically examined in Chapter One of this paper, there is a growing body of empirical evidence showing a strong correlation between those young persons exposed to violence in the family of origin and this behaviour being replicated in other social settings.

### Method of Intervention

In order to establish a clear theory of change adopted by the MVP it was therefore necessary to gather research data on what those involved in the design and implantation of the programme considered to be the underpinning causes of violence against women. From the research gathered it is evident that those involved in the MVP programme appreciate the causes of violence against women to have multiple and complex dynamics, all of which are consistent with the wider academic literature on the topic. This is significant in that the

integrity of the theory of change adopted relies on it being tailored to tackling these specific and multiple causes. The aim of the next question therefore is to establish a sound understanding of how the theory of change embedded within the MVP manifests in the method of intervention adopted.

As has been highlighted from the data gathered so far, gendered violence is not perceived to be the result of any single causal factor; rather it is a social problem that is recognised as having numerous and varied theoretical underpinnings, each of which contributes something to the causal nexus of violence against women. However, it is evident from the research findings and from the literature review critically analysed in Chapter One, that many of the causes highlighted share some common ground; that negative attitudes and beliefs towards women contribute greatly to the problem of violence against women. This concurrent theme surrounding the issue is strongly reflected in the MVP programme which clearly works on the premise that the gendered violence cannot be addressed without confronting the underlying attitudes and beliefs that condone men's violence against women.

*“Changing attitudes and challenging perception”* (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council)

It was clear from the data gathered from the interviewees that the majority understood the aim of the MVP programme is to create attitude and behavioural changes that are non-supportive of violence against women. One respondent stated that; *“the MVP programme aims to change attitudes and challenge perceptions in young people so that it can have an impact before violence starts”* (Alison Fanning, St. Stephen's High School). One further

respondent stated; “*MVP has a collective solution to changing attitudes that condone gendered violence and is very much in the spirit of youth work*” (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council). This understanding of the MVP design was echoed by one further respondent who stated: “*MVP programme to be unique in that it involves young people in an informed setting and has the ability to reach a large number of people about attitude awareness*” (Rachel Barr, Youth Worker, Portobello High School)

The Bystander-Focused Approach:

The research respondents have clearly articulated that in an effort to reduce the presence of these negative attitudes and beliefs that sustains violence against women, the method adopted by the MVP is firmly based on the empowered bystander framework. It is also clear from the data gathered from research participants that the theory of change adopted relies on the fundamental tenets of the Latane and Darley (1970) model on bystander intervention as an effective tool for tackling attitudes and beliefs that act as a barrier to intervening in potential violent situations. The five step process highlighted by the research data gathered is outline below.

1: *Potential bystanders must notice that a problematic situation exists*

From the research participant’s data it was evident that a specific premise of the MVP programme is to raise awareness and increase young people’s knowledge about what constitutes as violence against women in order to increase the likelihood persons are willing to intervene in a given situation. One participant stated: “*The focus is on proper education so dispelling myths about rape, power and control*” (Alan Heisterkamp, Waitt Institute). This

was reiterated by one other interviewee who stated: *“Increasing young people’s awareness of the seriousness of gender-based violence with the hope of generating change in attitudes”* (Graham Gouldin, VRU). This same respondent went on to explain that; *“MVP is not a lecture and does not aim to point the finger of blame, rather emphasis is on engaging discussions with young people in order to raise awareness about what constitutes abuse towards women”* (Graham. Gouldin VRU).

## *2: Potential bystanders must recognise that the problem is an emergency*

While discussions are placed on the importance of being aware of a problem as a first step of taking action, step two relies on potential bystanders labelling the situation as problematic. According to one interviewee: *“there must be a recognition that the behaviour is wrong”* (Alan Heisterkamp, Waitt Institute).

## *3: Potential bystanders must feel a sense of responsibility for addressing the problem*

From the research data gathered it is made apparent that a clear aim of the MVP programme is to place a sense of responsibility for intervening in situations that are or have the potential to be violent and employs a method that appeals to young people’s altruism to achieve this. One participant stated that: *“it is about you as an individual being able to appreciate a sense of empathy towards that person being victimised by personalising the issue* (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council). One further respondent stated: *“young people are asked to consider how they would feel and act if the victim was a friend or family members of theirs, or anyone else they might care about”*( Rachel Barr, Youth Worker, Portobello High School) and then act accordingly when a situation arises.

## *4: Potential bystanders must identify an accessible course of action*

When conducting the interviews it was stipulated that a fundamental tenet of the MVP programme is to educate potential bystanders about the options available to them so that they can develop a suitable course of action for intervening. According to one participant, the MVP is designed to: “*Encourage cognitive evaluation of a situation and their role and options within it*” (Alan Hesiterkamp, Waitt Institute). This way, individuals are more likely to develop a degree of self –efficacy for intervening and are therefore less inclined to simply choose to do nothing. This was echoed by another interviewee who stated; “*the MVP works to ensure that young individuals are aware of their options for intervening, **be that Bold***”

##### *5. Potential bystanders must implement that action*

While the fourth step in the process ensures that young individuals involved are well equipped with a sound understanding of the options open to them for intervening, there is a further emphasis on providing individuals with a range of concrete skills that enables them to play out this course of action with confidence. An interviewee stated that the MVP programme aims to “*encourage an assessment of whether the person has the skills to intervene or respond in an active way and hopefully equip them with those skills, for example, through the use of words or body language which are appropriate*” (Alan Hesiterkamp, Waitt Institute).

Consistency with bystander literature:

It is obvious from the data gathered above that the MVP, in order to increase the likelihood young individuals will intervene in a situation that requires the assistance of an empowered bystander the programme adopts a theory of change consisted with the five key steps

illustrated in the bystander literature, in particular Latane and Darley's (1969) model of enacting change.

As was discussed in Chapter One of this paper, the first and second stage to taking the necessary action against violence against women requires *noticing* the troubling situation and then *interpreting* it as problematic (Latané and Darley, 1969). In a cross sectional study on situational barriers to intervening, Burns (2009) found that difficulty in identifying the situation as high risk was a key contributing factor in taking no action. Similarly, Batson (1998) claims that when a situation is identified unambiguously as an emergency, individuals are far more inclined to intervene.

The research data gathered has shown that the MVP programme aims to counteract these barriers to intervening by placing a heavy emphasis on educating young people about what constitutes as violence against women. What is more, in relation to the causes of gendered violence, it has been clearly articulated from the data gathered and from the wider academic literature analysed in Chapter One of this paper that violence against women is fundamentally caused by negative attitudes and beliefs that are in some way learned. By placing an emphasis on education and attitude awareness it is clear that the theory of change adopted is tailored to support the theory of learned behaviour.

The third stage of Latane and Darley's 5-stage model examined in the literature review places an emphasis on *responsibility* for addressing the problem (Casey, et al, 2012). According to the bystander literature, individuals are more likely to intervene in a situation that involves someone who is known to them and less inclined to intervene if the person is a stranger. In a recent survey involving 915 people in England and Wales it was found that while 71 per cent of people agreed they would intervene on behalf of a family member or

friend who was a victim of domestic violence, where the victim was a neighbour, only 39 per cent stipulated they would intervene, believing that it was not their business (responsibility) to do so (Home Office, 2009). As was evident from the research data gathered from the interviewees, the MVP programme aims to build a sense of community responsibility by teaching young people that violence against women and girls is everyone's problem and encouraging them to feel empathy towards victims whether they are indeed a friend or not.

And finally, stage four and five of Latane and Darley's model which involves *identifying* a course of action and then *implementing* that action suggests that potential bystanders have a higher degree of self-efficacy for intervening when they are confident they have the skills to do so. In a study conducted by Huston (1981) it was found that where individuals had some form of training, such as self-defence and first aid they were more inclined to feel confident in their own ability and therefore more likely to intervene in a situation that requires an empowered bystander. As was evident from research gathered from the interviewees, the MVP is designed to give young people the chance to develop a host of skills, including practicing being an empowered bystander in order to increase their sense of efficacy at using those skills.

### Summary of findings

It is apparent from the research data gathered that there is indeed a clear and articulated theory of change adopted by the MVP programme and that the theory of change is consistent with the academic literature on the topic. Gender-based violence it would seem is not caused by any one single dominant underlying factor; rather there are several complex and



sometimes overlapping factors involved and this is clearly reflected in the bystander model of prevention which provides a framework that is based on tackling these multiple causes. Thus, in conclusion of Research Question One it is apparent that the MVP programme has strong theoretical groundings as an intervention method aimed at tackling violence against women.

### **3.1 Research Question Two: Has the Deployment of the MVP in Scotland Remained Faithful to the Original Design?**

The overall aim of this research question is to establish whether or not the Mentors in Violence Prevention Programme as it has been implemented to date in the Scottish high school setting has stayed true to the original model. As such this required a number of key themes to be addressed that were specifically targeted at those interview respondents who were in recipient of the Scottish MVP training.

Understanding of theory of change:

#### Lack of knowledge of gendered violence

Data showed that those who had been through the training felt that there was not enough emphasis on the problem of gendered violence. It was stated by some interviewees that while they understood the causes of violence against women, they were not confident that the training had equipped them with the skills to deliver material on the issue to a wider audience. *“A weakness of the MVP training is that there was not enough discussion of the*

*background to the problem and it became apparent that the students were not confident that they would be able to answer questions on the issue”* (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council).

However, there some disparity in the data collected on this issue. One interviewee stated that the training was “*spot on*” and that he “*came away from the training feeling more confident in his knowledge*” (Shaun Cuavin, Shell Twilight Basketball Manager). Another person described the training as “*excellent*” (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council) and another as “*the best training I have been on*” (Rachel Barr, Youth Worker Portobello High School).

It is clear that there is a significant difference in opinion on the success and usefulness of the training programme. From the data it appeared that the existing knowledge and skills of those taking part in the training influenced the extent to which they were confident in their ability to go on and deliver the material. In order for the training process to be more effective for all those who take part, it should perhaps take into account the previous experience of those who are being trained and be tailored to their level of understanding.

#### Lack of understanding of bystander approach

Although opinion on the gendered violence aspects of the training was divided, it was apparent from all the interviewees involved with implementing MVP in the schools that there was a lack of understanding of the key bystander principles. It was stated by a number of people that MVP aimed to tackle the issue through changing attitudes with one teacher stating that it was about “*planting a seed of understanding and changing belief systems*” (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School). Another interviewee stated that the programme was

designed to “*challenge myths and change negative attitudes*” (Allison Fanning, St. Stephens High School).

This suggests that while the theory of change discussed in Research Question One is clear and has a strong basis in the literature, it has not necessarily been understood by those who have not been involved in designing the project but are expected to implement it. It is possible that the bystander principles which are so important to the MVP programme may be lost and that it will therefore not be effective.

### Practical Issues:

#### Student Mentors

A key principle behind the MVP programme is that it makes use of young people who model the desired behaviour and challenge negative attitudes in order to encourage their peers to adopt the same approach. In order to ensure that those selected have the most influence over others, MVP utilises a “popular opinion leader” approach and aims to select the students and young people who are believed to be the most popular within their school. Within the American context these students are usually athletes who are looked up to and admired by young students (Katz, 2005).

Within the Scottish context, there has been an attempt to replicate this approach. One interviewee stated that they had tried to select the young people who “*had the most street cred, or credibility amongst their peers*” (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council). It was further stated that there was an attempt to select mentors who “*could engage with a range of pupils*” (Alison Fanning, St. Stephens High School).

However, in order to recruit these mentors, students were asked to volunteer and the data highlighted that there was a range of responses which suggests that the extent to which those finally selected are able to act as “popular opinion leaders” may vary. In both schools in the Inverclyde region, the majority of senior pupils volunteered and they were therefore able to select those who were most suitable. In contrast, in Portobello High School in Edinburgh, the response was more limited and in fact it was stated that while they initially had a good response, after the first training session they only had one male volunteer. It is therefore less likely that they would be able to ensure that those acting as mentors had the necessary positive influence over younger pupils. There is also a question as to whether the staff selecting the mentors are able to accurately identify the pupils who are likely to be the most effective role models in terms of their popularity and ability to influence younger students.

Another practical issue which was highlighted in the interview data related to retaining both staff and pupils who had been trained. In one school it was stated that the students selected for training were in their sixth year and would be moving on a relatively short time after becoming involved with the programme. This may impact on the effectiveness of MVP in that mentors may just be beginning to engage with younger pupils when they are replaced by the next year group. It may also limit the cost-effectiveness of the programme if the benefits of the training are limited to a few terms.

One school in Edinburgh however, chose to select mentors from fourth and fifth year in order to retain them for a longer period and allow them to complete the training and build a relationship with younger pupils over a longer period of time. This may be a more effective approach.

It is important therefore that particular attention is paid to the selection of peer mentors in order to ensure that the “popular opinion leaders” approach which is integral to the MVP programme is continued in the Scottish context in order to ensure that the mentors are able to effectively engage with younger pupils.

### Existing Peer Mentoring Programmes

It was stated by a number of interviewees that there were existing peer mentoring programmes in place within the schools and that MVP was incorporated into those - “*We included it in our Sports Leadership Programme*” (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School). This was highlighted as it was stated that the use of older students as mentors for younger ones is not a new idea and was therefore relatively easy to incorporate. However, there is a concern that by utilising an existing programme or structure, the unique aspects of MVP may be missed or lost. This is particularly relevant where there has not been a full understanding of the bystander principles behind the project and there is a risk that the theory of change will become diluted.

### Contextual issues

In addition to the practical issues of implementation discussed above, there are a number of contextual and institutional issues which must also be considered.

#### School curriculum

It was stated that in order for the programme to be effectively implemented into schools, it has to comply with the general curriculum. Within the Scottish context this is the Curriculum

for Excellence. It was stated by one interviewee that it was essential that the programme was consistent with the curriculum – “*you need that link to engage with the schools*” (Graham Goulden, VRU). It was identified that the MVP programme was consistent with the Health and Wellbeing curricular area (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School) which promotes healthy attitudes and relationships (Ellis, et al, 2008) and is therefore easily incorporated.

It was highlighted in Chapter One that any intervention must be embedded in the curriculum in order to be effective. The data highlighted that this is achieved through incorporating the delivery of the MVP material into Personal and Social Education classes as well as in a more informal manner through art projects and drama shows (Graham Goulden, VRU). In this way it is hoped that the principles of MVP will become embedded and contribute to a culture of non-tolerance.

#### Potential Challenges:

##### Financial issues

One of the key challenges highlighted in the interview data gathered related to the potential difficulty with gaining and maintaining funding for the project. It was stated by a number of people that the project was expensive - particularly in terms of bringing those involved with MVP in America over to carry out the initial training (Gavin Crosby, Edinburgh City Council). It was further stated that in the current economic climate it may be difficult to secure on-going funding for the programme.

However, Graham Goulden at the VRU highlighted that although the initial training process is expensive, once it becomes established and those who have been involved with the Scottish project are confident in their ability to deliver the training, the costs will be significantly

reduced. Furthermore, after a certain number of years it is believed that MVP will become self-sustaining with those who have been trained passing on their skills and knowledge to the next generation of trainers. The same interviewee stated that “*we have secured funding from both the Equalities department and Community Safety department for the programme*” (Graham Goulden, VRU) which suggests that there are a number of sources for potential funding.

### Maintaining enthusiasm

A further challenge highlighted in the interview data was that of maintaining enthusiasm amongst the staff involved. It was stated by a number of people that there was disparity in the extent to which staff were supportive of the programme with some believing that it was an excellent initiative and others suggesting that it did not bring anything new. – “*Some staff felt that we are already doing the things covered in the training*” (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School). It was stated that following the initial training some members of staff felt that they were not suited to the project and withdrew (Sharon Sale, Inverclyde Council). This is significant as it may slow down the implementation process if replacement staff have to be found and trained.

It was suggested that one way of mitigating this problem was to provide additional details on the aims and methods adopted by MVP before staff signed up the programme. If there is a better understanding of the project amongst those who agree to take part, they are less likely to be disappointed or feel misled and withdraw.

Time Commitment:

It was stated that there were concerns about the amount of time which had to be committed to the MVP programme and training by both staff and pupils. It was felt by staff that there was an underestimation of the amount of time which had to be spent on the programme and that the additional work was difficult to incorporate into their schedules and this limited enthusiasm.

However, it was recognised that it was necessary for the initial training process to be fairly intensive but that once the project was running in the school, the majority of the work would be conducted by the peer mentors and the staff would have more of a supporting role.

While this may reduce the pressure on staff to find time for MVP, there was also a concern about pupils, particularly those in fifth and sixth year, missing time in class when they have important exams approaching – *“The training has been difficult as pupils are losing study days”* (Kevin Kelly, Port Glasgow High School). This was something which was raised by several interviewees. However, it was argued that once the initial training was completed, MVP would be delivered through one session every four weeks in order to allow time for reflection and *“not to bombard people”* (Alison Fanning, St. Stephen High School) with information and therefore the amount of time out of class was relatively limited.

It was further stated that while it is true that pupils who are out of class to deliver MVP will miss out on important study time, the skills and knowledge that they will develop through being part of the project are invaluable and can be continued throughout their lives (Alan Hesiterkamp, Waitt Institute).

Summary of Research Question Two:



It was apparent therefore that a number of practical and contextual issues were raised throughout the course of this research study. However, from the discussion above it is clear that the majority of them are relatively minor and with small changes could be easily addressed. However, the key concern which has been raised is the lack of understanding of the key principles behind the project. While some interviewees were very clear in their understanding and knowledge of the problem of gendered violence, this was not apparent in all cases. Perhaps more significantly, there was little or no discussion by any of the staff involved of the bystander principles or steps adopted and this suggests that while the theory of change highlighted in Research Question One is strong, it has not been clearly communicated to those who are now implementing and running the project within the schools.

## Conclusion

The first aim of this research project was to evaluate where or not there exists a strong theoretical basis underpinning the Mentors in Violence Prevention programme. In order to achieve this it was therefore necessary to interrogate the wider academic literature on the topic as the success of any intervention method aimed at tackling gender-based violence relies heavily upon that theory of change being based on a sound and accurate theoretical understanding of the problem. One further aim of this research project was to consider whether or not the MVP programme as it has been implemented within the high school setting in Scotland has stayed faithful to the original North American design, as such it was important to evaluate whether the programme is indeed being applied as intended

By undertaking a critical examination of the relevant academic literature it has become apparent that the problem of men's violence against women is the result of a complex interplay of personal, situational and sociocultural factors which help create violence-supportive attitudes and beliefs that condone this type of abuse and as such efforts to end violence against women remains a complex and challenging task that cannot be expected to happen overnight. However, it is clear from the data gathered from a number of those interviewees who took part in this research project that the theory of change embodied within the MVP programme recognises these multiple causes highlighted by the wider academic literature and therefore has a strong theoretical basis as a method of intervention.

While it is a daunting and difficult task for any intervention method to tackle changes in attitudes and beliefs that are deeply ingrained at multiple levels of the social order, by

incorporating a bystander focused approach that centres on altering these societal norms and traditional gender role beliefs then the MVP programme has the unique potential to create a cultural environment that is non-tolerant to violence. What is more, by adopting a theory of change that aims to create large attitudinal changes, the MVP programme is further consistent with current Scottish Government policy where it is continually emphasised in the various publications on the issue that early intervention through education is the only way to eradicate the problem of gender-based violence.

While it has been established that there is indeed a clear theory of change that is consistent with both current government policy as well as the wider academic literature on the issue, when gathering data from those research respondents who were recipients of the MVP training in Scotland, it was evident that there was very little or no understanding of the main principles behind the bystander approach to prevention. While there are a number of practical and contextual issues at play these are relatively small and are not expected to impact negatively on the success of the replicated design. However, if a clear understanding and knowledge of the problem of gender-based violence is not communicated to all of those individuals involved in the implementation of MVP programme in Scotland (which is clearly the case from the data gathered) then there is the real danger of the bystander principles being diluted. As such, this may have serious consequences for the overall effectiveness of the programme.

However, in conclusion, while it is not possible to know at this early stage of implementation on whether or not the MVP programme will result in any long term attitudinal change, the fact that the theory of change embedded within the programme is consistent with the wider academic literature on the topic then there is a very real possibility that this particular programme can succeed over others at tackling the issue of violence against women. Importantly however, while the MVP programme has strong theoretical groundings as a

method of intervention, in order for it to be adapted in Scotland accordingly, then minor changes must be addressed if the programme is to reach its full potential.

## **Bibliography**

Banyard, V. Moynihan, M and Plante, G. (2004). Through Bystander Education: An Experimental Evaluation: *Journal of Community Psychology* Vol 35(4) 463-481.

Berkowitz, A (2002). *RESPONSE ABILITY: A Complete Guide to Bystander Intervention*. Chicago, Beck & Company

Bottoms, A. *The relationship between theory and empirical observations in criminology* in King and Wincup (2007) *Doing Research on Crime and Justice* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed) Oxford, Oxford University Press

Bryman, A. (2004) *Social Research Methods* (Second edition). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Burman, M and Cartmel, F (2005) *Young People's Attitudes Towards Gendered Violence*, Edinburgh: NHS Scotland

Casey, A. and Ohler, K. (2011). Being a Positive Bystander: Male Anti-violence Allies' Experiences of "Stepping Upp", *J Interpers Violence*; Vol. 27(1): 62-83

Connell, R (1987) *Gender and Power*, Cambridge: Polity Press in association with Blackwell

Council of Europe (2010) *Domestic Violence against Women Report*, TNS Opinion & Social, Brussels: Belgium

Cunningham, A. Jaffe, P. Baker, L. Dick, T. Malla, S. Mazaheri, N. Poisson, S. ( 1998). *Theory-Derived Explanation of Male Violence Against Female Partners: Literature Update and Related Implications for Treatment and Evaluation*. London Family Court Clinic

Dobash, R. Dobash. (1979) *Violence against wives: A case against the patriarchy*. New York: Free Press.

*Domestic Violence: Findings from The 2000 Scottish Crime Survey* (2002) Scottish Executive

Accessed: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2002/05/14413/1566> on 12/07/12

Dusenbury, L. Falco, M. Lake, A. Brannigan, R. and Bosworth, K. (1997) Nine Critical Elements of Promising Violence Prevention Programs', *Journal of School Health*, Vol. 67 (10) 409-414

Egeland, B. (1993) *A history of abuse is a major risk factor for abusing the next generation* in R. J. Gelles and D. R. Loseke (eds) *Current controversies on family violence*. London: Sage.

Ellis, J (2004) *Preventing Violence Against Women and Girls. A Study of Educational Programmes for Children and Young People*, London: WOMANKIND Worldwide

Ellis, J. (2008) *Primary Prevention of Domestic Abuse Through Education* in Humphreys, C. Houghton, C. and Ellis, J (2008) *Literature Review: Better Outcomes for Children and Young People Experiencing Domestic Abuse – Directions for Good Practice*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Flood, M. (2011) Involving Men in Efforts to End Violence Against Women, *Men and Masculinities*, Vol 14(3) 358-377

Flood, M. (2001) Engaging Men in Ending Men's Violence Against Women, *Expanding Our Horizons Conference, Sydney*, 1-17

Foshee, V, Bauman, K, Arriaga, X, Helms, R, Koch, G and Linder, G (1998) An Evaluation of Safe Dates, an Adolescent Dating Violence Prevention Program, *American Journal of Public Health*, Vol. 88 (1) 45-50

Gender Equality Duty (GED) Scotland 2007

Gelles, R.J (1972) *The Violent Home: A Study of Physical Aggression Between Husbands and Wives*. California, Sage Publications

Glaser, B. & Strauss, A., (1967) *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*, Chicago, Aldine Publishing Company

Hester, M. and Westmarland, N. (2005) *Tackling Domestic Violence: Effective Interventions and Approaches*, Home Office Research Study 290, London: Home Office

Humphreys, C. and Stanley, N. (2006) *Domestic Violence and Child Protection. Direction for Good Practice*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers

Hasselt, V. Morrisson, L. Bellack, S. Hersen, M. (1988) *Handbook of Family Violence*: London: Plenum Press

Johnson, H. (1996) *Dangerous Domains: Violence Against Women in Canada*. Toronto: Nelson

Katz, J. (2006) *The Macho Paradox: Why Some Men Hurt Women and How All Men Can Help*. Sourcebook, Incs: Illinois

Katz, J. Heisterkamp, A. Fleming, M. (2011) The social justice roots of the mentors in violence prevention model and its application in a high school setting, *Violence Against Women* 17:684–702

Kelly, P. and Kelly, L. (2007) Shadow Thematic Report: For the Committee on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women: *CEDAW Thematic Shadow Report on Violence Against Women in the UK*

Kaufman, J. and Zigler, E. (1987), Do abused children become abusive parents? *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry* 57: 186-192

Latane, B., & Darley, J. Bystander (1969) “Apathy”, *American Scientist*, 57:244-268.

.

Mears, D. (2003). Research And Interventions To Reduce Domestic Violence Revictimization. *Journal of Trauma, Violence & Abuse*, Vol 4(2) 127-147

Matczak, A., Hatzidimitriadou, E., and Lindsay, J. (2011). *Review of Domestic Violence policies in England and Wales*. London: Kingston University and St George's, University of London.

Papadopoulos, L. (2010) *Sexualisation of Young People Review*, Home Office, Accessed: [http://www.wrc.org.uk/includes/documents/cm\\_docs/2010/s/sexualisationyoungpeople.pdf](http://www.wrc.org.uk/includes/documents/cm_docs/2010/s/sexualisationyoungpeople.pdf) on 21/07/12

Powell, A. (2011), Review of Bystander Approaches in Support of Preventing Violence Against Women. *School of Social Sciences, La Trobe University*. Victoria health Promotion Foundation

Schewe, P.A. (2002). *Guidelines for developing rape prevention and risk reduction interventions* in Schewe, P. (Ed.) *Preventing violence in relationships* (107-136). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association

Scottish Executive (2003) *Preventing Domestic Abuse A National Strategy*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive. Available <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/47176/0025563.pdf> Accessed 02.03.07

Scottish Executive (2008) *The National Domestic Abuse Delivery Plan for Children and Young People* Scottish, Accessed: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/228073/0061720.pdf> on 19/07/12

Scottish Government, (2011) *The National Domestic Abuse Delivery Plan for Children and Young People*

Accessed: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2008/06/17115558/0> on 15/07/12

Scottish Government and CoSLA, (2010) *Safer Lives: Changed Lives - A Shared Approach to Tackling Violence Against Women in Scotland* Edinburgh, Scottish Government

Scottish Partnership on Domestic Abuse, (2000) *National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland* Edinburgh

Accessed: <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/47176/0025563.pdf> on 21/07/12

Straus, M. A. (1990). *Measuring Intrafamily Conflict and Violence: The Conflict Tactic (CT) Scales* in Straus, M. A and Gelles, R. J (Eds.), *Physical Violence in American Families* 29-47. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Books.

Sugar Magazine, 23<sup>rd</sup> May (2006) cited in Sexualisation of Young People Review, (2010) Papadopoulos, L. London, Home Office Accessed: [http://www.wrc.org.uk/includes/documents/cm\\_docs/2010/s/sexualisationyoungpeople.pdf](http://www.wrc.org.uk/includes/documents/cm_docs/2010/s/sexualisationyoungpeople.pdf) on 30/07/12



Totten, M. (2003). Girlfriend Abuse as a Form of Masculinity Construction among Violent, Marginal Male Youth: *Men and Masculinities* Vol 6 (1) 70-92

Walby, S. (2004) *Five times higher – the extent of domestic violence* Safe Summer pp.10-12

Walby, S. and Allen, J. (2004) *Domestic violence, sexual assault and stalking: Findings from the British Crime Survey*, Home Office Research, Development and Statistics Directorate

World Health Organization/London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, (2010) *Preventing intimate partner and sexual violence against women: taking action and generating evidence*. Geneva, World Health Organisation, Accessed: [http://www.who.int/violence\\_injury\\_prevention/publications/violence/9789241564007\\_eng.pdf](http://www.who.int/violence_injury_prevention/publications/violence/9789241564007_eng.pdf) on 30/07/12

Zero Tolerance/YWCA Scotland, (2012) *Under Pressure: Preventing Teen Abuse and Exploitation*, Edinburgh, The Zero Tolerance Charitable Trust, Accessed: <http://www.ywcascotland.org/uploads/publications/UnderPressureReport.pdf> on 23/07/12

## Appendix A: Participant Information Sheet



### Research Title: **Mentors in Violence Prevention: An Evaluation of the Implementation of the Bystander Focused Approach to Tackling Gendered Violence**

You are being invited to take part in a research study. Before you decide whether or not to take part, it is important for you to understand why the research is being done and what it will involve. Please take time to read the following information carefully.

I am working on a postgraduate dissertation entitled “Mentors in Violence Prevention: An Evaluation of the Potential Impact of a Bystander Based Approach to Tackling Gendered Violence” in the School of Social and Political Sciences at the University of Glasgow. My aim is to identify whether the bystander approach to tackling gender-based violence has proven to be a way of addressing attitudes, behaviours and stereotypes which contribute to violence. The information that I get will be used to help me to form conclusions on the viability of the Mentors in Violence Prevention Project as a method of reducing the incidence of gendered violence

It is your choice whether or not to take part in the research. If you do decide to participate, you will be given this information sheet to keep and be asked to sign a consent form. If you decide to take part you can withdraw at any time and you do not need to give a reason.

The interview will take a maximum of 1 hour. I would like to make an audio recording with your permission. What you say to me will be used only in my student dissertation. I would also like for you to be named in my dissertation. The project has been approved by the School of Social and Political Sciences Research Ethics Forum at the University of Glasgow.

If you have any questions about the research or what is involved, please contact me at [0604093m@student.gla.ac.uk](mailto:0604093m@student.gla.ac.uk). You can also contact my supervisor who is Jon Bannister and can be contacted at [Jonathan.Bannister@glasgow.ac.uk](mailto:Jonathan.Bannister@glasgow.ac.uk).

If you would like to raise any concerns about how any aspect of this research has been conducted, please contact the School Ethics Forum convenor.

Thank you for taking the time to read this information sheet.

**Appendix B: SAMPLE PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM**



**Research Title: Mentors in Violence Prevention: An Evaluation of the Implementation of the Bystander-Focused Approach to Tackling Gendered Violence**

Principal researchers:

Carrie Macdonald - [0604093M@student.gla.ac.uk](mailto:0604093M@student.gla.ac.uk)

Gillian Smart – 0602419s@student.gla.ac.uk

Jon Bannister – Jonathan.Bannister@glasgow.ac.uk

I confirm that I have read and understood the information sheet about this study and have had the opportunity to ask questions about it.

I understand that my participation in the interview is entirely voluntary, and that I can withdraw from the study at any time, without having to give a reason. I understand that my participation or non-participation in the study will not lead to any penalty.

I agree to the interview being audio recorded. I also agree to be named within the body of the final dissertation and to have direct quotes attributed to me.

I agree to participate in this interview.

Name / signature:

Date:

